



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation
Office

Promoting Good Labour Market Governance and Fundamental Rights at Work in Morocco – Final Evaluation

(Original report in French)

Quick Facts

Country: Morocco.

Final Evaluation: July 2015

Mode of Evaluation: Independent

ILO Administrative responsibility: CO-Cairo

Technical Area: International Labour Standards

Evaluation Manager: Mr. Cheikh Badiane

Evaluation Team: Dr. Mohamadou SY

Project End: 30 June 2015

Project Code: MOR/12/02/USA

Donor: US DOS (US\$ 643, 500)

Keywords: labour market governance, rights at work and collective bargaining.

Background & Context

On July 1st 2011, Morocco adopted by referendum a new Constitution. The new Constitution strengthens the powers of Parliament, calls for the independence of the judiciary and enhances human rights in the country. However, regarding the legal protection of fundamental rights at work, Morocco has not ratified ILO Convention 87 on Freedom of Association and ILO Convention 144 on Social Dialogue.

The project was funded by US DOS and implemented by the ILO. It was designed to support national constituents to achieve two immediate objectives and five related outputs.

Objective 1: promote and extend effective tripartite social dialogue through support to the national tripartite consultation bodies and the establishment of tripartite bodies at regional and sectoral levels.

Output 1.1: the National tripartite consultation bodies acquire improved operational procedures and its tripartite members new knowledge and skills to better participate in social dialogue.

Output 1.2: tripartite social dialogue mechanisms established at the regional and sectoral levels with the support of the national tripartite consultation bodies.

Output 1.3: a Social Charter and/or a set of policy and legal proposals are adopted by the national tripartite consultation bodies to improve compliance with fundamental rights at work and promote sound industrial relations.

Objective 2: develop the capacity of labour administration/labour inspection to improve compliance with labour laws that respect international labour standards.

Output 2.1: the labour inspectorate acquires new tools and skills to improve compliance with national labour legislations in selected sectors, including the rural sector.

Output 2.2: inspection campaigns carried out to promote compliance with labour laws in selected sectors, including the rural sector.

Officially, the Project lasted 21 months and ended in June 2015. However, with the ILO funding some

activities are carried out during the second semester of the year (July-December 2015).

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation:

In line with ILO's policy for evaluation, an independent evaluation was conducted to assess the project's achievements and its contribution to ILO's strategy in promoting social dialogue and fundamental rights at work. The evaluation was thematic in scope and covered the project's implementation period from September 2013 to June 2015.

The clients of the evaluation are main users of the findings and are expected to be ILO staff involved in the implementation of the project, ILO programming units, concerned specialists, ILO M&E staff at country, sub-regional, regional and HQ, US DOS, tripartite constituents in Morocco, civil society organizations and potential donors and implementing partners.

Methodology of evaluation

The independent evaluation took place in July 2015. The evaluation approach was participatory, consultative, process-oriented and qualitative. A desk review analysed project reports and other documentation provided by the evaluation manager and the project coordinator. A total of 22 stakeholders, including the project staff, tripartite constituents, the Donor, consultants, and the ILO back stoppers were interviewed either face to face or through telephone/Skype. A debriefing session was held with the Ministry of Employment and Social Affairs (MEAS) and the project staff. The meetings with stakeholders were well planned and organised, and the information management of the Project was excellent.

Two main constraint identified. The first constraint was the use of Skype and telephone for some interviews instead of face to face meetings. The second constraint was the absence of a second debriefing, as planned in the TORs, with the Donor, the evaluation manager and the back stoppers due to scheduling problems.

Main Findings & Conclusions

Relevance and strategic fit: the Mission found that the intervention strategy of the Project was good. The Project supported national priorities and was aligned with the strategic plan 2014-2016 of MEAS. All stakeholders interviewed agreed that the Project outputs were relevant because they dealt with key problems in market governance, rights at work and collective bargaining in Morocco.

In terms of validity of the design, the Project document (in English) was coherent, objectives, related outputs and activities were generally clear as well as the logical framework and the Monitoring and Evaluation plan.

The main limitations were the lack of baseline indicators, and a phase out and sustainability strategy. Social communication activities were also neglected in the PRODOC.

Progress and effectiveness: the Mission resolutely concludes that various key activities have been carried out and some major outputs achieved. There was a good leadership of the MEAS in all the activities conducted by the Project.

Output 1 of Objective 1 was partially achieved because 2 procedures out of 4 planned procedures were adopted. Before adopting those measures, the Project has assessed tripartite labour institutions and produced a manual of guidelines for the organization of tripartite commissions. Other outputs achieved through objective 1 were mainly the organization of 3 regional awareness workshops on collective bargaining in Agadir, Meknes and Kenitra for 180 participants (25% of women), the organization of an unprecedented national Colloquium on the legislative framework of labor in Morocco: 10 years after 2004 (about 400 participants, 35% of women), and the 5 training workshops on collective bargaining and occupational safety and health (23% of the 213 beneficiaries were women). In addition, 2 women out of 5 participants took part to the international trainings held in Turin and Algiers.

It is noteworthy that Morocco ratified in January

2013 Convention 144 (even though the achievement was not directly linked to the Project intervention only).

Two external factors affected negatively on the Project effectiveness as far output 1 is concerned. First, mobilizing tripartite constituents was difficult and depended on the Agenda of the MEAS which brings the consultation committees twice a year at most. Second, professional elections in the country have blocked the work with the commissions during the first semester of 2015.

Output 2 related to tripartite social dialogue mechanisms was not fully achieved. However, a concept note on the new regional dialogue mechanism was discussed with the MEAS and tools prepared for this new structure (for example, convention templates). Also, one collective bargaining agreement was signed in Meknes in 2013 after several years of negotiation which started in 1999 (this example is an evidence of the difficulty to sign collective agreements).

The output was not achieved because the Project could not establish new structures as planned without raising the awareness of social partners and building their capacities.

Output 3 related to the Social Charter was partially achieved even though a tripartite assessment of the labour code was conducted and recommendations formulated to promote fundamental rights at work. In this regard, more than two legal proposals were suggested in the assessment process.

The achievement of that output was beyond the Project's control. In fact, only the MEAS could conduct advisory sessions for the adoption of a social charter with components on fundamental rights at work and sound industrial relations. Time was limited for the MEAS to conduct those activities.

As far as objective 2 is concerned, output 1 was fully achieved. The plan of action of the Labour Inspection was revised, the diagnosis of the Labour Inspection of the MEAS was done and labour inspectors were trained in planning inspections, and

Occupational Safety and Health (OSH). In addition, they have received technical assistance for the development of a national OSH strategy. The MEAS is now better equipped to play its strategic roles.

Output 2 was partially achieved. The communication campaign was prepared and communication tools developed for inspectors. However, the communication campaign which started in March 2015 was implemented only in one region of the Project out of three.

The process of the communication campaign in the other two regions was blocked by the organisation of professional elections in the country. Once again, it was another external factor that affected negatively the achievement of the output.

Efficiency of resource use: the Mission observed that the Project was very efficient with just 2 staff in instead of 3 as planned in the PRODOC and the Project shared resources (office space, staff, logistics, etc.) with other ILO projects in place. The rate of budget implementation was very high (about 100%). Relevant activities were funded and all resources well managed. Savings generated (between 10 and 55% depending on budget lines) were reinvested up to 23% in the implementation of non planned but important activities such as social communication. The Projected devoted more than 69% of its resources to the funding of activities, 26% to salaries and less than 15% to other expenses (equipment, communication, etc.).

Management arrangements were generally effective because parties involved in the Project understood their roles and responsibilities and tripartite constituents were generally involved in an appropriate manner. The partnership between the Project staff and tripartite constituents was excellent. The project management was innovative. The ILO HQ's backstopping in strategic advice and reporting was also good. PARDEV was reactive and has maintained good working relationships with the Donor. The Donor also was not only flexible but also supportive. The DWT/CO-Cairo provided the Project with useful financial backstopping but it

was found to be slow and unstable.

In terms of limitations, disbursement delays due to lengthy procedure and human resources gap led to difficulties in project programming activities. Finally, a Project Steering Committee was created but it was not operational (only one meeting was held) because of time constraints at the tripartite constituents' level.

As far as **impact and sustainability** are concerned, tripartite constituents and partners recognized that significant contributions have been made to advance fundamental rights at work and collective bargaining in Morocco. Indeed, major improvements included the signing of the Meknes collective agreement, the institutional capacity building of labor inspectorate and social partners, and the broad consensus on the revision of the Labor Code. To some extent, the project has contributed to the achievement of the ILO's P&B 2014-2015 objectives.

All results of the Project were anchored in national institutions and partners' organisations under the leadership of MEAS. Some tripartite constituents have used the training modules developed by the Project to train their staff or members, which is an evidence of ownership. Equally important, the Project has disseminated relevant documentation and tools.

The Mission is of the view that more time and resources were required to achieve better impact and sustainability. Morocco is facing some challenges such as the ratification of the ILO Convention 87 and the signature of collective agreements at the regional and sectoral levels. Yet, the country has to revise its national legislation to ratify that Convention.

Recommendations

Recommendation 1: it is recommended to the ILO, US DOS and MEAS to join their efforts in order to mobilize internal and external financial resource for a second phase of the Project. A second phase is needed after the pilot phase because (i) it was quite difficult for the Project to achieve sustainable impact in less than two years and many external

factors were beyond its control, (ii) Morocco has recently introduced a set of political and legal reforms to build a more democratic and inclusive society. The country needs to be supported in the long run to build sustainable relationships among tripartite constituents, (iii) the Project was very efficient and has invested in tripartite constituents' capacity building, in solid knowledge base on tripartite dialogue and networking. Experience gained in the first phase could help achieve more and better results during a second phase.

Recommendation 2: the ILO should improve the quality of the design of similar projects in the future by conducting a full baseline, refining the intervention strategy, including a social communication component in the PRODOC and developing a sustainability strategy as well.

Recommendation 3: it is recommended to the ILO and to tripartite constituents to systematically put in place project governing bodies like quadripartite steering committees (to involve some major civil society organizations) in order to improve the quality of project implementation and national ownership of outputs.

Recommendation 4: the ILO and MEAS should support the training of trainers through a certification mechanism in order to sustain the project achievements and support the huge demand in capacity building.

Recommendation 5: in all capacity building initiatives, it important for the ILO and its social partners to organize monitoring visits to trained people in order to provide them with advisory services on how to better use their new knowledge and skills.

Recommendation 6: the ILO and tripartite constituents should encourage the signature of sectoral conventions at the local level, taking into account the social, economic and cultural differences between regions.

Lessons learned and good practices in full report