



Governing Body

309th Session, Geneva, November 2010

GB.309/PFA/5/2

Programme, Financial and Administrative Committee

PFA

FOR DECISION

FIFTH ITEM ON THE AGENDA

Evaluations

Independent evaluation of the ILO Country Programme for the United Republic of Tanzania: 2004–10

Overview

Issues covered

This report summarizes the findings, conclusions, lessons learned and recommendations from the above evaluation. The final section contains the Office response and comments from the tripartite constituents of the United Republic of Tanzania, both on the mainland and in Zanzibar.

Policy implications

None.

Financial implications

Full implementation of all the recommendations would have programme and budget implications, which are not quantified in this paper.

Action/Decision required

Paragraph 40.

References to other Governing Body documents and ILO instruments

None.

Introduction

1. This report presents analyses, findings and recommendations of the independent evaluation of the ILO's Country Programme for the United Republic of Tanzania, which took place in March–April 2010. The period under review included the 2004–05 Country Programmes and the Decent Work Country Programme for 2006–10. The evaluation also reviewed the ILO's participation in the United Nations Delivering as One Pilot Programme in the United Republic of Tanzania (Joint Programme 1: Wealth Creation, Employment and Economic Empowerment (JP1), for which the ILO is the managing agent).
2. The evaluation focuses on the ILO's strategic positioning in the country; its approach to setting the priorities for its country strategy; and the composition, implementation and organizational support received from regional and headquarters offices. The evaluation team used primarily qualitative methods of analysis of the implementation and results of the Country Programme.
3. A team consisting of an independent external evaluator, a senior evaluation officer from the Evaluation Unit and an in-country evaluation coordinator conducted the evaluation. Five core evaluative criteria guided the analysis: (i) relevance to the development challenges and priorities of the national tripartite constituents; (ii) coherence among the different projects supporting programme objectives; (iii) efficiency in the management of the programme implementation; (iv) effectiveness of the programme as a whole; and (v) sustainability of results.
4. The evaluation reviewed programme and project documentation and other related literature, interviewed 47 stakeholders and collected direct information from constituents and beneficiary groups such as community-based cooperatives and the Tanzania Youth Coalition. The independent evaluator met with staff at the Regional Office in Addis Ababa and distributed over 50 questionnaires to ILO staff at headquarters, regional, and country offices.

Country programming in United Republic of Tanzania mainland and Zanzibar

5. ILO support throughout the period under review addressed each of the four pillars of the ILO's Decent Work Agenda. The Decent Work Country Programme for the United Republic of Tanzania was signed in August 2006 by tripartite constituents and incorporated ongoing activities from the 2004–05 Country Programme, organized under three main priorities:
 - (i) poverty reduction through the creation of decent work opportunities with a focus on young men and women;
 - (ii) incidence of child labour and its worst forms reduced; and
 - (iii) socio-economic impact of HIV/AIDS in the workplace mitigated.
6. In addition to these priorities, the Decent Work Country Programme includes two cross-cutting priorities: strengthening the social dimensions of regional integration in East Africa, and expanding the influence of the Ministry of Labour, Employment and Youth Development (MLEYD) and the social partners through tripartism and social dialogue.

7. The ILO has invested significant resources in the implementation of this Country Programme. During the period 2005 through June 2010, the total expenditures made by the ILO Office in Dar es Salaam amounted to US\$17,807,165 (rounded to the nearest dollar). This included US\$2,151,325 of regular budget funds, which include staff, non-staff and regular budget technical cooperation funds. In addition, the Office allocated US\$691,858 from the Regular Budget Supplementary Account for activities supporting the implementation of the Decent Work Country Programme, and US\$731,690 from the programme support income account. Extra-budgetary technical cooperation included 22 projects, amounting to US\$14,232,292 of direct expenditure in the United Republic of Tanzania. In addition, indirect support and outputs were provided throughout the period through activities in global, interregional and regional projects undertaken by the ILO.
8. Blending new and ongoing projects into a new programme posed challenges to the programme design process. However, the Decent Work Country Programme actually creates a better conceptual niche for some projects and activities that would otherwise be confined to a unidimensional description. For example, the Cooperative Facility for Africa (CoopAfrica), funded by the United Kingdom Department for International Development, addresses more than one country priority, ultimately serving the priority of creating jobs for women, men and youth through strengthening the effectiveness of cooperatives and similar associations.

Findings

9. The social partners expressed appreciation for the work of the ILO in the United Republic of Tanzania, emphasizing that its contributions had led to the drafting and implementation of the labour laws ensuring decent work for all. The findings of the evaluation validate these important contributions and identify issues that need further attention as the ILO prepares a second Decent Work Country Programme.

ILO programme implementation

10. With the signing of the Decent Work Country Programme in 2006, the ILO's support to the Tanzanian mainland and to Zanzibar began a process of consolidation within a framework that treats projects and other activities within broad strategic lines, integrating individual projects into a wider identity relating to country priorities. The evaluation found that although all the Country Programme activities find a place under each of the four strategic objectives of the Decent Work Agenda, for the most part their implementation was discrete with very little sense of complementarities or of a greater goal.
11. Some of the key activities that have been organized under each Decent Work Country Programme priority are listed below:
 - **Priority 1: Poverty reduction through the creation of decent work opportunities with a focus on young men and women.** The ILO supported the development of the National Employment Policy and Programme through a technical cooperation project and direct technical assistance to the MLEYD. The main outcomes of this support were the National Employment Policy and Strategy, the National Youth Employment Action Plan, and the national employment creation programmes. Project activities also supported Zanzibar in the formulation of the National Employment Policy.
 - **Priority 2: Incidence of child labour and its worst forms reduced.** The United Republic of Tanzania has been participating in the International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) since 1994. It was among the first countries

worldwide to implement an IPEC time-bound programme, which aimed at achieving effective and sustainable elimination of the worst forms of child labour within the framework of the Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182). A key achievement of this programme was the drafting and implementation of the National Action Plan for the Elimination of Child Labour. The country also benefited from the ILO's project on skills training strategies to combat the worst forms of child labour, aimed at reducing the incidence of child labour in the urban informal economy through non-formal low-cost skills training and promoting access to services that ensure decent work.

- **Priority 3: Socio-economic impact of HIV/AIDS in the workplace mitigated.** The ILO's Country Programme has supported the development and implementation of appropriate policies on gender equality, HIV/AIDS prevention and anti-discrimination policies in the workplace. It has also provided various capacity-building activities and direct technical advice services such as the piloting of results from studies and good practices for furthering the agenda of the global campaign on social security and coverage.

12. The Country Programme included various capacity-building activities aimed at strengthening the social dimensions of regional integration in East Africa. The strengthening of tripartism and social dialogue was a key objective of the Strengthening Labour Relations in East Africa (SLAREA) project funded by the United States Department of Labor. The project was instrumental in bringing about labour law reform.

Quality of the Decent Work Country Programme

13. The ILO Office in Dar es Salaam has established strong partnerships with tripartite constituents on both the Tanzanian mainland and Zanzibar in the development of the legal and political framework required for the implementation of the Decent Work Agenda.
14. The Decent Work Country Programme 2006–10 came in the wake of a trail of individual projects that responded to the strategic objectives established for the 2004–05 biennium. These projects led the way towards a significant strategic transition and clarified better linkages between their outputs and the priorities and outcomes of the Decent Work Country Programme.

Relevance

15. The three specific priorities and the two cross-cutting priorities of the Programme were approved by tripartite constituents. They are quite relevant and well-aligned to the National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty (MKUKUTA), the Zanzibar Strategy for Growth and the Reduction of Poverty (MKUZA), the United Nations Development Assistance Framework and the Decent Work Agenda for Africa, contributing to the various Delivering as One Pilot Programme components.

Cohherence

16. It is evident that there has been an improvement in the logical linkages among the projects within the current Decent Work Country Programme and the other Delivering as One joint programmes. Progress towards better alignment with outside external partners is also evident. ILO participation in the Delivering as One Pilot Programme has helped it to better align with the Government's Joint Assistance Strategy for Tanzania (JAST) objectives to

strengthen government core processes for planning, budgeting and monitoring through the Delivering as One Pilot Programme.

Efficiency

17. The management of JP1 presented difficulties due in part to the ILO's administrative systems and programming capacities, which were challenged while learning to work effectively with other UN agencies. The UN agencies in the United Republic of Tanzania are increasingly coordinating their efforts through working group meetings to respond to the JAST objectives. The ILO has also issued an Office Procedure on the implementation of the Harmonized Approach to Cash Transfers (HACT) outlining the use of the procedure by ILO external offices.¹ This move towards better alignment would likely boost the low performance ratings of JP1 that are due to slow delivery against workplan targets, and the lack of (process) performance indicators relating to aid effectiveness.

Effectiveness

18. The Government of the United Republic of Tanzania views the ILO as a strong partner and appreciates the assistance that the Organization has provided. Major policies and laws drafted with the support of the ILO have included the Employment and Labour Relations Act, 2004, the Labour Institutions Act, 2004, the Workmen's Compensation Act, 2008, and the Social Security (Regulatory Authority) Act, 2008.
19. The ILO's participation in Delivering as One joint programmes has expanded its range of stakeholders beyond the tripartite constituents. For example, through its role in JP2: Maternal and Newborn Mortality Reduction, and JP3: Joint Programme on HIV and AIDS in Tanzania, the ILO increased its coordination with the Ministry of Health. ILO social partners are now able to collaborate with other ministries beyond the MLEYD and other UN agencies and civil society actors.

Sustainability

20. Regarding sustainability of Decent Work Country Programme outcomes, the ILO's participation in joint programmes' steering committees and technical working groups supporting implementation of the Delivering as One Pilot Programme represent good practice for the implementation of its Programme. This, while not assuring sustainability of activities after the end of projects, enhances such prospects as well as granting greater ownership to national stakeholders.

Challenges

21. The evaluation found that the Country Programme faces coherence and efficiency challenges that need to be addressed in order to increase effectiveness and maintain the relevance of future country programmes, and strengthen the ILO's role as a key player in the One UN Programme. These challenges also present learning opportunities for the ILO Office in the United Republic of Tanzania and for the Organization as a whole.
22. The evaluation team conducted an evaluability assessment, which revealed that few of the indicators in the Decent Work Country Programme and contributing projects were specific,

¹ ILO: *Implementation of the Harmonized Approach to Cash Transfers*, Office Procedure, IGDS No. 161 (Version 1), 20 May 2010.

measurable or time-bound, or had any means of verification. Guidance on the elaboration of such programmes was incomplete at the time of elaboration of the Tanzanian programme and did not require a results framework; nor did the *Decent Work Country Programme Guidebook* or the *Results-Based Management Guidebook* published in 2008, two years after the start of the Programme.

23. This lack of clear guidance coupled with a lack of capacity in the construction of logical frameworks, seems to be at the root of many of the challenges found by the evaluation team. The Decent Work Country Programme and most of the projects do not include a set of medium-term performance indicators or sound monitoring and evaluation plans. It seems that the country office's programming unit is overstretched and needs to strengthen its capacity to establish systematic and consultative monitoring and evaluation practices that involve constituents, in order to translate its commitment into tangible outcomes.
24. Financial and programme implementation information is scattered and often incomplete, and needs to be better organized to provide reliable inputs for management decisions. Moreover, implementation reports do not reflect findings from inspection visits, nor did Country Programme reviews take place during the period covered by this evaluation.
25. As the ILO Country Programme moves away from project implementation activities towards policy support activities, it needs to better prioritize and coordinate its programme activities with other international development partners to complement resources and avoid duplication of effort.

Conclusions

26. The relevance of the Country Programme has evolved and matured over the six-year period, advancing from a portfolio that consisted mainly of project implementation to one of relevant policy support. Maintaining, consolidating and sustaining ILO achievements in the United Republic of Tanzania will call for more effective monitoring and evaluation, and better prioritization of existing resources. All constituents affirm the importance and relevance of the ILO's Country Programme, especially its tripartite approach towards realizing fundamental principles and rights at work that culminated in the Decent Work Country Programme for the Tanzanian mainland and Zanzibar.
27. The first conclusion arising from this evaluation is that the ILO needs to redirect its effort in the United Republic of Tanzania to identify the right mix of project implementation and policy support activities. The best way to achieve this is to design and manage its programme and projects with this in mind. The use of a results framework (logical framework) would lead to better planning and monitoring.
28. The second conclusion is that the ILO needs to reconsider its level of ambition, taking into account its comparative advantage, the responsibilities of an ILO office and a realistic level of funding support. A carefully planned country strategy and business plan that targets time and results can help accomplish this.
29. The achievement of the Decent Work Country Programme outcomes will depend on whether the challenges hindering its effective and efficient implementation are addressed. This would require conducting more comprehensive needs assessments for capacity building of constituents' institutions and implementation partner organizations, and revamping current monitoring and evaluation activities and portfolio reviews. Institutional, technical, financial and administrative viability should be a key element of this analysis, especially in the context of the JAST and the HACT.

30. The ILO's participation in Delivering as One joint programmes provides opportunities for harmonization of administrative practices, establishing synergies among the Decent Work Country Programme projects and closer coordination with other development partners to avoid duplication and optimize complementarities. The hazards of delivering development outcomes in an uncoordinated environment in which there is a potential for working at cross-purposes pose major challenges for the ILO's risk management, onward planning and strategic placement in the country.

Recommendations

31. The following recommendations aim to maintain past achievements by strengthening the Country Programme's efficiency and effectiveness:
- **Recommendation 1:** At the onset of the next Decent Work Country Programme, the ILO Office in Dar es Salaam should emphasize the importance of strategic selection of priorities and outcomes in its dialogue with national tripartite constituents to strengthen the policy and legal frameworks needed for implementing the Decent Work Agenda.
 - **Recommendation 2:** The ILO Office in Dar es Salaam should prioritize the use of existing resources to support the design of the next Decent Work Country Programme, earmarking resources to conduct proper needs assessments to identify priorities and outcomes prior to engaging national constituents in the Tanzanian mainland and Zanzibar.
 - **Recommendation 3:** The Regional Office and the ILO Office in Dar es Salaam, in collaboration with the Human Resources Development Department, should place special emphasis on developing staff capacity on programme design and on the development and use of logical frameworks. Revisions of the logical (results) framework should be a required programme implementation activity, conducted at least every two years. Constituents should participate in the design and monitoring of the results framework.
 - **Recommendation 4:** As the ILO begins the design phase of second-generation Decent Work Country Programmes, country offices such as the one in Dar es Salaam would benefit from a revised version of the *Decent Work Country Programme Guidebook*. This Guidebook should establish a minimum programming standard and establish clear accountabilities for the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of Decent Work Country Programmes.
 - **Recommendation 5:** The ILO should identify adequate resourcing for the Decent Work Technical Support Team as part of the regional outcome-based work planning. Needed support was not always available to the Country Programme due to funding constraints.
 - **Recommendation 6:** To ensure access to expertise needed for its policy-level work, the ILO Office in Dar es Salaam should identify complementarities and synergies among the different projects of the Country Programme and tap into regional and subregional initiatives to fill any resource gaps.
 - **Recommendation 7:** The Regional Office and the ILO Office in Dar es Salaam should conduct formal cyclical Country Programme reviews that include technical and financial assessments of Decent Work Country Programme implementation.

- **Recommendation 8:** The ILO Office in Dar es Salaam should define a clear and evaluable implementation strategy for the Decent Work Country Programme. This strategy should include an action plan for strengthening strategic alliances with other ministries and development partners. This would enhance coherence among projects and help define project objectives, implementation arrangements, monitoring and evaluation within the context of the Programme outcomes.
- **Recommendation 9:** The ILO Office in Dar es Salaam needs to improve its internal monitoring and evaluation system in order to be able to track implementation progress and report on its achievements.
- **Recommendation 10:** The Partnerships and Development Cooperation Department should revise the final project progress report to be more along the lines of a project completion report with ratings for the achievement of development objectives, project implementation, risk management and a sustainability plan. This would be completed by the ILO, but would flow from the involvement of constituents in monitoring and evaluation and be based on evaluation/wrap-up workshops held at the close of a project.

Comments from the Office

32. The Regional Office acknowledges the findings, conclusions and recommendations of the independent evaluation for the ILO's Country Programme for the United Republic of Tanzania from 2004 through 2010. These will help improve the design and implementation of the next Decent Work Country Programme in the United Republic of Tanzania and in other countries of the region.
33. The Office takes into account many useful elements in the report as it supports ILO country offices in designing, implementing, monitoring and evaluating Decent Work Country Programmes. These include: (i) strengthening the synergies and coherence among projects; (ii) conducting post-project assessments of impact and sustainability; (iii) implementing a systematic monitoring mechanism within the two-tier field structure; and (iv) focusing on the right mix of project implementation and policy support activities.
34. To strengthen synergies and coherence of the Country Programme, the Regional Office endorses **Recommendation 1**. It is now expected that, following adoption by the tripartite constituents, Decent Work Country Programmes would be submitted to and endorsed at cabinet level, as well as reviewed and adopted by the parliaments and national economic and social councils, where appropriate. This would ensure that the second generation of Decent Work Country Programmes gain increased national budgetary commitments as well as development partners' support, and facilitate the mobilization of resources.
35. With regard to **Recommendation 2**, the Office will make use of other conduits such as joint assessments made under the auspices of the Delivering As One Pilot Programme and the Joint Assistance Strategy for Tanzania. This will increase coherence in working with other UN agencies and development partners.
36. The Regional Office has set aside resources, both human and financial, to develop staff capacity in project design, use of the logical framework and resource mobilization, in partnership with the International Training Centre in Turin. These actions address **Recommendations 3 and 4**.
37. With regard to **Recommendation 6**, the Regional Office will take advantage of the East African Community (EAC) to strengthen complementarities and synergies amongst

projects and national Decent Work Country Programmes. The current EAC/ILO Memorandum of Understanding will be revised to take into consideration the Global Jobs Pact and the ILO Declaration on Social Justice for a Fair Globalization.

38. As the Regional Office moves forward to strengthen results-based management and monitoring and evaluation in its operations, it also endorses **Recommendations 7, 8 and 9**. The Regional Office has recruited a monitoring and evaluation specialist who will provide capacity building to programme and project staff and constituents on the design of measurable, results-focused projects and monitoring and evaluation plans.

Tripartite constituents' comments

39. The tripartite constituents on the Tanzanian mainland (MLEYD, Association of Tanzanian Employers, Trade Union Congress of Tanzania) and in Zanzibar (Ministry of Labour, Youth, Women and Development, Zanzibar Employers' Association, Zanzibar Trade Union Congress)

... thank ILO for financial and technical support rendered over the years for implementation of the Decent Work Country Programme.

The constituents commend the ILO and the evaluation team for a job well done. The ILO programme is relevant to the Tanzanians, with priorities bearing on national strategies. The ILO programme has been supportive in assisting partners to promote the Decent Work Agenda, particularly through the review of labour laws and inclusion of the Agenda in MKUKUTA. While the report reflects the situation on the ground, it could be enriched in some areas such as sources of information, and the ILO's contribution towards various policies, legal developments and progress made by the country in reducing poverty.

Despite the challenges that have been identified, constituents consider the Decent Work Country Programme as the appropriate tool for addressing the development challenges facing Tanzania. The Constituents welcome **Recommendation 3** in respect of involving national constituents in the designing and monitoring of the results framework. The monitoring and evaluation needs improvement for all stakeholders to be aware of the outcomes.

Tripartite partners endorse **Recommendations 1 and 2**, stressing the need for ILO to fully engage constituents in priorities identification and outcomes management for effective implementation of the Decent Work Agenda. In so doing, they note the essence of investing in human capacity of the constituents in the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the Decent Work Country Programme. This will ensure national ownership and sustainability.

Partners concur with **Recommendations 4 and 5** on the development of minimum programming standards and accountabilities in the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the Country Programme as well as the quality assurance mechanisms.

Furthermore, the tripartite constituents endorse the notion put forward in **Recommendations 7 and 8** to hinge programmes and projects with national structures to facilitate sustainability. The Decent Work Country Programme has established a strong coherence within the ILO itself by sharing information and identifying synergies among projects. This coherence and sharing of information should be extended to constituents.

Constituents acknowledge that the Decent Work Country Programme was too ambitious and lacked a clear logical framework, which is key to determining clear objectives, indicators and outcomes. Despite that, constituents are of the view that the Programme has fostered collaboration between tripartite partners and other stakeholders. Partners commend the findings related to *Recommendations 9 and 10* but reiterate the importance of the full participation of national constituents in the monitoring and evaluation of projects.

40. *The Committee may wish to recommend to the Governing Body that it request the Director-General to take into consideration the above findings and*

recommendations, together with the deliberations of the Committee, for continuing support to the United Republic of Tanzania through the ILO's Decent Work Country Programme.

Geneva, 28 September 2010

Point for decision: Paragraph 40