

International Labour Office

United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

**Joint ILO/UNESCO Committee  
of Experts on the Application  
of the Recommendation concerning  
the Status of Teachers**

Fourth Session, Geneva, 29 November - 7 December 1982

**Report**

Copyright © International Labour Organisation 1983

Publications of the International Labour Office enjoy copyright under Protocol 2 of the Universal Copyright Convention. Nevertheless, short excerpts from them may be reproduced without authorisation, on condition that the source is indicated. For rights of reproduction or translation, application should be made to the Publications Branch (Rights and Permissions), International Labour Office, CH-1211 Geneva 22, Switzerland. The International Labour Office welcomes such applications.

---

ISBN 92-2-103350-3

*First published 1983*

---

The designations employed in ILO publications, which are in conformity with United Nations practice, and the presentation of material therein do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the International Labour Office concerning the legal status of any country or territory or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers.

The responsibility for opinions expressed in signed articles, studies and other contributions rests solely with their authors, and publication does not constitute an endorsement by the International Labour Office of the opinions expressed in them.

ILO publications can be obtained through major booksellers or ILO local offices in many countries, or direct from ILO Publications, International Labour Office, CH-1211 Geneva 22, Switzerland. A catalogue or list of new publications will be sent free of charge from the above address.

---

INTERNATIONAL  
LABOUR OFFICEUNITED NATIONS EDUCATIONAL,  
SCIENTIFIC AND CULTURAL ORGANIZATIONJOINT ILO/UNESCO COMMITTEE OF EXPERTS  
ON THE APPLICATION OF THE RECOMMENDATION  
CONCERNING THE STATUS OF TEACHERS

Fourth Session, Geneva, 29 November - 7 December 1982

REPORTTable of contents

	<u>Paragraphs</u>
Introduction .....	1-18
Chapter I - General questions .....	19-142
Chapter II - Application of the Recommendation to teachers in private establishments .....	143-192
Chapter III - Application of the Recommendation in the light of changes in educational systems .....	193-275
Chapter IV - Conditions for effective teaching and learning .....	276-375
Chapter V - Women teachers and teachers with family responsibilities .....	376-385
Chapter VI - Shortages and surpluses of teachers .....	386-424
Conclusions .....	425-622



## INTRODUCTION

1. This report is submitted by the Joint ILO/UNESCO Committee of Experts on the Application of the Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers at the conclusion of its Fourth Ordinary Session, held in Geneva on 29 November-7 December 1982 under the chairmanship of Mr. P. Laroque (France).

2. The Committee of Experts was set up in pursuance of decisions taken at the 14th Session of the General Conference of UNESCO (Paris, October-November 1966) and the 167th Session of the Governing Body of the ILO (Geneva, November 1966). Its terms of reference are to examine the reports received from governments on action taken by them on the Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers and to report thereon to the International Labour Conference and the General Conference of UNESCO.

3. At their sessions in the autumn of 1967, the Governing Body of the ILO (170th Session) and the Executive Board of UNESCO (77th Session) decided that the Joint Committee should consist of 12 members designated and sitting in their personal capacities and appointed for three years with the possibility of renewal. The members should be independent persons, chosen solely on the basis of their competence in the principal domains covered by the Recommendation, and should have a thorough knowledge of the problems which application of the Recommendation might pose, whether in respect of education, teacher training, school administration, terms of employment and working conditions, social security, legal questions, etc. Each organisation should, in principle, choose the experts for the domains falling mainly within its province, half of the members of the Committee being chosen by the Governing Body of the ILO, on the nomination of the Director-General of ILO, and half by the Executive Board of UNESCO, on the nomination of the Director-General of UNESCO. The membership of the Committee should be as balanced as possible both from the point of view of geography and the varying systems of education and in respect of the spheres of expertise of its members.

4. The present members of the Joint Committee, appointed by the Executive Board of UNESCO and the Governing Body of the ILO to serve until the end of 1982, are the following:

Mr. S.B. Adaval (India, Head of the Department of Education, Allahabad University)

Mr. Pablo Gonzalez Casanova\* (Mexico, Professor, National Autonomous University, former Dean of the University)

Hon. Rex Nettleford, O.M. (Jamaica, Director of Extra-Mural Studies, Director of Studies, Trade Union Education Institute, University of the West Indies)

Mr. Y.S. Kotb (Egypt, former Rector of Ain Shams University, Abbassia, Cairo)

Mr. Pierre Laroque (France, former President of the Social Section, Council of State)

Hon. E. Gachukia (Kenya, Member of Parliament, lecturer at the University of Nairobi, President of the National Council of Women)

Mr. Frederic Meyers (United States, former Professor of Industrial Relations, University of California)

Mr. K.V. Sizov (USSR, Rector of the Foreign Languages Institute)

Mr. Iichi Sagara (Japan, President, University of the Sacred Heart, Tokyo)

Mr. W. Taylor (United Kingdom, Director of the Institute of Education of the University of London)

Mr. S.S. Fall (Senegal, lecturer in physical sciences at the Ecole normale supérieure in Dakar)

Mr. José de Segadas Vianna\* (Brazil, former Minister of Labour, Industry and Commerce)

5. The Committee of Experts met in ordinary session in 1968, 1970 and 1976, and in special session in 1979.

---

\* Did not attend.

6. The Committee decided, at its First Session (Geneva, 1968) that, in addition to the reports presented by governments, it could take into consideration information on implementation of the Recommendation which might be received from national organisations representing teachers or their employers, and from international teachers' organisations having consultative status with UNESCO, without excluding information from other authoritative sources, it being understood that any such information referring to the situation in a particular country would be communicated to the government concerned for any observations it might wish to make thereon. At its Second Session (Paris, 1970), it decided that, rather than make a critical analysis of the situation in each country, it would endeavour to evaluate the general situation with regard to the application of the main provisions of the Recommendation and to determine the major problems still to be overcome.

7. At its Third Session (Geneva, 1976) the Committee of Experts examined information received from 72 governments concerning the application of the Recommendation in respect of a number of matters chosen in the light of the discussion of the reports submitted to the 1970 meeting. The information requested related, firstly, to the main changes concerning the status of teachers which had occurred in law and practice since 1969 with regard to the essential provisions of the Recommendation, and secondly, to a number of "particular questions" on the subject of the preparation of primary school teachers; the pedagogical preparation of secondary school teachers; teacher involvement in educational change; trade union rights and collective bargaining; employment and career of teachers; and social security. The Committee also took into account communications from three international teachers' organisations.

8. At a special session (Paris, 1979), the Committee examined studies, carried out at its request, on the professional freedom of teachers (by UNESCO); teachers' pay (by ILO); and social security for teachers (also by ILO). It reached certain conclusions on these subjects establishing, in particular, criteria for determining whether levels of teachers' earnings in a particular country were in conformity with the relevant provisions of the Recommendation, and observing that there was perhaps no country in the world which could claim to have fully applied the extremely ambitious provisions on social security in the Recommendation.

9. In preparation for the Fourth Ordinary Session, and in accordance with previous practice, a questionnaire, drawn up by the Committee at a special session held in 1979, was sent to governments to permit study of the current situation with regard to the application of the Recommendation. It concentrated, first, on developments which had occurred since the 1976 session in regard to the application of the Recommendation as a whole, and secondly, on a limited number of more specific points. The questionnaire was accordingly divided into two parts as follows:

- A. General questions. This part requested information on the main changes concerning the status of teachers which had occurred since 1976, in law and practice, particularly as regards the essential provisions of the Recommendation.
- B. Particular questions. This part, which requested more detailed information, covered the following fields:
  - I. Application of the Recommendation to teachers in private establishments.
  - II. Application of the Recommendation in the light of changes in educational systems.
  - III. Conditions for effective teaching and learning.
  - IV. Women teachers and teachers with family responsibilities.
  - V. Shortage of teachers.

10. This questionnaire was sent to the member States of the two organisations on 16 February 1981 with a request to reply before 15 October 1981.

11. In all, reports were received from 65 governments in reply to the Committee's questionnaire. The governments replying are shown in table I, which also contains information on governments replying to the earlier questionnaires.

Table I: Supply of information by governments concerning the application of the Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers

Country	1st questionnaire (1969)	2nd questionnaire (1975)	3rd questionnaire (1981)
Afghanistan		X	
Algeria		X	
Argentina	X	X	X
Australia	X	X	X
Austria	X	X	X
Bahrain	X		
Bangladesh		X	X
Barbados			X
Belgium	X	X	
Benin	X	X	
Bolivia	X		
Brazil	X	X	
Bulgaria	X	X	X
Burma	X	X	
Burundi	X		
Byelorussian SSR	X	X	X
Cameroon	X		X
Canada		X	X
Central African Republic	X		
Chile	X	X	X
China	X		
Colombia	X		X
Congo	X		
Costa Rica	X		
Cuba		X	X
Cyprus	X	X	X
Czechoslovakia	X		X
Denmark	X	X	X
Dominican Republic	X	X	
Ecuador	X	X	X
Egypt	X	X	X
El Salvador		X	
Finland	X	X	X
France	X	X	X
Gabon			X
German Democratic Republic		X	X
Germany, Federal Republic of	X	X	X

Table I (cont.)

Country	1st questionnaire (1969)	2nd questionnaire (1975)	3rd questionnaire (1981)
Ghana	X	X	X
Greece	X	X	X
Guatemala	X		
Guyana	X	X	X
Hungary	X	X	X
Iceland		X	
India	X	X	X
Indonesia		X	X
Iraq	X	X	X
Ireland		X	X
Israel	X		X
Italy	X	X	X
Japan	X	X	X
Jamaica			X
Jordan	X		X
Kenya			X
Kuwait	X	X	X
Lao Republic	X		
Lebanon	X	X	
Liberia	X	X	
Luxembourg	X		X
Madagascar			X
Malaysia	X	X	
Malta		X	X
Mauritius	X	X	X
Mexico		X	X
Monaco	X		
Morocco	X	X	
Netherlands		X	X
New Zealand		X	X
Nicaragua			X
Niger		X	
Nigeria	X	X	
Norway	X	X	X
Oman		X	
Pakistan		X	X
Panama	X	X	
Papua New Guinea			X
Paraguay	X	X	
Peru		X	X
Philippines	X	X	X
Poland	X	X	X
Romania	X		



Table I (concl.)

Country	1st questionnaire (1969)	2nd questionnaire (1975)	3rd questionnaire (1981)
Saudi Arabia			X
Sierra Leone	X	X	
Singapore	X	X	
Spain	X	X	X
Sri Lanka	X	X	X
Sudan	X	X	
Sweden	X	X	X
Switzerland	X	X	X
Syrian Arab Republic	X	X	
Tanzania			X
Thailand	X	X	X
Togo	X		
Tunisia	X		X
Turkey	X	X	
Ukrainian SSR	X	X	X
USSR	X	X	X
United Kingdom	X	X	X
United States	X	X	X
Upper Volta	X		
Uruguay	X		X
Venezuela	X	X	X
Viet Nam	X	X	
Yugoslavia	X		
Zaire	X		

No reply has been received to any of the three questionnaires from the following countries: Angola, Bahamas, Belize, Botswana, Cape Verde, Chad, Comoros, Democratic Yemen, Djibouti, Equatorial Guinea, Ethiopia, Fiji, Grenada, Guinea, Guinea-Bissau, Haïti, Honduras, Iran, Ivory Coast, Democratic Kampuchea, Lesotho, Libyan Arab Jamahiriya, Malawi, Mali, Mauritania, Mongolia, Mozambique, Namibia, Nepal, Portugal, Qatar, Rwanda, Saint Lucia, Senegal, Seychelles, Somalia, Suriname, Swaziland, Trinidad and Tobago, Uganda, United Arab Emirates, Yemen, Zambia, Zimbabwe. However, many of these countries have only become Members of the ILO or UNESCO recently and consequently did not have an opportunity of replying to some or all of the questionnaires.

12. All the reports received by 31 March 1982 were considered and analysed by the Committee.

13. Several governments sent comments from organisations of teachers and their employers, either incorporated in their own reports or as separate documents.

14. The Government of Canada, in addition to its own report concerning the territories in which it has jurisdiction for educational purposes, sent separate reports on the situation in the provinces of Alberta, Ontario and Quebec. The Government of the United Kingdom sent separate reports on the situation in England and Wales, Scotland and Northern Ireland respectively.

15. In addition, information and observations have been received from three international teachers' federations, viz., the World Confederation of Teachers (WCT), the World Federation of Teachers' Unions (WFTU) and the World Union of Catholic Teachers (WUCT). Reports from the "All India Federation of Catholic Teachers' Guild" and the "National Confederation of Teachers' Centres" (Colombia) were transmitted by WUCT. In accordance with the decisions taken by the Joint Committee at its First Session, the information and observations, since they related to the situation in a particular country, were communicated to the government concerned for possible comments.

16. Notwithstanding the care taken in analysing the replies and observations received, the Committee is aware that, owing in particular to the different approaches adopted by governments in replying to the questionnaire, mistakes may have occurred in interpreting the data supplied to the Committee.

\*

\* \* \*

17. The analysis following this introduction consists of six chapters dealing successively with the general questions and particular questions set out in the questionnaire, as indicated in paragraph 9 above. After this analysis will be found conclusions and suggestions formulated by the Joint Committee.

18. Apart from the replies sent in by States, and the observations received from certain international teachers' organisations, the only material used by the Committee - with the exception of certain salary figures in table IV - was relevant official information contained in documents of, or prepared with the assistance of, the United Nations, ILO or UNESCO. Wherever such material has been used, the fact is indicated in the report.

## CHAPTER I

### GENERAL QUESTIONS

19. The purpose of Part A of the questionnaire was to obtain information on the main changes concerning the status of teachers which had occurred since 1976 in law and practice. Information was requested as regards the essential provisions of the Recommendation in the following areas:

- preparation for the profession (Recommendation, Part V);
- employment and career (Recommendation, Part VII);
- the rights and responsibilities of teachers (Recommendation, Part VIII);
- teachers' salaries (Recommendation, Part X);
- social security (Recommendation, Part XI).

20. The questions were general in character, only requesting information on the state of law and practice as regards the matters mentioned.

21. All the States shown in table I as having replied to the questionnaire replied to all or some of the questions contained in this part of the questionnaire.

#### Preparation for the profession (Part V of the Recommendation)

22. Part V of the Recommendation on the preparation for the teaching profession deals with the selection of teachers, teacher education programmes and teacher training institutions. More specifically, the questionnaire posed questions which related to the following topics: conditions of access to teacher training facilities granted to future teachers, duration and content of teacher preparation programmes, and the organisation of teacher preparation institutions.

#### Conditions of access to training (paragraphs 11-16)

23. The minimum admission requirements to teacher training based on academic qualifications are generally well observed in most countries. Completion of the course of general secondary education together with successful interview by a selection committee are the conditions usually specified for admission to the primary teacher training institutions. Of 52 countries which replied to the question and gave information on this point, about 12 gave criteria of admission which in parts were below the standards of the Recommendation: Byelorussian SSR, Cameroon, Cuba, Ecuador, Gabon, Indonesia, Luxembourg, New Zealand, Papua New Guinea, Philippines, Spain, Sri Lanka. The situation in Thailand, which in its 1976 reports communicated that the criteria for admission were below the standards laid down in the Recommendation, now meets those standards. In Papua New Guinea, the academic requirement is a pass at Form 4 level (Grade 10).

24. However, in many countries where admission to the primary teacher training institution may be gained without completion of the secondary course, the duration of the teacher training programme is correspondingly longer than for candidates having completed the secondary course. Such is the case for instance in Cuba and Indonesia. In the former country, admission to teacher training institutions for primary training is gained by a pass at the ninth grade. This is below the level for completion of the secondary course. Correspondingly, however, the primary teacher training programme lasts four years. In the case of Indonesia, the duration of the training is three years (instead of two) for those who have not completed the senior secondary course. In Sri Lanka, two forms of training exist: an institutionalised training of three years' duration and a programme of short-term in-service training, provided generally during weekends and vacations and available to any interested person. Besides the fact that candidates should have knowledge of the subjects taught in school, no requirement seems to exist concerning the academic and personal requirements for admission to the institutionalised training course. In Switzerland, out of the 26 cantons and demi-cantons, many but not all require successful completion of the secondary school programmes for admission to teacher training courses.

25. In almost all the cases in which conditions of admission to teacher training institutions fall below the level of completion of secondary course, this is due to the existence of a lower category of teachers admitted to the profession with a certificate of lower secondary schooling. As pointed out above, this shorter academic course is usually compensated by a longer teacher training course including a proportion of time devoted to upgrading the level of general education.

26. In certain countries the category of assistant primary teachers still exists. These teachers may have, for instance, an end-of-primary school certificate which is accepted for admission to a two-year course of teacher training which qualifies them as primary teacher assistants.

27. Certain countries (Hungary, United States) have mentioned experiments in progress towards designing tests for ascertaining human qualities in candidates, and research efforts to discover criteria which might be used to determine which candidates are likely to become the best teachers.

#### Facilities granted to future teachers (paragraphs 16-17)

28. The Recommendation states that financial assistance should be available to students and other persons preparing for teaching and that such persons should be informed of the existence of such opportunities and assistance. Out of the 52 member States who answered the question, 37 report that facilities are given to teacher trainees. This aid is provided in the form of salaries, allowances or scholarships which may be granted as a function of the parents' income. In residential colleges, free accommodation and full board are usually provided. As a rule, developing countries provide salaries or grants to their teacher trainees. Certain industrialised countries, such as Canada, Japan, Norway, Sweden, the United States, provide state loans to teacher trainees as they do in the case of university students. In 1981, Japan provided loans to student teacher applicants numbering up to 38 per cent of the total enrolment, as compared to 10 per cent to university students. The position of individual member States on this question is summarised in table II.

#### Duration and content of teacher preparation programmes (paragraphs 19-23)

29. Teacher training programmes may range in duration from one year to four or five years. However, the characteristic teacher education programme as from the minimum entry requirement (the recognised secondary school certificate) requires three to five years of appropriate post-secondary education which comprises academic subjects and professional courses such as methods of teaching and educational psychology (see further on). Practice teaching in a demonstration school and/or in a public school system is usually included. The trend as expressed in the answers to the present questionnaire and by comparison with the previous Joint Committee of Experts' report is towards increasing the time allotted to professional training. In general education, courses exist for the following categories of teachers: pre-primary school, primary school, lower secondary school and upper secondary school teachers. In some countries, a basic education course exists for a level which effectively combines the primary and lower secondary (e.g. Norway, Chile).

30. The qualification for teaching may generally be obtained in one of three ways:

- (i) a two- to three-year course at a teacher education establishment;
- (ii) a university degree followed by a one-year course at a teacher education establishment (a small number of primary teachers and the great majority of secondary teachers enter the profession by this route);
- (iii) a three- to four-year course for a university degree in education (e.g., B.Ed.) in which academic subjects are taught and professional training given concurrently. This course may lead to qualification for either primary or secondary school teaching.

31. The qualification for teaching in secondary schools is usually obtained through an appropriate university degree followed by a professional course at a teacher training establishment.

Table II: Facilities granted to future teachers

Country	Facilities granted
Argentina	Not available, except for co-operative assistance.
Australia	Allowances based on parents' means test, except Northern Territory.
Austria	No information.
Bangladesh	Free accommodation and stipends.
Barbados	Students receive salaries.
Byelorussian SSR	Free use of installations; sport equipment, lodging and transport.
Bulgaria	No information.
Cameroon	Bourses aux candidats admis.
Canada (CTF)	Interest-free loans - tuition fee \$800 (1981).
" (Quebec)	Aid to boarding costs.
Chile	Grant for low-income families.
Colombia	Very low fees - minimum fees in faculties of education (on income declaration).
Cuba	Education is free - food, clothing and recreational facilities also provided.
Cyprus	Primary: monthly allowance. Secondary: scholarship with means test.
Czechoslovakia	Scholarship, accommodation and full board.
Denmark	Same as for higher education.
Ecuador	Free tuition for teacher preparation; higher teacher training institution grants and scholarships.
Egypt	Scholarship on merit.
Finland	Same support as to other university students.
France	Facilities granted to teacher trainees.
Gabon	Monthly grant.
German Democratic Republic	Grants and allowances for all + special merit grants - accommodation and boarding facilities.
Germany, Federal Republic of	Means tests as for university students.
Greece	No information.
Guyana	Free tuition, monthly grant, accommodation and board.
Hungary	Grants according to parents' income. Fees exemption on good results.
India	Salary, free medical aid, leave and travel facilities.
Indonesia	Scholarship and boarding in some TT schools.
Iraq	No information.
Ireland	No information.
Israel	Loans to deserving students.
Italy	Assistance to able but needy students.
Jamaica	Teachers' college students pay no tuition or boarding fees.
Japan	Loans granted to 38 per cent of teacher trainees as compared to 10 per cent university students.
Jordan	Residents: full boarding and pocket money.
Kenya	Monthly allowance.
Kuwait	Free tuition; monthly allowance.

Table II (concl.)

Country	Facilities granted
Luxembourg	Primary school teacher trainees: 30,000 fr./year Secondary school teacher trainees: scholarships or loans.
Madagascar	All facilities as residents at teacher training institutions.
Malta	Salary.
Mauritius	Allowance paid for the two years of the training course.
Mexico	
Netherlands	Grants for the needy and for high performance.
New Zealand	Training allowance paid.
Nicaragua	Training free - grants to deserving students - boarding facilities in one college.
Norway	Scholarships or loans on application.
Pakistan	Modest scholarships granted.
Papua New Guinea	Grants to students of teachers' colleges.
Peru	Tuition and matriculation are free.
Philippines	Scholarships are granted.
Spain	Twenty-five per cent of university students' grants for 1981 went to students in university TT schools, mainly for trainees in basic general education.
Sri Lanka	No facilities.
Sweden	Small grant and state loan - vocational school teachers higher loan.
Switzerland	No information.
Tanzania	Monthly allowance 120-150.
Thailand	Modest grants available.
Tunisia	Free tuition, medical care and full boarding.
United Kingdom:	
(England and Wales)	Grants for initial teacher training.
(Scotland)	Grants for initial teacher training.
Ukrainian SSR	Grants, hostel accommodation, free travel and free access to sport facilities and studies for artistic activities.
Uruguay	No information.
United States	State loans only.
USSR	State grants + 25 per cent for merit; correspondence or evening courses earn additional paid leave up to four months.
Venezuela	Undergraduate and post-graduate fellowship awards.

### One-year courses

32. For student teachers who hold a university degree, a one-year post-graduate course in professional studies is usually available. The following countries have mentioned these one-year post-graduate training courses: Australia, Bangladesh, Egypt, France, India and Sweden. Although principally aimed at secondary school teachers, such courses also exist for primary school teachers in some countries (e.g., United Kingdom, France, Australia, United States). Papua New Guinea has a one-year course for persons with special skills and long experience in their technical fields wanting to become teachers.

### Two-year courses

33. Such courses exist for primary school teachers in the following countries: Argentina, where candidates have residential training; Byelorussian SSR, for students having completed ten years of education; Colombia, two years at the Faculty of Education for students holding a "bachiller" diploma; in Guyana, besides the two-year course for qualified applicants, a two-year in-service teacher training course is also run (it is designed for the benefit of untrained teachers serving in schools; applicants who do not hold the normal entry qualifications are required to complete a one-year qualifying course); Papua New Guinea; in Tanzania, a two-year course designed for applicants having completed four years of secondary education gives training to Certificate A teachers. Two-year courses for secondary school teacher training are also run in Indonesia (for the lower secondary level), in Kenya and in Tanzania.

### Three-year courses

34. A course of such duration for pre-primary school teachers exists in the following countries: Chile, Cyprus, Guyana and Indonesia.

35. Primary teacher training courses lasting three years exist in the following countries: Cameroon (course is aimed at junior secondary teachers and leads to a Bachelor's degree); Canada; Chile (course designed for the basic school programme and lasting for three to four years); Cyprus; France; Federal Republic of Germany; Indonesia; Nicaragua (the primary school teacher training programme involves a three-year post-primary basic course plus a three-year teacher training programme); Norway (teacher education for the "basic" school); Tanzania (a three-year course exists designed for Certificate C primary teachers who have completed seven years of primary education); Venezuela.

36. For secondary school training, three-year courses exist in Barbados (the first year is an in-service period); Cyprus (three to four years varying from university to university); France (in the final year's training, the candidate follows a six-week course with an enterprise); Federal Republic of Germany (teachers of lower secondary schools); Guyana; Papua New Guinea; Sri Lanka; United Kingdom (three years for an ordinary degree with education).

### Four-year courses

37. For primary school teacher training, the following countries run four-year courses: Byelorussian SSR (for candidates having completed only eight years of primary education); Colombia; Cuba; German Democratic Republic; Peru (eight academic semesters); Philippines; United Kingdom (Honours degree with education); United States (university education comprising academic subjects and professional courses).

38. For secondary teacher training, the following countries run courses of four years' duration: Argentina (secondary teacher training with various types of specialisation); Canada; Colombia (eight semesters with some variations as a result of the diversification of secondary education which was generalised in 1978); Cuba; German Democratic Republic (for teachers of grades 1 to 4 of the comprehensive school); Federal Republic of Germany (course for higher secondary school teacher training); Hungary (for teachers of theoretical subjects as for those of practical subjects); Indonesia (for teachers of the higher secondary school); Iraq; Japan (training given in some universities and colleges); Netherlands (a four-year programme, lower level, and a four-and-a-half year programme to prepare students for the teaching profession); Nicaragua (four-year course at the Faculty of Education); Philippines; United Kingdom and United States.

### Five-year courses

39. Such courses combining general education and teacher training are provided for primary and pre-primary school teachers by training institutes in Egypt. In Tunisia, courses of similar duration are run for primary school teachers in teacher training colleges.

40. For the training of senior secondary school teachers, five-year courses leading to a university degree usually exist, as in the following countries: Cameroon, Finland, German Democratic Republic, Malta, Peru and Venezuela. In Cameroon, such a course leads to a Master's degree. In Finland, secondary teacher education has been transferred to the universities and the five-year course in education leads to an M.Ed. In the German Democratic Republic as from September 1982, graduate teachers will follow a five-year course. The five-year course at the University of Malta leads to the degree B.A. (Hons) Ed., which is awarded either to primary or secondary school teachers. A ten-semester course prepares secondary school teachers in Peru (institutes of education) and Venezuela (university). Sixty-five per cent of the course in Peru consists of professional preparation.

41. In the Recommendation, it is laid down that the training programme for teachers should include general studies, education foundation studies (including elements of philosophy, psychology and sociology applied to education), special studies related to the subject-areas chosen by the candidate, and teaching practice, to which should be added the conducting of extra-curricular activities under the guidance of fully qualified teachers (§20).

42. Those countries which have mentioned changes in the content of teacher training programmes have specified that the training given not only covers the areas indicated in the Recommendation, but also includes other courses, usually more specific to the country. Among the additional courses mentioned, the following may be quoted: history of the Communist Party, principles of Marxist-Leninist philosophy (USSR, Cuba, German Democratic Republic, Ukrainian SSR); child development (Canada); learning processes (Canada); environmental education (Bangladesh); health and population education (Bangladesh); professional ethics (Bangladesh); measurement and evaluation (Canada); music and drama education (Cyprus); art and handicraft (Cyprus, Ghana); home economics (Ghana); community life and development (Ghana, Papua New Guinea); principles of co-operatives (Ghana); library skills (Kenya, Papua New Guinea).

### Organisation of teacher preparation institutions (paragraphs 24-29)

43. The Recommendation has a number of provisions relating to the organisation of teacher training institutions. It considers it desirable that the education of "different types of teachers, whether primary, secondary, technical, specialist or vocational teachers" should be given in "institutions organically related or geographically adjacent to one another".

44. Many reports bear evidence to a trend in this direction. For example, in Tanzania primary and secondary teachers are trained in the same type of institution: the College of National Education. Since 1970, in-service holiday courses have also been conducted for primary teachers in those same colleges. Attendance has become compulsory since 1980. In Israel, kindergarten, primary and intermediate school teachers are trained in teacher training colleges and universities give post-primary training. Israel also reports that new measures have been introduced since 1979 which tend to promote the continuity of pre-service preparation and in-service training and establish a uniform level of pedagogic preparation for all age levels and all educational frameworks, including one year of practice teaching for all student teachers. The courses themselves are diversified to prepare teachers for kindergarten, elementary, lower-secondary and upper-secondary schools. In France, primary teacher training has been raised to the university level with a diploma which qualifies its holder to pursue university courses.

45. The German Democratic Republic speaks of efforts to achieve the centralisation of training capacities which has been the objective of recent years. Hungary mentions studies made to bring closer co-ordination between colleges training primary teachers and universities training secondary teachers. India, although having separate teacher preparation institutions for primary and secondary teachers, has a number of institutions that train both categories of teachers. In Sweden, since 1977, and in Finland, teacher education has been transferred to universities. This, it is claimed, has had the effect of unifying the education of the various teacher groups and creating closer contact between teacher education and research in education.



46. Further discussion on this topic will be found in Chapter III.

47. The Recommendation further considers that teacher educators should be qualified enough to dispense a higher education training and should have good school-teaching experience periodically renewed. Research in educational sciences should be carried out in teacher preparation institutions and involve teacher educators and their students. Research results should be made known to all student teachers. The school-teaching and pedagogic experience of teacher educators is a matter which has been improving, according to the reports received. Certain countries, however, still mention the lack of such experience in teacher educators (Thailand) or of the possibility of periodically refreshing such experience (Australia, Canada, Denmark). Other countries state that teacher educators are required to have had a number of years of school-teaching experience (e.g. Cuba, Finland, German Democratic Republic, Sweden). The report from the USSR states that teacher training institutions have a teaching personnel with a considerable teaching experience in schools. In the United States, during the past decade, there has been a trend to carry out teacher education programmes more directly in schools. This has had the effect of making the programme more relevant to the students and of upgrading the programmes themselves.

48. The following countries have mentioned research activities in the educational field: Finland, Sweden, United Kingdom, United States, and USSR. Generally, educational research activities are done mainly in the post-graduate colleges of the universities. However, more operational research activities are being developed. In Finland, educational research is encouraged in practising schools. In Sri Lanka, since 1980, a research branch to undertake operational research activities mainly to improve the school system has been set up at the Ministry of Education. In the United States, educational research activities have been focused on teacher effectiveness as measured by both teacher performance and pupil performance.

49. The Recommendation considers that staff and students should have the opportunity of expressing their views on the arrangements governing the life, work and discipline of a teacher training institution (paragraph 27). Such opportunity exists in a number of countries. In Guyana and in Papua New Guinea for instance, student representative councils are set up in all teacher training institutions to represent students' views and maintain professional standards. In Sweden, representatives of students and staff are members of the governing bodies of the institutions, as well as department boards. In the United Kingdom, ad hoc committees comprising representatives of trainees, staff and the local education authorities are set up to co-ordinate teacher education.

#### Employment and career (Part VII of the Recommendation)

50. This part of the questionnaire sought to ascertain the position with regard to the application of the paragraphs of the Recommendation dealing with recruitment into the teaching profession (paragraphs 38-39), advancement and promotion (paragraphs 40-44), disciplinary procedures relating to breaches of professional conduct (paragraphs 47-52) and equality of opportunity and remuneration for men and women (paragraphs 7 and 54). No specific question was put concerning security of tenure (paragraphs 45 and 46). The information supplied in respect of other provisions of the Recommendation, such as those mentioned in the sections in this chapter concerning preparation for the teaching profession, in-service training and teachers' rights and duties, are also relevant to evaluation of the application of this part of the Recommendation.

#### Recruitment conditions and policies (paragraphs 38-39)

51. Policies governing recruitment into employment in teaching are in most of the replying countries laid down by public authorities. The competent authority may be the central government (as in Argentina), the ministry of education (Ukrainian SSR), local authorities (Japan, United Kingdom) or local school boards (parts of Switzerland, United States). In several countries with federal structures (Australia, Canada, Federal Republic of Germany, Switzerland, United States), education is a matter for the provincial authorities, which may themselves delegate powers in this field. In most cases the policies are laid down in laws, regulations or official circulars. In several countries teachers are recruited according to criteria established for public servants generally.

52. Only a limited number of countries state that teachers' organisations are associated with the formulation of recruitment policies. Canada (Alberta), Colombia, Czechoslovakia and New Zealand state that teachers' organisations are represented on the bodies fixing recruitment policies; in Finland the teachers' organisations influenced the content of the legislation; Sweden states that recruitment criteria have been negotiated with the teachers' organisations; in the Netherlands the latter may make representations if the policies applied give rise to problems; in Guyana they are represented on recruitment boards.

53. The policies applied usually consist of criteria for appointment. As was observed by the Committee in 1976, academic and professional qualifications were in virtually all cases the principal criterion for recruitment. (A few countries will accept candidates with qualifications below the set minimum, but usually on a temporary basis only and usually subject to a requirement of undergoing training or special observation during a trial period.) In addition, many countries require evidence of physical and mental fitness, and in some cases evidence of aptitude for teaching as well. Several countries require teachers to be of their own nationalities (although in Peru non-nationals may be employed temporarily to teach specific subjects). A number of countries impose examinations, written or oral; these are in some cases competitive. In many countries screening and interviews form important parts of the recruitment process. A few countries refer to age limits (as high as age 50 in Kuwait). Other requirements frequently mentioned include evidence of good character, good morals, possession of civic rights and respect for the established order. In the Federal Republic of Germany a newly recruited teacher "must support the free, democratic fundamental order". France requires teachers to have discharged their military service obligations before recruitment; in Cuba a teacher must complete his period of compulsory national labour service prior to appointment.

54. In several countries all persons successfully completing a teacher training course are guaranteed employment within the profession. The German Democratic Republic states that this is achieved by gearing training to social requirements; Nicaragua attributes the position to an over-all teacher shortage. In Cyprus and Madagascar, in contrast, acceptance for teaching does not involve immediate appointment but registration on a waiting list until a vacancy occurs.

55. A number of governments provided information on probation. The usual duration of probation is one or two years; in most cases the period may if necessary be extended. Several countries do not require any period of probation; Colombia and the Philippines require periods of probationary service from teachers in private establishments only. Czechoslovakia and Scotland both state that probation is considered a time for the provision of help and encouragement. In contrast, the Canadian Teachers' Federation refers to complaints among its members that supervisory practices are more judgemental than helpful and that this tendency, together with a tendency to give new appointees the most difficult assignments, is aggravated by the threat of teacher redundancy, which affects first teachers with least seniority.

#### Advancement and promotion (paragraphs 40-44)

56. Three of the replies (Austria, Canada (Ontario), Sweden) stated in general terms that paragraphs 40-44 of the Recommendation were complied with.

57. Practically all the countries which specifically referred to the question of transfer to a school of a different type or level stated that a teacher wishing to transfer in this way must possess the requisite level of qualifications. No other barriers to advancement of this type were referred to.

58. New Zealand allows transfers in certain circumstances without the acquisition of additional qualifications, but points out that a teacher taking advantage of these circumstances may find himself debarred from positions of responsibility in the new school. A few governments referred in this section to arrangements for study leave to enable teachers to improve their qualifications; others dealt with the subject in their replies on the subject of study leave (see Chapter IV).

59. A number of governments referred to "advancement" in the sense of progress up a salary scale, or from a lower to a higher salary scale, rather than in the sense of transfer from one type or level of school to another. Barbados, Czechoslovakia and Tunisia stated that advancement in this sense was based on inspection reports; Canada (Quebec), Cameroon and France specifically referred to the automatic nature of incremental advancement; and seven countries stated that such advancement could be accelerated by meritorious performance.

60. A number of countries indicate that there is no bar to the promotion of experienced teachers to posts of inspector and educational administrator and that experienced teachers are appointed to such posts. In Australia, in particular, it is unusual for persons without substantial teaching experience to be appointed to such posts.

61. A substantial number of countries indicate criteria for promotion. Those quoted most frequently are academic qualifications; experience (or length of service); and performance as a teacher. Other criteria mentioned from time to time are attitude (Australia), character (Federal Republic of Germany), proven abilities (Australia, Federal Republic of Germany, Ireland) and administrative ability (Australia, Cameroon, USSR). In Jordan, age and family status are taken into account; in Venezuela, publications and distinctions. Length of service is sometimes referred to as a factor giving eligibility for promotion; but from the context it appears in some countries to be a principal factor (together with academic qualifications) in the selection process. In Thailand, where professional criteria have not yet been established, seniority is the only factor taken into account. In most of the countries which replied, most, if not all, promotional posts appear to be filled from within the teaching profession; but in Colombia a number of posts of responsibility and of school principal are filled on the basis of recommendations from the higher organs of government, while in Spain the law lays down a minimum proportion of posts of responsibility which must be filled from within the teaching profession.

62. Some countries provided information on the procedures followed in making promotions. Canada (Quebec), Cyprus, Finland, the Federal Republic of Germany, Israel and Sweden state that promotional posts are advertised. In Ireland, promotions are based on the judgement of inspectors, school managers and school principals. Several countries have formalised competitive procedures; Ecuador and Venezuela both make reference to examinations. In Jamaica promotional decisions are made by the competent minister on the advice of the National Teaching Council, which comprises representatives of the teachers' organisation. Teachers' organisations also have a role to play in selection for promotional posts in Mexico and Nicaragua; in the last-mentioned country the national parents' associations and the Sandinist movement are also consulted. Canada (Quebec), Guyana and Mexico state that teachers' organisations are consulted in the establishment of promotional criteria; Canada (Ontario), Ireland and Tanzania state that they are not.

#### Disciplinary rules and procedures (paragraphs 47-52)

63. A large number of countries replying gave detailed information on the acts and omissions susceptible of disciplinary sanction and of the disciplinary sanctions applicable, or stated that rules on the subject exist. It is apparent from the replies that established disciplinary procedures exist in all the countries concerned. The rules governing disciplinary offences are often laid down at the national level; but in Sweden each county, and in Hungary and the Ukrainian SSR each school, has its own disciplinary code. In many countries disciplinary matters are regulated by law; in several provinces of Canada, where the teachers' organisations play a special role in the enforcement of standards of professional conduct, they are dealt with under the collective agreements applicable. Apart from these cases, only the Netherlands specifically states that teachers' organisations are consulted on questions of establishment of disciplinary machinery.

64. In a number of countries, the disciplinary machinery applicable to teachers in the private sector is different from that applicable to teachers in the public sector. This is particularly the case in countries where the latter group is subject to public service legislation (e.g., Bangladesh, Cameroon, Japan, secondary school teachers in Luxembourg).

65. The following paragraphs relate to the safeguards available to teachers in the public sector (the situation of teachers in the private sector is dealt with in Chapter II).

66. In all the countries which supplied specific information on the subject, a teacher is entitled to be informed in writing of the charges against him and to defend himself in one way or another. Some countries make specific reference to the rights of a teacher between notification of the charge and the time of the hearing. Thus, Czechoslovakia, Kuwait, Peru, the Philippines and Sri Lanka all specify that the teacher is given adequate time to prepare his defence (Peru allows two weeks); Luxembourg and Papua New Guinea allow a teacher to submit a rebuttal. Several (e.g. Cameroon, France, Italy) state that the teacher has the right of access to the evidence against him; several (e.g., Federal Republic of Germany, Philippines, Sri Lanka) allow the teacher to submit counter-evidence.

67. All the countries which provided information on this subject make provision for some sort of formal hearing to examine the case and to arrive at a decision or (on one or two cases) to make recommendations on the action to be taken by the competent authorities. In the great majority of these countries the teacher concerned is entitled to be heard at the formal proceedings and to submit a defence; in some cases he may call witnesses on his behalf. In a number of countries he is entitled to be represented by counsel; in Ireland he may be represented by his union.

68. In some countries (Cuba, Cyprus, Indonesia, Japan, Jordan, Peru), the formal proceedings appear to take place in the absence of either the teacher or his representative. However, in all these countries the teacher enjoys a right of appeal.

69. Again, all the countries which provided information on this subject stated that a teacher subjected to disciplinary proceedings is entitled to be informed in writing of the outcome of the proceedings and to appeal against the decision arrived at. Appeals may be addressed to an administrative body (the National Personnel Authority in Japan, the Public Service Commission in Sri Lanka) or the responsible minister (Ireland); to special tribunals (Italy, Madagascar); to labour courts (Federal Republic of Germany, German Democratic Republic); or to ordinary courts (Cuba, Cyprus, Israel, Jordan, Norway, Sweden).

70. A number of countries provide for teacher representation in the bodies conducting disciplinary proceedings by reserving one or more seats in disciplinary bodies for representatives of teachers' organisations. In Luxembourg, the body conducting disciplinary proceedings against a teacher contains a member of a non-teaching branch of the public service. Some countries specifically exclude peer participation in the process of judgement. At the other extreme, in Hungary disciplinary bodies consisting entirely of teachers are constituted by school directors, while in Canada (Alberta and Ontario) disciplinary proceedings are handled by the teachers' organisations themselves. In some countries (Cameroon, France, German Democratic Republic, Hungary, USSR) the disciplinary authorities are required to consult the competent teachers' organisations, or a body including representatives of teachers, before imposing a severe sanction.

#### Equality of opportunity and remuneration for men and women (paragraphs 7 and 54)

71. Practically all the governments replying make general statements to the effect that there is no discrimination based on sex in any field related to the employment of teachers. Several refer to constitutional provisions guaranteeing equality of treatment between men and women; Bangladesh and Colombia refer to legislation prohibiting discrimination based on sex. Cameroon, Canada (Quebec), Chile and Switzerland specifically refer to non-discrimination as regards access; a number of countries refer specifically to equality of remuneration. Tanzania expressly links equality of opportunity to equality of qualification. Switzerland is the only country to report any remuneration differentials based on sex; but these are encountered only in primary education in two cantons and in lower secondary education in one.

72. Some of the governments replying refer to difficulties in applying the principle of non-discrimination in practice. Australia makes a general reference to these difficulties. The Federal Republic of Germany, the Netherlands, New Zealand and Sweden indicate that women have difficulty in obtaining access to senior posts in the profession, or that the proportion of senior posts occupied by women falls short of the proportion of women employed in teaching; but the first two governments mentioned state that the situation is improving. The Government of the Federal Republic of Germany attributes the present situation to traditional role distributions. In Canada (Ontario), too, the proportion of women in the higher ranks of the profession is lower than would seem to be appropriate in view of the number of women in the teaching profession; but the Government is unable to determine whether this is caused by actual discrimination or by cultural patterns of expectations.

73. Specific aspects of the question of equality of opportunity between men and women are dealt with in Chapter V.

The rights and responsibilities of teachers  
(Part VIII of the Recommendation)

74. This part of the questionnaire sought to ascertain the position with regard to the participation of teachers in decision-making regarding the contents and methods of teaching (paragraphs 61-69); the right to belong to organisations of their own choosing (including teachers' unions) and to express unorthodox though legal views in the classroom on politics, race, religion and sexuality; the enjoyment of civic rights (paragraph 80); the establishment of codes of ethics or conduct by teachers' organisations (paragraph 73); the right of teachers' organisations to participate in the determination of their conditions of employment (paragraphs 82-83); and methods of settlement of disputes (paragraph 84).

Participation of teachers in decision-making  
regarding the content and methods of teaching  
(paragraphs 61-69)

75. The prerogatives of the teacher which the Recommendation associates with his academic freedom are generally well recognised, according to the replies received from member States. Responses from 40 countries out of a total of 52 have confirmed some form of participation of teachers in the process of curriculum development and the selection of textbooks and teaching methods.

76. However, as recognised in the provisions of the Recommendation, two distinct aspects must be identified in the role thus devolved to the teacher as a consequence of this professional right regarding the content and method of his teaching. The first aspect concerns the teacher's ability and freedom to choose the educational material (including the textbook) and the method he will use in his teaching within the framework of an approved programme. The second concerns his role in designing and adapting new teaching programmes to the requirements, academic and otherwise, of the situation.

77. Both functions may be the expressions of the teacher's professional right and be within his area of competence by virtue of his qualifications and experience. They may, however, also involve by right the participation of other responsible parties and authorities and call for widely different skills. The first function may be limited in scope and need not involve authorities from beyond the school institution environment. The second, however, calls for special skills and experience and requires an effective planning of activities involving central education authorities and other people concerned with the national education system. In this context the Committee, at its special session in November 1979, expressed the opinion that the teacher's right of participation in matters of

curriculum and teaching organisation, of educational policy and planning is not a monopoly of the teaching profession. Education being an over-all responsibility of society, pupils and parents, other social groups and political authorities also have the right to express their views on various educational issues.

78. Gabon has indicated that no participation of teachers exists in curriculum development work and in the selection of teaching methods and materials. The responsibility for such work rests with the specialists of the National Pedagogic Institute. The suggestion has been made by the Gabon National Commission for UNESCO that certain teachers should be called upon regularly to work with the Institute. In Colombia, participation of teachers in drawing up teaching programmes is limited. However, regional centres are being organised with teachers' participation with a view to adapting the curriculum proposed by the ministry to regional needs and resources.

79. In States with a socialist organisation, the participation of teachers is achieved through membership of the central teachers' union, which contributes to the definition of content and the selection of teaching methods. In Hungary, teachers, together with headmasters and the teachers' union, have recently taken an active part in the preparation of new curricula and textbooks. Introduced in 1978, the new primary and secondary school curricula are said to give teachers more freedom to choose both the teaching material and the methods to be applied.

80. In Finland, the teacher is reported to have a fairly large freedom in the planning of the teaching and in the selection of the teaching material within the framework of the approved curricula. Teachers' organisations are invited to take an active part in curriculum development work and school development in general. Private teachers act as members of working groups. The duties of the school inspector have in recent years been modified to include pedagogic guidance and counselling.

81. In Guyana teachers participate in decisions concerning the content of their teaching for both the primary and secondary levels. Syllabuses and examinations are to a large extent the work of practising classroom teachers. Teachers are invited to propose textbooks, the final decision being taken by a "subject committee".

82. In Thailand, teachers are involved in the selection and adaptation of teaching material and the application of teaching methods, but the teachers' organisations are not recognised any role.

83. In Canada, teachers have enjoyed considerable freedom in the selection of content. This freedom is gradually being reduced due to the centralisation of curriculum planning at the provincial government level. A trend exists to reduce the time available to teachers for planning and for participation in consultative activities. This is regretted and is contested by teachers' organisations.

84. It appears that generally teachers enjoy freedom in their choice of teaching methods and material within the framework of an approved programme in most countries. For new teaching programmes, a number of teachers participate more directly in working commissions responsible for curriculum development work. Comments from other teachers may also be received during the working sessions of the commissions.

85. The position of member States on the questions is summarised in table III, which has been compiled exclusively from the answers received.

Table III: Participation of teachers in the choice and development of teaching materials and methods

Countries	Role of teachers in choice and adaptation of teaching materials, a selection of textbooks, application of teaching methods		Participation in development of new courses, textbooks and teaching aids (§62)	
	Freedom to choose and adapt teaching materials and methods	Consultation or selection of textbooks	Participation of teachers in curriculum development and working groups	Consultation of teachers and teachers' organisations
Argentina	x	x		
Australia			x	
Bangladesh				x
Barbados	x	x		
Byelorussian SSR				x
Bulgaria				x
Cameroon				x
Canada	x		x	x
Chile	x			x
Colombia				x
Cuba			x	x
Cyprus			x	
Czechoslovakia		x	x	
Denmark			x	x
Ecuador	x		x	
Egypt			x	
France			x	x
Gabon			o	o
German Democratic Republic				x
Germany, Federal Republic of	x		x	
Guyana	x	x	x	
Hungary	x		x	
India	x			
Indonesia			x	
Iraq				x

Table III: (concl.)

Countries	Role of teachers in choice and adaptation of teaching materials, a selection of textbooks, application of teaching methods		Participation in development of new courses, textbooks and teaching aids (§62)	
	Freedom to choose and adapt teaching materials and methods	Consultation or selection of textbooks	Participation of teachers in curriculum development and working groups	Consultation of teachers and teachers' organisations
Ireland			x	x
Israel	x		x	
Jamaica				x
Japan			x	x
Jordan				x
Kenya				x
Kuwait			x	
Luxembourg			x	
Madagascar			x	x
Mauritius			x	
New Zealand	x			x
Nicaragua			x	
Norway		x		x
Pakistan	x			x
Philippines			x	
Quebec			x	x
Spain	x		x	
Sri Lanka		x		x
Sweden		x		
Switzerland				x
Thailand	x			
Tunisia			x	x
United Kingdom	x		x	x
Ukrainian SSR		x		x
United States	x			
USSR	x	x	x	
Venezuela			x	

A blank means that no information is available.  
 x represents a positive response.  
 o represents a negative response.



Freedom of teachers to belong to organisations of their choice (relates to no specific paragraph)

86. The great majority of governments replied to this question by simply stating that teachers were free to join organisations of all the kinds mentioned in the question.

87. A few governments qualified the general statement. Papua New Guinea stipulates that membership of one of these bodies must not impair performance as a teacher, while Italy allows membership of all types of organisations provided they are not secret, not engaged in activities detrimental to morals and not pursuing political ends by force of arms.

88. According to the information provided by governments, very few countries restrict the right of teachers to become members of a trade union. In most provinces of Canada membership of a teachers' union is automatic or compulsory. Japan allows teachers in the public sector to establish organisations for the maintenance and improvement of their working conditions but does not accept that those organisations should take the form of trade unions. (No such restriction applies to teachers in the private sector.) Several countries (Czechoslovakia, Gabon, Indonesia, Kuwait, Thailand) indicate that there is only one union which teachers may join.

89. The great majority of countries states that they do not restrict the freedom of teachers to join political parties. Some qualifications are expressed; in the Ukrainian SSR teachers are stated to be free to join the Communist Party; in the Federal Republic of Germany a teacher may join a political party provided that the latter is not opposed to the free democratic order established by the Constitution. In the Netherlands, in view of the structure of the educational system, the choice of a particular political party may sometimes be considered incompatible with the ideology of the school in which the teacher concerned is employed. In England and Wales a teacher must not inculcate in class the beliefs of the party to which he belongs.

90. There are, however, several countries which restrict the freedom of teachers - or at any rate teachers in government schools - in this field. Thus, Bangladesh, Cyprus, India, Jordan, Kenya, Pakistan and the Philippines all forbid teachers in public schools to join political parties. The Philippines explains this ban by the requirement of political neutrality in teachers. Jordan requires teachers to refrain from all kinds of political activity. Japan allows teachers in public schools to belong to political parties, but does not allow them to accept any office within a party. Sri Lanka does not allow teachers in the higher salary brackets to participate actively in party politics.

91. As regards religious organisations, Jordan is the only country replying which specifically refers to a prohibition on teachers to join them. Few restrictions, if any, appear to exist in connection with membership of social and cultural organisations, provided that their activities are compatible with good order and good morals.

92. The World Federation of Teachers' Unions submits for the information of the Committee allegations concerning violations of the trade union rights of teachers in a number of countries.

Freedom of teachers to express unorthodox although legal views in the classroom on politics, religion, race and sexuality (relates to no specific paragraph)

93. In its 1970 report on the application of the Recommendation by the member States, the Committee of Experts noted that neither the nature nor the content of the "academic freedom" which the teaching profession should enjoy under the provisions of Article 61 of the Recommendation was clearly defined. It therefore requested that an international study be undertaken by UNESCO with the view of completing, if necessary, the provisions of the Recommendation. An initial international inquiry on the issue was entrusted to Professor Ben Morris, a former member of the Joint ILO/UNESCO Committee of Experts. Teachers from 12 countries took part in the inquiry. A study entitled "The professional freedom of teachers" was published. The study, based on the findings of the inquiry, concluded that a measure of agreement existed on entitlement to the open holding of unorthodox political views in schools. But opinions were divided on matters of religion, race and sex.

94. At its special session in November 1979, the Committee of Experts, after examining the study on the professional freedom of teachers, decided that question related to issues raised in it should be included in the third questionnaire on the application of the Recommendation to which the member States have now replied.

The committee itself, while recognising the right of teachers to have and express freely unorthodox views, was of the opinion that the teacher cannot exercise absolute freedom in expressing his ideas in front of his class. He has to take into account the age and level of intellectual maturity of his pupils.

95. Of the 50 countries which answered the question, four countries, in particular, Cyprus, Madagascar, Jordan and Venezuela have declared that the teacher was not free to express unorthodox although legal views in the classroom. Jordan quoted Article 11 of the "Regulation of the duties of teaching staff" which forbids the teacher from expressing unorthodox views in the classroom. In Venezuela, an "organic law" forbids political indoctrination in the classroom or elsewhere. Racial segregation is opposed by the people and there exists also in the country a tacit agreement that controversies on matters of religion and sex are not allowed in the classroom. In Bulgaria, teachers are free to express their own views on religion, race and sex provided they are based on scientific findings. In Gabon, the teacher enjoys full freedom of expression on matters of religion and sexuality but limited freedom of expression in matters of politics and race. Australia reports that the teacher is free to express his opinions on matters of politics, religion, race and sexuality. However, certain states impose restrictions on the free discussion of homosexuality. India considers that the teacher may express unorthodox but legal views on politics, religion and sexuality but his views should not hurt the feelings of other ethnic groups. In Israel, the teacher may express unorthodox views on race and sexuality but no political or religious propaganda are allowed in the classroom. Barbados considers that teachers are not quite free to express all unorthodox but legal views in the classroom. In Bangladesh, freedom of expression exists for religion, race and sex but not for politics. Indonesia has no objection as long as the views expressed are based on the national philosophy (Pancasila). Sex problems however should be avoided. In Japan, freedom of expression is guaranteed by the Constitution. But on politics and religion, views should be strictly neutral. Pakistan approves the expression of personal views provided they are consonant with Islamic ideology. In Sri Lanka, no indoctrination in any political creed or expression of prejudice against race or religious groups is allowed.

96. Thirty-seven countries have stated that the teacher may express unorthodox but legal views on politics, religion, race and sex in the classroom but most of them have added qualifying statements about conditions which must obtain for such freedom to be exercised. The main ones are given below:

- the expression should be consonant with the teacher's professional conscience and the high sense of responsibility which should be his;
- the teacher should exercise his good judgement and remember that he is answerable for his actions to his employers;
- the opinions should not be morally shocking nor detrimental to the public order;
- primary school teachers should be more reserved in their opinions as younger pupils have no means of assessing the value of the ideas expressed;
- local traditions and creeds should be respected while keeping an opening to modern views;
- restraints imposed by the subject-matter in the curriculum, the level of the students, constitutional principles and ethical standards should be respected;
- the real restraint is provided by the level of tolerance in the community;
- the views should not contradict the aims of education nor offend the rights of students or the beliefs of families concerned;
- personal views may be expressed as long as they do not violate the spirit and letter of the constitution of the country;
- personal views may be expressed provided they are introduced as such and well distinguished from generally accepted ones;
- the teacher may express personal views on the topics provided his conduct is in keeping with the educational code regulations and in the context of the philosophy of the government;

- views expressed should not poison the minds of the public nor embarrass the government and the public;
- personal views may be expressed but the teacher may not attempt to convince students to accept a specific position.

Exercise of civic rights by teachers  
(paragraph 80)

97. All the governments replying state that teachers are free to enjoy all civil rights generally enjoyed by citizens.

98. The great majority specifically state that teachers are eligible for public office without restriction. New Zealand and the German Democratic Republic both state that teachers are encouraged to stand for public office; in Australia, Canada, Hungary and the USSR, it is stated that significant numbers of teachers do so. However, Bangladesh, Barbados, Japan and Cyprus state that teachers in public schools are not allowed to stand for public office; the first three specifically relate this prohibition to the public servant status of teachers. In Sri Lanka, a similar prohibition exists for teachers whose salaries exceed a certain level (i.e. teachers in positions of responsibility). In Colombia and Papua New Guinea (and for some positions in Australia) a teacher must resign in order to stand for elective public office; but arrangements exist for reinstatement in the event of failure to secure election. In Canada and England and Wales, a teacher may not be elected to the board of the education authority employing him. In Kenya, a teacher must resign on taking up public office in certain cases.

99. A few countries report special arrangements for teachers elected to public office. Thus, in Canada (Quebec), Mexico and New Zealand, a teacher so elected is placed on leave without pay; in Guyana and Spain he is detached; in Luxembourg, he is placed on "temporary retirement". In all cases the teacher retains all his rights acquired during previous service (in Guyana, seniority and pension rights continue to accrue during the teacher's period of office), and at the end of the teacher's term of office he may return to the teaching service.

Establishment of codes of ethics or conduct  
by teachers' organisations (paragraph 73)

100. A substantial number of governments did not provide any information on this subject. Teachers' organisations have established codes of ethics in Australia, Canada (almost all provinces), Chile, Ecuador, India (at federal level), Indonesia, Jamaica, Japan, Papua New Guinea, Spain, Sri Lanka and Thailand. They are engaged in the establishment of such codes in Guyana, Israel and Nicaragua. The codes in force in Argentina, Cameroon (for public schools), France, the German Democratic Republic, Hungary, Italy, Jordan, Kenya, Kuwait, Mexico and the Ukrainian SSR are laid down by law; in Hungary and Mexico, the legislation was drawn up in consultation with the teachers' organisations. In Cuba, rules concerning ethics are contained in the regulations of each school.

101. In several countries teachers are subject to ethical standards of a general character. This is the case in the Byelorussian SSR (where teachers are subject to the Code of Ethics of Builders of Communism) and in Sweden and the USSR, where teachers are expected to meet the same professional standards as employees generally.

102. Several governments state that no code of ethics has been drawn up by teachers' organisations in their respective countries; in Finland the teachers' organisations do not consider the subject one of priority concern. In Scotland, there is no formal code of professional ethics, but a professional body supervises the maintenance of professional standards. Iraq, Pakistan and Venezuela base professional standards on long-standing traditions. In the United States, binding standards of professional ethics are frequently written into collective agreements.

The right of teachers' organisations to  
participate in the determination of their  
conditions of employment (paragraphs 82 and 83)

103. Since the questionnaire only requested information on developments which had taken place since the previous report was submitted, the replies to this

question were considerably less specific than those received for the 1976 session of the Committee.

104. Several countries (Argentina, Bangladesh, Kenya, Kuwait, Madagascar, Spain, Thailand) specifically indicated that teachers' organisations have no role in the determination of teachers' conditions of employment; while Chile, Jordan and the Ukrainian SSR stated that teachers' conditions of employment were determined by laws and regulations, making no reference to consultation of teachers' organisations. Chile, the Philippines and Spain stated that teachers in private establishments were free to bargain collectively.

105. A number of countries, while not having recourse to formal negotiation with teachers' organisations, nevertheless take their views into account in varying degrees. Thus, in India and Mexico the views of the main teachers' organisations are taken into account; in Cameroon, Indonesia and Sri Lanka, the teachers' organisations are allowed to make representations. In Austria, England and Wales, France, Guyana, Ireland, Japan, Luxembourg, the Netherlands and Nicaragua, teachers' organisations are consulted; in some of these countries, there is standing machinery for consultation and in Ireland and the Netherlands there are complex consultation, arbitration and appeal procedures. In some of the countries concerned, while the consultation process takes place with the aim of reaching a final agreement, the competent authorities or the legislature consider that they cannot abrogate their authority in matters involving heavy financial commitments.

106. A substantial number of governments state that they "negotiate" with teachers' organisations on conditions of employment; Colombia, Czechoslovakia, Norway and Pakistan state that teachers' unions participate in the determination of conditions of employment; in Italy and Venezuela conditions of employment are laid down in agreements between the Government and the teachers' organisations; and in Canada and most of the states of the United States, the principle of determination of conditions of employment by collective bargaining is accepted. In Australia, the teachers' organisations participate fully in wage determination processes.

107. In the Federal Republic of Germany, a special situation exists. At the national level, teachers' conditions of employment are set by law; the role of teachers' organisations is confined to the making of representations to members of the legislature. However, at the level of the individual school, teachers' organisations have considerable influence over decision-making through staff councils.

#### Machinery for the settlement of disputes (paragraph 84)

108. A number of countries provided no information at all on this subject. However, the replies received, although not detailed, indicate that a wide variety of approaches to the problem of settlement of disputes exists. Only a few countries (Colombia, Indonesia - for teachers in the public sector, Peru and Thailand) state that no machinery exists for the settlement of disputes. Kenya and Sri Lanka state that machinery exists, but give no details.

109. In Finland, the German Democratic Republic, Jamaica and Spain, the machinery available is that available to workers in general; for public sector teachers in Jordan and Indonesia, it is that for public servants.

110. A number of countries state that disputes between teachers and their employers are dealt with by negotiation between the parties, at least at an initial stage. Some countries (Austria, Barbados, Ecuador, Hungary, Iraq, Ireland, Luxembourg, Ukrainian SSR) make reference to joint machinery for the settlement of disputes.

111. In a number of cases provision exists for referral of a dispute to an independent body if negotiations between the parties break down. Thus, in Northern Ireland and Israel, for instance, the dispute may be referred to arbitration; in Sweden, it is referred to the labour courts; in New Zealand, it is referred to an independent tribunal and in Cyprus, to a committee of ministers; and in the Federal Republic of Germany (for public sector teachers), the competent body is an administrative tribunal.

112. In several countries (some states of India, Iraq, Kuwait and Mexico) disputes are dealt with by the ordinary courts.

113. Only a few countries specifically state that teachers have the right to strike. The right exists in Australia, Canada, the Federal Republic of Germany (for teachers with employee status), Italy, Luxembourg (subject to certain regulations), Mexico (subject also to certain regulations), Norway (as a last resort) and seven of the states of the United States. Pakistan states that the situation is in accordance with paragraph 84 of the Recommendation. Bangladesh states that if there should be a breakdown in negotiations between the two parties, teachers' organisations have the right to take such other steps as are normally open to other organisations in the defence of their legitimate interests.

114. In contrast, Japan states that teachers with public servant status do not have the right to strike, while the Federal Republic of Germany refers to a statement in the report it submitted to the 1976 session of the Committee to the effect that the prevailing view then was that teachers with public servant status did not have the right to strike on account of their special position vis-à-vis the State.

#### Teachers' salaries (Part X of the Recommendation)

115. The questions concerning teachers' salaries contained in the questionnaire related to policies and practices as regards remuneration (including current pay levels), comparison with remuneration paid for comparable professions in the private sector and in the civil service; and trends in the level of remuneration in relation to trends in the cost of living and the standard of living. Information on the question of salary setting in agreement with teachers' organisations will also be found under the heading of The right of teachers' organisations to participate in the determination of their conditions of employment (see above); on the question of pay for hours worked in excess of the normal maximum under Hours of work (Chapter IV); and on the question of year-round payment under Holidays with pay (Chapter IV).

116. Little information was received concerning policies followed as regards remuneration. Several governments (Argentina, Austria, Finland, Indonesia, Italy, Norway, Papua New Guinea, Peru, Sri Lanka) specifically state that teachers' salaries are set within the framework of the procedure for the setting of public servants' salaries. Japan, Mexico, New Zealand and Tanzania (for certain subjects) state that the setting of teachers' salaries is effected in such a way as to reflect adequately the importance of the profession or to attract and retain sufficiently qualified persons; Israel and Japan state that they are raising the levels of teachers' salaries in order to reflect adequately that importance. Colombia and Thailand, however, state that teachers' salaries do not adequately reflect the importance of the profession.

117. A large number of countries provided information on the criteria used in fixing teachers' salary levels. By far, the most frequently mentioned criteria were the level of academic attainment, education or training (17 countries) and the length of service in the profession (13 countries). Other criteria mentioned were age (Netherlands, Norway); performance (Bulgaria); levels of responsibility (Cuba, Guyana); the level of the school (Philippines); personal conduct and political and social activity (Bulgaria); and the nature of the post occupied (Argentina, Cuba). Some of these criteria may overlap or have been taken for granted by the respondents; thus, for instance, although the nature of the post occupied was specifically referred to as a criterion by two governments only, it is clear from the information on salaries given by several governments (e.g. from the existence of special scales for teachers in special schools) that this factor is also taken into account in the countries concerned.

118. Chile and Kenya referred to merit rating systems; the Canadian Teachers' Federation stated that experiments had been made with merit rating systems in that country but that they had come to grief because of the difficulty of finding objective criteria for measuring merit.

119. A number of countries supplied information on current teachers' salaries. Some provided information which was not susceptible of interpretation (e.g. providing points scales without indicating the value of the point, or providing scales without indicating which categories of teachers were placed on which scales). Some provided no information at all; in this connection, the United States referred to the fact that in that country there are 15,000 education authorities, each with its own salary scale.

120. Table IV contains information on the initial and final salaries of teachers, compared with average earnings in manufacturing industry (the yardstick agreed on by the Committee of Experts in 1979), in 32 countries (or regions within countries). ILO has been able to provide, from various sources, salary figures for some of the countries which supplied none. All the figures given, except where indicated otherwise, were valid at the end of 1980 or the beginning of 1981. The figures of average earnings in manufacturing industry are taken from, or calculated from figures in, the ILO Yearbook of Labour Statistics, 1981, and Bulletin of Labour Statistics, 1982, No. 1 and except where indicated otherwise, relate to 1980 as a whole. Where several categories of teachers exist in primary or secondary schools, what appears to be the most representative category to be found in primary and upper secondary schools respectively has been selected, bearing in mind certain factors of importance for purposes of international comparison (such as the length and level of training). All salaries are monthly and are given in gross terms before taxes and other deductions.

121. The figures for average earnings in manufacturing industry relate to actual earnings and include remuneration for normal working hours, overtime pay, remuneration for time not worked (such as annual and sick leave and public holidays), bonuses and gratuities and cost-of-living allowance.

122. In 15 out of the 32 countries and regions covered by the table (Austria, Bangladesh, Bulgaria, Cyprus, Finland, German Democratic Republic, Hungary, Israel, Japan, Kenya, Nicaragua, Pakistan, Ukrainian SSR, United Kingdom, USSR), primary school teachers at the start of their careers were in 1980 receiving salaries 10 per cent or more less than the average level of earnings in manufacturing industry in the country concerned and that in six of those countries (Bangladesh, German Democratic Republic, Hungary, Israel, Japan and Pakistan) the situation was the same for secondary school teachers.

123. The above statement is subject to some qualifications. First, in many of these countries, scale increments eventually bring teachers' salaries up to levels often well above that of average earnings in manufacturing industry. Secondly, there are countries (such as Argentina (secondary school teachers) and the USSR) in which teachers' salaries are fixed in accordance with the number of hours of teaching work they perform each week; teachers in those countries are able - and in some cases are encouraged - to work additional hours, thus increasing their incomes. In Japan, where the great majority of workers are paid on the basis of salary scales covering long periods, the disparity is less significant than in countries where workers in occupations other than teaching receive few increments or none at all. Lastly, in countries with high rates of inflation, the timing of adjustments to teachers' salaries to the cost of living may not always match that of adjustments of earnings in manufacturing industry and it is not always possible to find figures for exactly matching reference periods.

124. A number of governments provided information on the levels of teachers' salaries in comparison with the remuneration paid in professions requiring equivalent qualifications in the private sector and in the public service. The information given was usually of a general character; only a few governments made specific comparisons.

125. Nineteen countries made comparisons with salary levels in the private sector. Of these, 12 (Cameroon, Colombia, Finland, India, Italy, Jamaica, Kenya, Nicaragua, Spain, Sri Lanka, Thailand and the United States) state that teachers' salaries are lower than those paid to persons with comparable qualifications in private enterprise; two (Bangladesh and Kuwait) state that the two groups of salaries are at comparable levels; and three (Cyprus, Hungary and Malta) state that teachers' salaries are higher. Ontario states that the starting salaries paid to teachers are higher than those paid to graduate entrants to the private sector, but that the actual average salaries of teachers have been consistently lower than those of professional engineers (presumably because the latter have greater opportunities than teachers for salary improvement - in particular through promotion - during the course of their careers). Sweden states that average teachers' salaries are slightly higher than the average level of earnings among white-collar workers.

Table IV: Gross monthly salaries of primary and secondary school teachers compared with average monthly earnings in manufacturing industry, 1980

Country and currency	Primary school teacher		Upper secondary school teacher		Average earnings in manufacturing industry (whole of 1980)*	Remarks
	Initial salary	Final salary	Initial salary	Final salary		
Argentina (pesos)	593 130	.	666 252	.	353 000	Secondary school teacher: for 18 h/w
Australia (dollars) (New South Wales)	1 043	1 544	1 253	1 789	720 (men)	Primary: 2-year trained Secondary: 4-year trained
Austria (schillings)*	9 068	16 648	11 800	34 725	12 495	Primary: grade I2B1 Secondary: grade I1
Bangladesh (takas)	300	540	625	1,315	700 (est.)	
Bulgaria (levas)	135	195	-	-	190	Teachers with post-secondary qualification in all types of schools
Canada (Quebec) (dollars)	1 314	2 057	1 542	2 415	1 366	Primary: 15 years' education Secondary: 17 years' education
Cuba (pesos)	148	171	211	250	150	Secondary: highest level
Cyprus (pounds)	118	325	189	414	141	Some secondary teachers are on same scale as primary teachers
Ecuador (sucres)	6 050	10 585	8 855	15 495	6 620 (Jan.81)	Primary: grade 3 Secondary: grade 7

Table IV (cont.)

Country and currency	Primary school teacher		Upper secondary school teacher		Average earnings in manufacturing industry (whole of 1980)*	Remarks
	Initial salary	Final salary	Initial salary	Final salary		
Finland (markka)	2 679	3 487	3 155	3 844	3 420	Locality allowance (up to 30% of salary) not included
France (francs)*	4 200	6 742	5 076	9 803	3 938	Primary: instituteur adjoint Secondary: professeur certifié Residence allowance included at highest rate
Germany, FR (D-Marks) *	2 557	3 801	2 893	4 236	2 341	Primary: Lehrer, grade A.12 Secondary: Studienrat, grade A.13 Locality allowance at single rate
Germany, DR (Marks)	830	1 297	830	1 397	1 018	Figures include Teachers' Day supplement Secondary: with promotion to Studienrat
Hungary (forints)	2 200	5 800	2 400	6 200	3 821	
Ireland (pounds)	6 380	12 043	7 174	12 837	2 560 (Mar.81)	Primary: with higher diploma in education (hons.) Secondary: same plus first degree with honours Salaries effective 1.6.81
Israel (shekels)	5 445	9 665	6 265	10 740	7 041 (June 81)	Primary: certified teachers Secondary: teachers with MA



Table IV (cont.)

Country and currency	Primary school teacher		Upper secondary school teacher		Average earnings in manufacturing industry (whole of 1980)*	Remarks
	Initial salary	Final salary	Initial salary	Final salary		
Italy (lire)*	898 700	1 275 900	960 400	1 412 300	929 000 (est.)	Figures include 13th month's salary and cost-of-living allowance (436,557 lire per month in June 1981) Final salary figures; after 30 years' service
Japan (yen)	132 316	446 500	145 900	460 700	244 571	Both categories: second class. To take account of periodical bonuses, basic salaries have been increased by the monthly equivalent of 5 months' salary per year.
Kenya (shillings)	885	1 560	2 990	4 040	1 252	Primary: P.3. Secondary: graduate/approved teachers, scale II
Luxembourg (francs)	41 925	95 290	67 025	122 685	42 446	Primary: level E.2. Secondary: level E.7
Malta (pounds)	1 856	2 366	2 179	2 806	.	
Mexico (pesos)	15 000	18 000	21 000	24 000	11 965 (6.81)	Final salaries: after 30 years' service. Secondary: calculation on basis of 30 h/w
Netherlands* (florins)	2 291	3 948	2 712	5 008	2 530	Primary: scale A 3; Secondary: scale 3 F. Scales valued from 1.8.81

Table IV (cont.)

Country and currency	Primary school teacher		Upper secondary school teacher		Average earnings in manufacturing industry (whole of 1980)*	Remarks
	Initial salary	Final salary	Initial salary	Final salary		
Nicaragua (cordobas)	1 650	2 310	2 760	4 000	2 125	Final salaries: after 30 years' service Secondary: calculation on basis of 30 h/w Manufacturing: basis 45 h/w
Norway (crowns)	6 735	8 590	8 225	11 013	5 500	Primary: teacher ( <u>laerer</u> ) with maximum advancement ( <u>opprykk</u> ) Secondary: teacher with final university degree ( <u>lektor</u> )
Pakistan (rupees)	370	640	520	1 010	640 (est.)	Primary: level 8 (certified teacher) Secondary: level 14 (Bachelor of Education)
Spain (pesetas)	60 674	82 894	.	.	46 700 (est.)	Salary figures relate to earnings of teacher in basic general education (EGB) receiving the supplement. Final salary, after 30 years' service. Figures take into account extra payments totalling 3 months' basic salary.

Table IV (concl.)

Country and currency	Primary school teacher		Upper secondary school teacher		Average earnings in manufacturing industry (whole of 1980)*	Remarks
	Initial salary	Final salary	Initial salary	Final salary		
Sweden (crowns)	5 914	8 202	7 208	9 546	4 876	Primary: L.4-7 Secondary: L.12-13 All figures relate to July 1981
Switzerland (Aargau) (francs)	2 931	5 130	5 152	7 407	2 968	
Ukranian SSR (rubles)			up to 145		176.8	Teacher with advanced training and long service taking 18 class hours per week (minimum)
United Kingdom (England and Wales) (pounds)	360.75	567.25	512.5	731.25	481.3 (men)	Primary: scale 1 Secondary: scale 3
USSR (roubles)	.	.	100-145		179.2	Salary of teacher with degree in educational science taking 18 class hours per week (= minimum)

\* Figures provided by the ILO.

. = not available.

- = not applicable.

126. The governments of three countries with centrally planned economies made somewhat similar comparisons. Czechoslovakia states that teachers' salaries are set at the level of the nation-wide average salary; while in the German Democratic Republic teachers' salaries are calculated so as to be equivalent to those of university graduates in industry. Hungary stated that teachers' salaries had lagged behind those payable in other professions for a number of years, but that the gap was narrowed considerably in 1977 by a substantial pay rise for all teachers.

127. Twenty-three governments provided information on the levels of teachers' salaries as compared with those of persons with comparable qualifications employed in the public service. In Bangladesh, Chile, Egypt, Jamaica, New Zealand, Norway, the Philippines, Spain and Venezuela the two groups enjoy comparable salary levels; in Bulgaria, Cameroon, Cyprus, Finland, Japan, Kenya, Malta, Mexico and Papua New Guinea teachers enjoy relatively favourable treatment; while in Colombia, Guyana, Nicaragua, Peru and Sri Lanka they enjoy relatively unfavourable treatment; in Peru teachers are stated to be among the lowest-paid groups of public servants.

128. The Government of Israel links teachers' salaries to those of public service engineers. In contrast, Ireland has abandoned the formal linkage of teachers' salaries with those of executive officers in government on account of the difficulty of establishing satisfactory criteria for purposes of work comparison.

129. The majority of the countries replying stated that some kind of formal arrangements existed to adjust teachers' salaries to upward movements in the cost of living. In most cases reviews of salaries (or of cost-of-living allowances) are effected regularly (at intervals ranging from three months to one year). In Chile and Luxembourg, adjustments are made whenever prices have risen by a given percentage; in Cameroon, Israel, Pakistan, the Philippines and Thailand adjustments are made on an ad hoc basis. In most provinces of Canada and in Ireland, Sweden and Venezuela cost-of-living adjustments are fixed within the collective bargaining process.

130. The replies reveal that in a substantial number of countries (Bangladesh, Colombia, Ecuador, Guyana, India, Jamaica, Netherlands (in recent years), Nicaragua, Peru, Sri Lanka, Sweden and the United States) cost-of-living adjustments have not kept pace with the rise in the cost of living. The Australian Teachers' Federation states that a similar situation exists in Australia. Argentina states that primary school teachers' salaries have increased faster than the cost of living and those of secondary school teachers more slowly. In Guyana and Italy, too, the cost-of-living adjustment system gives fuller protection of purchasing power to primary than to secondary school teachers. The Government of the Netherlands indicates that at present the cost of living is not being fully compensated in teachers' salaries to prevent the latter running ahead of earnings in industry, on which they are indirectly based.

131. Most of the replying countries appear to adjust teachers' salaries to the cost of living by means of adjustments in base salaries; but in India and Italy the replies of the Governments concerned show that separate cost-of-living allowances are paid.

132. The information provided suggests that in some countries the situation with regard to compensation for increases in the cost of living may have changed since 1978, when it was observed in Teachers' Pay\* (p. 102) that "in practically all the countries for which it has been possible to construct a time series, teachers' pay has risen faster - sometimes considerably faster - than the official consumer price index". However, in view of the limited number of countries (14) for which time series were given in the 1978 study, it is difficult to draw any hard and fast conclusions on the subject.

133. A few of the reporting countries adjust teachers' salaries in the light of factors other than the cost of living. Thus, in Tanzania teachers' salaries are adjusted from time to time in accordance with the economic situation in the country; in Ireland teachers receive the benefit of nation-wide tripartite wage agreements. Czechoslovakia states that teachers' salaries are increased from time to time in accordance with the Government's policy of raising living standards.

---

\* Geneva, ILO, 1978.

Social Security (Part XI of the Recommendation)

134. As at 31 December 1981, no ratifications of Convention No. 102 had been registered since the time of writing of Social security for teachers. In addition, the only ratifications of the three Conventions adopted subsequently to Convention No. 102, which fix higher standards than those contained in that Convention in respect of certain of its parts - namely the Employment Injury Benefits Convention, 1964 (No. 121) (relates to the subject-matter of Part VI of Convention No. 102); the Invalidity, Old-Age and Survivors' Benefits Convention, 1967 (No. 128) (Parts V, IX and X) and the Medical Care and Sickness Benefits Convention, 1969 (No. 130) (Part III) - which have been registered since that time and up to 31 December 1981 are those of Denmark and Luxembourg in respect of Convention No. 130. The total numbers of ratifications registered in respect of the four Conventions on 31 December 1981 were: Convention No. 102 (total and partial), 29; Convention No. 121, 17; Convention No. 128, 13; Convention No. 130, 12.

135. The questionnaire sought information on changes in the situation regarding the application of Part XI of the Recommendation since its previous report with regard to the risks against which teachers are protected, the level of protection granted to teachers and the methods by which the protection of teachers is ensured.

136. Twenty-five of the governments which replied to this question stated that all teachers were covered by the general social insurance or social security system of their respective countries - in other words, they enjoy the same level of protection as workers generally. (This group includes both countries in which there are private schools and countries in which there are none.)

137. In a number of countries, however, teachers in the public and private sectors of education are treated in different ways. In Colombia, France, Italy, Luxembourg, Madagascar, Malta, Mexico, the Netherlands, Peru and the Philippines teachers in the public sector are covered by special schemes for public servants - the benefits provided by which, as observed by the Committee in 1976 (Report, para. 168), tend to be superior to those provided for workers in general, whereas teachers in private schools are affiliated to general schemes. In Austria, the Federal Republic of Germany and Spain teachers in public schools who do not have public servant status, as well as teachers in private schools, are required to join the general scheme. In several countries teachers in the public sector enjoy a measure of social security coverage, while teachers in private schools are not subject to any form of compulsory social security or insurance; these countries include Chile (where social insurance for private school teachers is voluntary), Indonesia (where the social protection of teachers in private schools is left to the discretion of their employers) and Jordan and Pakistan (where no social security provision appears to exist for private school teachers). In some countries public school teachers, although covered by the general scheme, have access, on account of their status as public servants, to social protection schemes which are closed to private school teachers. Thus, in Finland and Norway public school teachers receive benefits from both the general scheme and the special schemes for public servants; in Bangladesh they have access to group insurance schemes; and in India, some states operate welfare funds to assist teachers in public schools in cases of hardship. Jamaica has a special superannuation scheme for teachers only.

138. As regards the contingencies covered, it appears that in at least 16 of the countries which provided information on the subject (Australia, Austria, Chile, Finland, France, Federal Republic of Germany, Hungary, Ireland, Italy, Luxembourg, Netherlands, New Zealand, Norway, Spain, Sweden, United Kingdom) teachers are protected by social security measures in respect of all the contingencies referred to in Convention No. 102. Hungary is included in the list because it has a scheme which pays allowances to persons who cannot find suitable jobs - which may be considered as a kind of unemployment insurance. The other European countries with centrally planned economies which replied to the questionnaire provide coverage against all the contingencies mentioned in the Convention save that of unemployment.

139. The contingencies against which teachers are covered in the greatest number of countries are those of sickness and old age. The contingencies against which teachers are least frequently covered are those of unemployment and family benefits; however, in most of the countries where teachers are not covered against these contingencies, there is no provision for the coverage of workers generally.

140. One or two countries make provision for coverage against contingencies not specifically referred to in Convention No. 102. Thus, in the Netherlands and the United Kingdom, provision exists for the payment of redundancy benefits in addition to normal unemployment benefit entitlements; while in Canada (Alberta), school boards insure their teachers against civil liability in respect of actions committed during the course of their employment.

141. Since the questions put were extremely general in character, little information emerged concerning the levels of protection with regard to individual contingencies; many governments which replied on this subject confined themselves to indicating which contingencies were covered without going into details. The main field in which substantive information emerged was that of levels of old-age benefit for teachers in the public sector. In several countries which provided information on the subject, the amount of the pension payable after a qualifying period of 25 or 30 years' service substantially exceeded the minimum of 40 per cent of previous earnings stipulated in Convention No. 102. Luxembourg pays five-sixths of final salary, and Sweden 75-80 per cent, after 30 years' service; Venezuela pays 80 per cent after 25 years. In Italy, after 40 years' service a teacher may retire at age 65 with 94.4 per cent of final gross salary. Colombia pays up to 75 per cent of final gross salary and allowances. The last two countries mentioned allow teachers wishing to do so to go on working for a period beyond the normal retiring age to bring their pension entitlements up to, or nearer to, the permissible maximum. Mexico and Nicaragua both pay up to 100 per cent of previous earnings, but averaged over the last three years in the former case and the last five in the latter.

142. In Jamaica, payment of the pension ceases if the recipient is declared bankrupt, or sentenced to a term of imprisonment, by a competent court of law.

CHAPTER II

APPLICATION OF THE RECOMMENDATION TO  
TEACHERS IN PRIVATE ESTABLISHMENTS

143. Paragraph 2 of the Recommendation states that it "applies to all teachers both in public and private schools". Although the two previous questionnaires sent to governments (1969, 1975) drew attention to the fact that information was required on the application of the Recommendation to both categories of teachers, the bulk of the replies dealt mainly or exclusively with teachers in the public sector. At its third session (1976) the Joint Committee concluded that appropriate measures should be taken in the next enquiry "to ensure that the information gathered covered the private as well as the public sector".

144. In conformity with this wish, the third questionnaire on the application of the Recommendation includes a section dealing exclusively with the staff of private establishments. It contains questions to elicit information on the following points: the official definitions of private education; statistics on the number of private establishments, pupils and teachers and on the proportion they represent in relation to the total number of establishments, pupils and teachers in the country; information as to the categories and working methods of these teachers; teacher-preparation programmes and further education; entry into the profession, advancement and security of tenure; professional freedom, rights and responsibilities; the conditions for effective teaching and learning in private schools; and salaries and social security for teachers in private establishments.

145. The following governments stated that private schools did not exist in their countries: Bulgaria, Byelorussian SSR, Czechoslovakia, German Democratic Republic, Iraq, Sierra Leone, Ukrainian SSR, and USSR. The following countries did not supply any information on this matter: Colombia, Cuba, Denmark, Gabon, Guyana, Spain, Switzerland and Tanzania. Others provided general information on private education in their countries, but did not indicate the number of teachers in private schools: India, Kenya, Nicaragua, Norway, Pakistan, Philippines, and Sweden. On the other hand, a number of governments stressed the valuable contribution made by private establishments to the development of their education systems: Bangladesh, New Zealand, Norway and Sweden. In Pakistan, the new educational policy encourages the creation of private schools.

Definition of "private education"

146. In the definitions given in the legislation of the different countries, reference is frequently made, either directly or implicitly, to three factors: (a) private education is a non-governmental sector, a fact which is made explicit in the role played by individuals or corporate bodies - as defined by private law - in establishing and maintaining private schools (Egypt, France, Kuwait, Netherlands, Peru, Thailand); (b) they are financially independent of public funds. This independence does not however preclude agreements between private establishments and the authorities. Under the terms of these agreements, private establishments receive grants and have to adopt the curricula and general regulations applicable in the state education system (Argentina, Australia, Barbados, Canada, Egypt, France, India, Jordan, Quebec, Scotland). On the other hand, implicit in the definition of private education given by the United Kingdom is the complete exclusion of grants from local or national authorities to private schools; (c) they are autonomous with regard to their administration and organisation. Such autonomy might take the form of choosing their educational philosophy and having the right and duty to draw up rules. In general, however, these establishments adopt the curricula approved by the national authorities. As a general rule, the governments of countries in which private schools are to be found control those schools to a greater or lesser extent. While some countries give private schools a free hand to adopt the curricula of their choice (New Zealand, Netherlands), others require that their curricula and administrative regulations should follow the state education system to the letter (Argentina, Nicaragua, Philippines).

The proportion of teachers in private establishments compared to the total number of teachers

147. On the basis of information supplied by the governments in reply to this questionnaire and to other questionnaires sent out by the Statistics Department of UNESCO, Table 4 shows the total number of teachers in private establishments and the percentage they represent in relation to the total number of teachers currently working in pre-primary, primary and general secondary education in a number of countries. A brief study of the table shows that teachers in private schools play a not inconsiderable part in the educational activities of a number of countries, their role taking on considerable importance in pre-primary and secondary education.

The specific features of private establishments and of their teaching staff

148. The answers to question 3 of the questionnaire are extremely varied, probably as a result of the general nature of the question. The main points in the replies deal with the specific nature of private establishments and the special status of teachers in the private sector.

149. A large number of replies state that the organisation of private education and the categories and status of the teachers are practically identical to those prevailing in the state system (Argentina, Federal Republic of Germany, Finland, France, India, New Zealand, Nicaragua, Norway, Sweden). Although details are not always provided, these schools are no doubt in many cases grant-aided by the public authorities and in return follow the state system with regard to curricula, staff, premises and equipment (Finland, Nicaragua, Norway, Sweden).

150. In the Federal Republic of Germany, teachers in private schools may join the same organisations as state school teachers, and in addition both groups have the same social background and receive the same training. It is no doubt their committed attitude to the specific aims of their schools that makes the teachers in private schools different. In Argentina, teachers in private schools are not bound by the regulations that apply to the state system. In India, recognised but unsubsidised schools usually have a salary scale inferior to that of state education. In France there are two categories of private schools - "unlicensed" establishments which are virtually free from all restrictions, receive no state grants and are subject only to inspection of their premises by health officers and to examination of the teachers' qualifications; and the "licensed" schools which make up 90 per cent of the private establishments and have to adopt the curricula and general regulations as regards timetables that are applicable in state education. They have a free hand in the choice of teaching methods.

151. The degree of government control over grant-aided schools varies considerably. In Bangladesh, the Government has a representative on the board of governors of each private school. In Australia, there are governmental bodies in each state to see that the instructions of the Ministry of Education are complied with. In fact, if private schools abide by the minimum standards imposed upon them, the Government does not intervene in their affairs and they then become entitled to grants for capital expenditure and running costs from the state or from the Australian Federal Government. On the other hand, in the United States, very varied forms of organisation and curricula are allowed in private schools provided their educational level meets the minimum standards laid down. Unsubsidised private establishments are as a general rule not required to keep to the standards enforced in the state education system. It would appear that these establishments do not maintain regular contact with national education authorities, and a number of countries do not appear to know how such institutions are run (United Kingdom). In general these schools employ a high proportion of unqualified teachers (Malta, Peru, Scotland, Sri Lanka) and their salaries are generally lower than those of teachers in the state sector. In several countries a large number of the teachers in these schools work part time (Austria, Ontario-Canada, Tunisia).

152. In some countries, teachers in private schools are considered as forming a professional category in the private sector, and as such are entitled to set up trade unions empowered to enter into collective agreements with employers (Austria, Japan, Kuwait, Luxembourg).



153. It might be added that in several countries, private schools are owned by different ideological groups. In Malta, for instance, most of these schools are run by religious orders, and non-religious schools are in the minority. In Cameroon, the private education sector includes Catholic, Protestant, Islamic and lay "Commissions". The replies of Nicaragua and Pakistan should be mentioned in connection with trends in the development of private education. In Nicaragua the number of private schools has dropped considerably since the new regime came into power and introduced free state education at secondary and university levels. In Pakistan, between 1974 and 1978, the number of private primary schools dropped by two thirds, and the number of secondary schools was halved. However, the current policy of the Government encourages the creation of private schools.

Table V: Teaching staff: total, total in private education and percentage of teachers in private schools (last available year)

	Pre-primary			Primary			General secondary					
	Year	Total	Private %	Year	Total	Private %	Year	Total	Private %			
<u>AFRICA</u>												
Cameroon	1979	1 295	405	31.3	1979	25 289	8 988	35.5	1979	5 602	-	40.2
Egypt	1979	1 790	-	-	1980	167 821	7 381	4.4	1980	83 364	5 300	6.4
Gabon					1980	3 441	1 342	39.0	1980	1 034	418	40.4
Mauritius	1980	453	453	100.0	1979	6 373	1 371	21.5	1979 <sup>9</sup>	3 042	2 635	86.6
Tanzania					1979	77 329	235	0.3				
Tunisia					1980	27 375	270	1.0				
<u>NORTH AMERICA</u>												
Barbados	1980	151 <sup>2</sup>			1978	1 261		8.5				18.0
Jamaica	1976	3 454	3 005	87.0	1978	9 889						
Nicaragua	1980	924	376	40.7	1980	13 318	1 726	13.0	1978	2 720	1 317	48.4
United States					1980 <sup>4</sup>	1 324 000	180 000	13.6	1980	1 089 000	91 000	8.4
<u>SOUTH AMERICA</u>												
Argentina	1981	25 409	8 280	32.6	1981	200 388	36 271	18.1	1981	77 956	27 117	34.8
Colombia	1980	9 126	3 819	41.8	1980	136 381	22 423	16.4	1977	56 402	32 069	56.8
Ecuador	1979	1 390			1978	38 749	7 118	18.4	1978	24 030	8 669	36.1
Peru	1979	6 093	2 101	34.5	1977	79 193	12 277	15.5	1977	40 616	8 467	20.8
Uruguay	1980	1 001 <sup>1</sup>			1980	14 768	2 193	14.8				
Venezuela	1979	9 606	2 015	20.5	1979	88 493	11 510	13.0				
<u>ASIA</u>												
Bangladesh					1981	188 234	31 211	16.6	1981	85 067	81 196	95.5
Cyprus	1979	464 <sup>5</sup>	169	36.4	1980	2 193 <sup>6</sup>	71	3.2	1980	2 449 <sup>10</sup>		10.1
Indonesia	1980	37 100	36 845	99.3	1980	787 400	191 171	24.3	1980	261 864 <sup>11</sup>	155 219	59.3
Japan	1979	109 328	76 347	69.8	1980	470 991 <sup>2</sup>	3 241	0.7	1980	554 078	87 904	15.9
Jordan	1980	737	727	98.6	1980	14 303 <sup>7</sup>	3 509	24.5	1980	11 999	1 867	15.6

Table V: Teaching staff: total, total in private education and percentage of teachers in private schools (last available year) (cont.)

	Pre-primary			Primary			General secondary					
	Year	Total	Private %	Year	Total	Private %	Year	Total	Private %			
<u>ASIA (cont.)</u>												
Kuwait	1979	1 569	341	21.7	1981	8 035	1 099	13.7	1980	15 257	1 797	11.8
Saudi Arabia	1980	1 127			1980	50 511	1 262	2.5	1980	24 256	650	2.7
Thailand					1980	304 400			1980	71 446	48 594	68.0
<u>EUROPE</u>												
Austria	1980	7 258	2 020	27.8	1980	27 525	736	2.7	1980	47 841	2 790	5.8
France	1978	75 890	10 000	14.0	1979	232 405	28 000		1979	304 519	71 291	23.4
Germany, Fed. Rep.					1980	273 556	3 129	1.1	1980	237 656	23 136	9.7
Greece	1978	5 821	573	9.8	1978	35 750 <sup>5</sup>			1978	26 921	1 063	3.9
Ireland	1980	4 782	169	3.5	1980	14 636	725	5.0				
Malta	1979	431	198	45.9	1979	1 567	436	27.8	1979	1 751	447	25.2
Netherlands	1980	22 361	15 271	68.3	1980	57 536	38 615	67.1	1980	54 369		
Spain	1979	34 188	15 535	45.4	1979	205 550	76 832	37.4	1979	63 645	25 508	40.1
<u>OCEANIA</u>												
Australia					1980	91 280 <sup>8</sup>	16 582	18.2	1980	85 340	18 832	22.1
New Zealand	1978	1 094			1980	22 658 <sup>2</sup>	1 802	8.0	1980	13 278 <sup>12</sup>	1 356	10.2
Papua New Guinea	1978	34	19	55.9	1981	9 935			1981	1 625		

Table V: Teaching staff: total, total in private education and percentage of teachers in private schools (last available year) (cont.)

Pre-primary

<sup>1</sup> Data refer to public education only.

<sup>2</sup> Data include special education.

<sup>3</sup> Not including Turkish schools.

Primary

<sup>4</sup> Data include pre-primary education.

<sup>5</sup> Data include evening schools.

<sup>6</sup> Not including Turkish schools.

<sup>7</sup> East bank only.

<sup>8</sup> Including pre-primary classes, upgrades, special and correspondence courses.

Secondary

<sup>9</sup> Data do not include Rodriguez city.

<sup>10</sup> Not including Turkish schools.

<sup>11</sup> Not including religious schools.

<sup>12</sup> Not including teachers from forms I and II.

Entry into the profession, advancement and promotion, security of tenure and disciplinary procedures (paragraphs 39-52)

154. Of the governments which provided information on these points, a substantial number stated that all were matters of concern solely for the managements of the schools concerned (or, in the cases of Hungary and Madagascar, for the religious authorities responsible for the schools). The majority of these governments stated that the terms and conditions of employment of teachers in private schools were either laid down unilaterally by each school management or (which in practice may not be very different) determined by individual negotiation between each teacher and the school employing him. Only a few governments (Canada (Quebec), Federal Republic of Germany, Italy, Luxembourg) specifically referred to negotiations between private school authorities and teachers' organisations on the subject of conditions of employment; these replies make specific reference to collective agreements.

155. However, the discretionary powers of private school managements appear to be limited in a number of countries by various factors. Thus, Argentina, Austria, Chile, Cyprus, Finland, Malta, Mauritius, Mexico and Spain all state that private school teachers enjoy all the safeguards offered by general labour legislation. Some governments (Cyprus, Federal Republic of Germany) impose minimum levels of conditions of employment for teachers in private schools as a condition of government recognition or approval; others (Barbados, Austria, Norway, France) impose such standards as a condition of providing state aid. Finally, some countries - Canada (Alberta), Finland, France (in private schools "under contract"), India, Kenya, Kuwait, the Netherlands and New Zealand - stated that the conditions of employment of teachers in private establishments (at least, those recognised by the government concerned) are the same, or substantially the same, as those of teachers in public schools, although they are governed by private law. In some private schools in Austria, France, Indonesia and Jordan teachers from the public sector sometimes work in private schools alongside the private sector teachers.

156. Little information was provided specifically on the subject of promotion. Argentina states that the matter is dealt with in general labour legislation; most of the other countries which refer specifically to the subject state that promotion is at the discretion of school managements.

157. On the subject of security of tenure, too, few countries provided specific information; but the information given by those which did suggested that the security of tenure of teachers in private establishments was less than that of public sector teachers. In Chile, Sri Lanka and Venezuela (as well as in the countries mentioned in paragraph 155), the subject is dealt with by general labour legislation. In Australia only four weeks' notice need be given. In Canada (Quebec) there appears to be no security of employment. In Finland and Italy a private school teacher may be dismissed in the event of a major reduction in the number of pupils in the school concerned. In Colombia a competent teacher in a school with a good reputation may enjoy reasonable security of employment; but in the smaller, less well-known schools security of employment is low.

158. Disciplinary procedures also seem to be a matter for individual school managements, subject to any safeguards which general labour legislation may offer. There are also a few countries in which the disciplinary procedures applicable to public school teachers are also applicable to teachers in private schools. The case of Canada - where in most provinces disciplinary authority is exercised in both public and private schools by the teachers' union - also deserves mention here.

Teachers with family responsibilities and part-time service (paragraphs 54-60)

159. Relatively little information was supplied, in the replies on this subject, specifically relating to the provisions of the Recommendation contained in paragraphs 54-60. Many governments confined themselves to stating that women enjoyed the same conditions of employment as men, or that discrimination in conditions of employment on grounds of sex was prohibited.

160. Two Governments (Finland and Mauritius) stated that the provisions of paragraphs 54-60 were fully applied as far as private school teachers were concerned. Argentina, Barbados, Chile, Colombia, France, the Federal Republic of Germany (in respect of "replacement" schools), Japan and Sweden stated that women teachers with family responsibilities in private schools enjoyed the same safeguards as those in public schools.

161. As regards the specific points made in paragraphs 54-58, Malta, New Zealand and Pakistan state that marriage is not a bar to the appointment or continued employment of women teachers. Chile states that crèches and nurseries are available to take care of the children of women teachers with family responsibilities. Bangladesh and the Philippines state that they endeavour to arrange for married couples to teach in the locality of their homes or in the same locality. India states that certain age restrictions on entry into the profession are relaxed for women with family responsibilities.

162. A few countries provided information on the subject of part-time employment in private schools. The Government of the Netherlands is endeavouring to promote part-time working and to eliminate existing differences of status and conditions of employment between part-time and full-time teachers. France and Indonesia state that part-time teachers in private schools enjoy the same conditions as those in public schools. Canada (Alberta), Chile, Italy, Japan, Kuwait and Luxembourg all state that private school teachers enjoy proportionately the same conditions of employment as teachers working on a full-time basis.

163. In Jordan and the Philippines, teachers in public schools are sometimes authorised to teach part time in private schools outside their normal working hours.

164. The question of social security protection (paragraph 60(c)) is dealt with in Chapter I.

Professional freedom, the responsibilities  
of teachers, relations between the education  
service as a whole, and the rights of teachers  
(Part VIII)

165. Thirty-two of the replies received contained information of substance concerning the application of this part of the Recommendation in private establishments, and none provided a detailed analysis of the position. Among the other replies, those of Canada (Ontario and Quebec), Papua New Guinea, Scotland and the United States indicate that no centrally held information on the subject is available; Barbados, New Zealand and England and Wales state that all the matters referred to are dealt with by or within each individual school.

166. Canada (Alberta), Finland and Mauritius state that all the provisions of this part of the Recommendation are applied to teachers in private establishments. Finland, France, Japan, the Netherlands, Nicaragua, Spain all state that the situation of private school teachers with regard to this part of the Recommendation is the same as that of public school teachers; India states that private school teachers enjoy the same academic freedoms and rights and responsibilities as public school teachers; Argentina, Chile and Tunisia state that the rights and responsibilities of the two groups are the same. Ecuador, Madagascar, Mexico, Spain, Sri Lanka and Venezuela state that private school teachers have the same rights as workers generally.

167. The following information was provided relating to specific sections or paragraphs in this part of the Recommendation.

168. On paragraph 61, Cyprus, the Philippines and Venezuela state that teachers have the freedom to choose their own teaching methods and pupil aids; Egypt, Malta, Peru and Sri Lanka allow the same freedoms, but specify that they are to be exercised within the framework of the officially approved programme. Italy refers to constraints arising from the policy of the school authority; similar constraints appear to exist in private schools in France.

169. On paragraph 67, Sri Lanka states that teachers are protected from unwarranted interference or criticism by parents.

170. On paragraph 74, Sri Lanka states that teachers participate in extra-curricular activity.

171. On paragraphs 75 and 76, Australia (Queensland) states that the principle of teacher collaboration in curriculum development and assessment is well established. In Indonesia, teachers participate with the school owners and with parents in the development of the schools they are employed in.

172. On paragraph 80, Australia (Queensland) indicates that teachers are entitled to participate in political and social processes, but that they must in practice be wary of publicly exhibiting their political or social views. Bangladesh states that private school teachers enjoy full civil rights. In Italy, if a private school teacher is elected to public office, he is placed on leave without pay, and his seniority rights continue to accrue during his term of office; in Mexico the teacher's contract of employment is suspended.

173. On paragraphs 82 and 83, in Austria, the Federal Republic of Germany, Italy, Luxembourg and Sweden, the conditions of employment of teachers in private schools are regulated by collective agreements. References to negotiations or consultations on salaries and/or other conditions of employment are to be found in the replies from Australia (Queensland), Bangladesh, New Zealand and Pakistan. Papua New Guinea states that teachers' organisations have no say in the determination of conditions of employment.

174. Lastly, on paragraph 84, Luxembourg has a "staff delegation" in every private school, the functions of which include the settlement of disputes between an individual teacher and his employer.

#### Conditions for effective teaching and learning (Part IX)

175. No government attempted to provide a full survey of the position in private schools with regard to the application of each of the 29 paragraphs in Part IX of the Recommendation. A number provided no information at all or information of such a general character as to be of little value in evaluating the application of Part IX in private schools in the countries concerned; others referred to their general replies concerning Part IX (in which, however, it is not always possible to distinguish whether the information given applies to both public and private schools or to public schools only).

176. However, some governments provided information on the application of individual paragraphs to teachers in private establishments.

177. On paragraph 86, Scotland states that classes in private schools are usually significantly smaller than in public schools. In contrast, Colombia states that the demand for education has led to an increase in class sizes to levels such that it is extremely difficult to give pupils individual attention. Venezuela states that excessively large sizes are reported in individual schools.

178. On the subject of paragraph 88, Ecuador states that most private schools are equipped with audio-visual aids.

179. In connection with paragraph 91, Tunisia draws attention to the fact that in that country public in-service training courses are open to teachers in private schools, and that that system enables a number of private school teachers to transfer to the public sector each year.

180. On the subject of paragraph 101, Australia (Queensland) states that, when a private school teacher transfers from one school to another, accumulated sick-leave and long-service-leave rights, and even pension rights, cannot be transferred.

181. Mauritius states that the situation regarding the different points covered by Part IX is in conformity with the Recommendation. Canada (Alberta and, with regard to holidays with pay, Ontario), Finland and France state that the situation in private schools is similar to that in public schools.

#### Teachers' salaries (Part X)

182. Only a few of the countries which supplied information on this point gave any indication of the methods by which salaries in private schools are set. The general impression gained from these replies is that, as a rule, salaries are set separately in each school, subject to any guidelines or standards laid down in any legislation or collective agreements applicable. Chile, Egypt, the Federal Republic of Germany, Japan, New Zealand, Pakistan (in some schools) and the Philippines state that salaries in private schools are negotiated between school owners and teachers' organisations; Italy, Luxembourg, Spain and Sweden make specific reference to

collective agreements on the subject, while in Jordan private school teachers are "associated" with salary setting. Canada (Quebec) observes that salaries tend to be closest to public-sector levels in private schools in which the teachers' unions are most strongly represented.

183. Two cases of salary setting by government action are mentioned in the replies. In Mexico, the minimum salaries of private school teachers are set by a national wages board (but in practice, salaries are much higher). In Kuwait, the competent authorities hold meetings with the owners of private schools to determine the salaries of teachers in those schools.

184. Several countries indicate that private school teachers' salaries vary considerably from school to school. The replies from Canada (Alberta), Madagascar and Peru contain statements to this effect; evidence that a similar situation exists in other countries is to be found in statements such as that in the reply from Indonesia, to the effect that in some private schools, teachers are better paid than in the public sector, while in others the opposite is the case.

185. A number of governments (Australia (Queensland), Colombia, Egypt, Finland, Japan, Kenya, Malta, the Netherlands, New Zealand, the Philippines and Sri Lanka) state that the salaries of teachers in private schools are equal to or comparable with those of teachers in public schools; in Argentina, the situation is the same in most private schools, while in England and Wales, a number of private schools use the salary scales applicable in public-sector schools. Several other governments (Chile, France, Federal Republic of Germany, India, New Zealand and Norway) state that the salaries of teachers in private schools receiving financial aid from the State are the same as, or comparable to, those of teachers in public schools; in some cases, this appears to be a condition for the receipt of state support. Austria requires that public school teachers employed in private schools should receive the same salaries and allowances as teachers in the public sector, but there is no such provision applying to the other teachers in private schools.

186. Several governments reported that the salaries of private school teachers fall short of those of public school teachers. This is stated to be the case in Colombia; in the majority of schools in Cyprus; in non-State-aided schools in India; in denominational schools in Italy; and in Venezuela (where the private sector is endeavouring to bring the salaries it pays its teachers up to the levels of those paid in the public sector). In Bangladesh, however, private school teachers' salaries appear to fall short of those in government schools even though the Government pays half of their salaries (but a national pay scale is being drawn up in consultation with the teachers' organisation). Some governments were able to make approximate estimates of the general level of the shortfall; thus, Mexico estimates it at 30-35 per cent and the United States at 10-20 per cent.

187. Ability to pay appears to be a significant factor in a number of cases. Barbados states that private schools apply public school salary scales where means allow. Canada (Quebec), Indonesia and Pakistan also refer specifically to this factor.

188. The Government of Madagascar states that in some private schools, teachers are paid part or all of their salaries in kind.

#### Social security (Part XI)

189. Out of the 38 replies which contained information on the subject, 34 state that private school teachers enjoy social security coverage. They are stated to enjoy the same social security coverage as teachers in public schools (usually under a general scheme applicable to all workers or all residents) in Argentina, Austria, Barbados, Canada (Alberta and Quebec), Cyprus (except for medical care), Ecuador, Egypt, Finland, Federal Republic of Germany, India (some States), Japan, Kenya, Malta, the Netherlands, New Zealand, Nicaragua and the United Kingdom; while in Chile, Colombia, France, Italy, Kuwait, Luxembourg, Madagascar, Mexico, Norway, Peru, the Philippines, Spain, Sri Lanka, Sweden and Venezuela, private school teachers are affiliated to the general social security scheme, whereas teachers in public schools belong to separate schemes or to schemes for public servants generally (which, where specific information is available, appear to be more generous in some respects). In the United States, private school teachers are required to affiliate to social security schemes. Only Bangladesh, Jordan and Pakistan state that private school teachers are not covered by social security; in Indonesia, social protection is at the discretion of the owner of the school concerned.



Self-employed teachers

190. Twenty-two replies touched on this subject. None of them provided a detailed survey of the condition of self-employed teachers. Jordan, Kenya and Luxembourg say that they have none. Japan says that they are not normally encountered; Argentina, Bangladesh, India and Peru have a few; there are large numbers in Sri Lanka. In Cyprus, many of them are on the waiting lists for places in public schools. In Indonesia, teachers are not allowed to run schools. In Bangladesh, Cyprus and Ecuador, teachers sometimes join together to open a school. Apart from these cases, self-employed teachers appear to give classes to individuals or groups, negotiating fees with parents.

191. As regards legal status, Canada (Quebec), Chile, France and the Netherlands do not subject self-employed teachers to any special legislation or control. In Nicaragua, they are subject to the supervision of the education authorities and must secure official recognition of the diplomas they issue. In Italy, they are required to register with the authorities, give proof of possession of the necessary qualifications and be members of a mutual-aid fund.

192. Peru and the Philippines mention that many teachers give private lessons, or undertake small projects, after school hours to augment their incomes.

CHAPTER III

APPLICATION OF THE RECOMMENDATION IN THE LIGHT OF  
CHANGES IN EDUCATIONAL SYSTEMS

Educational planning and new trends in education  
(paragraph 10(d) to (1))

193. Paragraph 10(d-1) of the Recommendation sets out a series of principles relating to the planning of education and training of teaching staff in adequate numbers, co-ordination between the various branches of the teaching service, the participation of teachers' organisations, organisations of employers and workers and cultural organisations in the definition of educational policy and its objectives, and the setting aside of an adequate proportion of the national income for the development of education. The questionnaire is based on these provisions of the Recommendation and covers in essence the following topics: (a) forecasts of the educational needs of the country, especially with regard to the training of a sufficient number of qualified teachers for the various types of teaching; (b) the involvement of teachers' organisations in educational planning and their contribution to the definition of educational policy; (c) possible difficulties in implementing plans for education, particularly with regard to the recruitment of teachers; (d) co-ordination of the training of the various branches of the teaching service; (e) links between technical and general education; (f) other measures affecting the training and responsibilities of teachers.

Forecasts of national requirements with  
a view to training a sufficient number  
of qualified teachers for the various  
types of education

194. Only four countries claim to have no procedure for forecasting the number of teachers required. These are the United States (which trusts to the free play of supply and demand); the Netherlands (where the Ministry of Education none the less has the right to limit the number of students in certain fields of study); Japan; and Peru. It should be noted first of all that these countries have a high level of school enrolment which makes any over-all expansion of the education system unnecessary.

195. In the US, no over-all planning exists and no entry and exist quotas are assigned for teacher education. Statistics are collected but no attempts are made to enforce, by law, any compliance with priorities which may be apparent in the years ahead. Reliance is placed on the free market principle. This, however, implies the existence of ample public information on future needs and their influence on college enrolment. Hence the need for specific research work and wide distribution of results. State expenditure to meet educational needs varies widely. The difference in expenditures per pupil in certain districts of the same state may be as wide as 5:1. There now exists a court order to equalise such disparities among school districts. Money incentives are given to train teachers in certain areas - teachers for the handicapped (state and federal) and teachers for the disadvantaged (federal training programme).

196. In the Netherlands, no manpower planning exists in the educational sector. However, besides the numerus clausus which the Ministry can institute for training courses for state schools, there are rulings for the number of established posts for new teacher training courses. The Japanese believe that they have stabilised the supply of teachers by setting up teacher training colleges in each provincial capital, together with conventional university departments and colleges. Measures are being taken, however, to adapt this supply to the educational needs identified in specific fields. Thus at the present time, provision is being made for expansion of the training colleges in order to give a slight increase (7 per cent) in the number of primary teachers, a significant increase in pre-school teachers (up to three times the present number) and an increase of up to 2 1/2 times in the number of teachers for the handicapped. Peru did not provide any further information on this topic and stated that the Ministry of Education is responsible for co-ordinating teacher training in national institutions, except for universities.

197. The following countries have an educational planning system that forms an integral part of national economic and social planning, both in the short and in the medium-term (usually 1-5 years): Cameroon, Cuba, Czechoslovakia, Federal Republic

of Germany, Israel, Tanzania, Thailand and USSR. In Cuba, Czechoslovakia and USSR, educational policy is defined by the Party's Central Committee. Educational personnel in the schools and other educational establishments are consulted and express their opinions on the draft documents before they are officially approved. In Israel, educational planning is carried out within the context of a complex system for determining policy and adopting resolutions. This involves the action of government institutions, appropriate sections of the Ministry of Education, as well as advice from various research and advisory institutions. In Tanzania, educational planning is an integral part of the long-term plan (1981-2000), which provides for universal primary education, to give one example.

198. A larger number of countries have set up a specialised body, usually within the Ministry of Education, which uses studies and statistics to forecast how many teachers of different kinds are needed and what qualifications they should have. This is true of Australia, Canada (Quebec), Ecuador, France, Gabon, German Democratic Republic, Luxembourg, Nicaragua, New Zealand, Sweden, Spain, Tunisia, Ukraine, United Kingdom and Venezuela.

199. Several countries said that their planning procedures were decentralised and led from the local and provincial level up to the national level (Australia, Bulgaria and Indonesia). This is true in communist countries where the teachers themselves are consulted. In this connection, Bulgaria speaks of the planning activities of local councils, which take into account the population of pre-school and school age in the various districts of towns and cities. Their activities are taken up and completed by the regional and central bodies responsible for planning the national school network having regard to class sizes and the number of teachers required.

200. In Australia, educational planning is based on work carried out at national, state and local levels by appropriate working committees at each level. They make available to state and national authorities, for policy decision, the results of their inquiries into education, training and employment.

201. Some countries give no information about their planning procedures but simply state that they have adequate ways of ensuring a sufficient number of teachers: India, Jordan, Kenya, Malta, Pakistan, Philippines and United Kingdom (Scotland). Finally, some countries referred to current or planned reforms to increase the number and improve the qualifications of teachers: Bangladesh (training of primary-school teachers) and Byelorussia (improving recruitment of teachers for pre-school education), while others stressed the priorities imposed by the need for the democratisation of education: Guyana and Tanzania.

Participation of teachers' organisations  
in educational planning and their contri-  
bution to the definition of educational  
policy

202. Forty-three countries stated that their teachers' organisations can participate in varying degrees in educational planning and can contribute to the framing of educational policy. On the other hand, in the countries listed below, such organisations are not involved in educational planning: Argentina, Gabon, Jordan, Luxembourg, Peru, Spain and Tanzania. Nevertheless, in Argentina, teachers' organisations can make observations, and in Spain they are able to take part in specialised meetings relating to planning. In other instances, the way in which the teachers' organisations are consulted by the educational authorities does not seem to take into account the autonomy of those organisations. In Japan, for example, only individual teachers appointed by the authorities may sit on the committees set up by authorities, and then in a personal capacity. Similarly, in Thailand, the authorities designate which teachers they want to sit on a Consultative Committee. In the Philippines, instead of consulting the organisations representing the teachers, the Government consults two individual associations, one of which represents administrative staff (Association of School Superintendants) while the other represents technical and vocational teachers.

203. Although consultations between teachers' organisations are usually held at national level at the Ministry of Education, several countries stated that these organisations are also active at provincial or regional level or even in the context of a town (Byelorussia) or a school (Netherlands, Quebec). The part played regionally by the organisations was also referred to by Bulgaria, Cameroon, German Democratic Republic, Nicaragua and the United States.

204. None of the government statements on constructive roles played by the teachers' organisations in educational planning and the framing of educational policy is explicit enough for the effectiveness of that role to be evaluated. None the less, some information would seem to suggest that, in a number of countries, the organisations are particularly well placed to make their voice heard. This is true of the organisations that are full members of the official bodies set up by the authorities at the highest level, as in the case of the consultative councils on education in India and Malta; the Consultative Council on the recruitment and training of teachers (United Kingdom); and the commission for the planning of the teaching profession (Sweden). In Finland and Norway, the teachers' organisations sit on similar official bodies. In Nicaragua, a joint committee has been set up by the teachers' association and the government to organise consultations between teaching staff and the regional authorities. In Ecuador, the National Union of Teachers participates in the selection of applicants for teaching posts in primary and secondary schools. In the United States and Venezuela, the teachers' organisations have concluded various collective bargaining agreements with the authorities, which provide for compulsory consultations with teachers on matters of educational policy.

Possible difficulties in the implementation of educational planning, particularly with regard to the recruitment of teachers

205. Several countries, both industrialised and developing, referred to the meagre budget devoted to education as being among the main causes of the difficulties encountered in implementing educational planning and recruiting teachers. Cameroon, Chile, Cyprus, Ecuador, Guyana, Jamaica, Jordan and Thailand observed that financial restrictions had led to the reduction of training facilities and to a consequent shortage of teachers. Such restrictions also resulted in a fall in the earnings of teachers, who were thus often prompted to leave the profession. Circumstances such as these were mentioned by Barbados, Nicaragua, the Philippines, Tanzania and the United States. A decrease in public funds for education has led, in the Federal Republic of Germany, the Netherlands and the United States, to a shortage of teachers in those fields where there are pressing needs, such as pre-school, special and technical education.

206. A number of countries referred to the shortage of teachers as constituting the main obstacle to the implementation of their educational planning. Although this topic is dealt with more systematically in Chapter VI of the report, it seems appropriate at this point to provide a list of those countries which believe that shortages of teachers, either in general or restricted to certain subjects or geographical areas, make consistent educational planning impossible: Australia (language specialists for the children of recent immigrants and for the Aborigines), Barbados (specialised teachers), Egypt, Gabon, India (mountain areas), Kuwait, Luxembourg (mathematics teachers), New Zealand (teachers of mathematics, science, technical and commercial subjects), Nicaragua, the Philippines (rural areas), Scotland (physics and mathematics teachers), Sri Lanka, Sweden, Tunisia (specialists in technical and scientific subjects) and the United Kingdom (teachers of handicrafts, arts and technology). Opinions as to the cause of such shortages coincide with those referred to in Chapter VI, viz. expansion of the education system which has not been accompanied by an increase in teacher training facilities: poor levels of pay for teachers; difficult living conditions in certain areas.

207. Other countries referred to a surplus of teachers as making for an imbalance in their educational planning. Such surpluses are more common in the industrialised countries and can often be attributed to a fall in student numbers resulting from a decrease in the birth rate. This situation was mentioned by the following countries: Australia, Canada, Canada (Quebec), Denmark, Federal Republic of Germany, Hungary, Japan, Luxembourg, the Netherlands, Spain and Venezuela. The countries which claimed to have balanced out the supply and demand for teachers are: Byelorussia, Cuba, Czechoslovakia, German Democratic Republic, Ireland, Israel, Malta and USSR.

208. The remarks which follow concern the methods of drawing up and implementing an educational plan. Sweden said that the inaccuracies of the plan adopted in 1970 caused an excessive reduction in the number of applicants for teaching, which has resulted in the current shortage. Chile stressed the difficulties involved in adapting a plan drawn up in national terms to the markedly different conditions prevailing in the 13 provinces of the country.

Co-ordination between the training of the various branches of the teaching service (paragraphs 10(e), and (f) and 24) (cf. also Chapter I)

209. Of the 48 countries to answer this question, three said that no links existed between training establishments for different categories of teachers, viz. German Democratic Republic, India and Indonesia. The German Democratic Republic stated that co-ordinating the training provided to different categories of teachers was not an aim that it wished to pursue. In fact, the country's experience with teacher training and the quality of the work being done in schools by qualified teachers proved that separate training was preferable. The German Democratic Republic nevertheless said that links existed between training college staff and university lecturers who did similar work, such as preparing further training courses and developing teaching aids. India also referred to separate institutions for the training of teachers for pre-school, primary and secondary education. Indonesia gave details of co-ordination between training departments and institutions with regard to further training but not for initial training.

210. Nicaragua and Venezuela stated that they had programmes which aimed to co-ordinate training for pre-school, primary and secondary education. Nicaragua hoped that co-ordination between the training of primary and secondary teachers would be achieved with the introduction into the system of a nine-class basic education. In Venezuela, primary teachers may study an optional subject related to pre-school and primary education. All the other answers refer to measures which correspond to provisions 10(c) and 24 of the Recommendation, aimed at bringing the various branches of the teaching service closer together.

211. Effective co-ordination of the training of pre-school and primary teachers was mentioned in the majority of cases: Barbados, Byelorussia, Cyprus, Ecuador, Egypt, France, Hungary, Kuwait, Luxembourg, Mauritius, the Netherlands, New Zealand, the Philippines, Sweden and the United Kingdom (Scotland). These countries usually offer a common curriculum in the same training college for both categories of teachers.

212. The training of primary and secondary teachers in the same college and with common curricula was referred to by the following countries: Barbados, Canada (Quebec), Colombia (primary and lower secondary), Egypt (lower and upper secondary), Finland (joint curricula for primary, secondary and technical teachers), Federal Republic of Germany, Hungary (upper primary and secondary), Malta, Mauritius (primary and lower secondary), New Zealand, the Philippines, Sri Lanka (parts of the curriculum common to primary and secondary) and Tanzania.

213. Several countries, not referred to in the paragraphs above, provided details of attempts to promote co-operation between different categories of teachers, in such ways as co-ordinating curricula and harmonising methods to meet the needs of the child at various stages of its development (Bangladesh, Czechoslovakia, Mauritius and the USSR). The USSR also referred to the ties which should be established with technical and vocational education from the secondary school onwards in the interests of the students. Mention was also made of co-ordination, for the various categories of student-teachers, of teaching practice and field work (Australia, Luxembourg and Thailand); co-ordination of teaching aids (Israel); the organisation of regular meetings between student-teachers - and their lecturers - at the various levels of education (France, Norway); and the setting-up of joint in-service training courses, as in the case of Egypt, Indonesia and Jamaica.

214. In short, co-ordination between training courses for the various categories of teachers has virtually been achieved in such countries as Finland, Kenya, Malta, Sweden and Tanzania where common curricula enable teachers to move automatically from one level of the education system to another. Other countries are making progress towards this objective, as in the case of Spain which plans to establish reciprocal arrangements between the various levels of technical education and the corresponding levels of general education. Gabon is preparing a similar type of "task-oriented" training for the various categories of teachers.

Liaison between technical and general education (paragraphs 10(c), (f) and 24)

215. Of the 47 answers received, only those of Sweden and Venezuela stated that there were no links in their system between these two types of education. All the other answers referred to links of varying closeness between technical and general

education, and between the teaching staff involved. The links are of many different kinds, ranging from a compulsory grounding in general education for students and teachers in technical schools to integrated teaching patterns. Technical and technological material has thus been introduced into the primary school syllabus and made compulsory. Secondary school syllabuses can either combine general and technical subjects or provide technical subjects as options.

216. A good grounding in general education is a requirement for admission to technical education in the following countries: Argentina, Bangladesh, Barbados, Cyprus, Gabon, India, Japan, Kenya, Malta, Nicaragua, Pakistan and Peru. Another type of liaison between the two types of education incorporates technical subjects of varying importance, such as technical drawing or industrial art, in the syllabus of general education. This is done in Australia, Egypt, Hungary, Ireland, Israel and Quebec. Finally, in several countries, a more advanced degree of liaison has been introduced to integrate the two, traditionally separate, types of education. The aim is to modify the excessively "academic" nature of secondary education by including in the syllabuses a number of technical subjects related to industry, farming, home economics, etc. (Guyana, the Netherlands). In the Philippines, the idea of "work education" is linked with the educational experiences which children receive at primary school. In Guyana, a "vocational studies" course has been introduced into the secondary school syllabus with a view to applying theoretical knowledge acquired at school to practical tasks. In certain Eastern European countries, "polytechnic education" given in primary and secondary schools combines general education with vocational and industrial material, backed up by practical experience in industrial workshops and in farming. In Byelorussia, for instance, multi-disciplinary education, at the secondary level of general education, introduces some basic notions of theoretical and practical science, the working environment, the arts and sport. A similar trend towards attaching comparable importance to technical and general education has been observed in a number of industrialised and developing countries, e.g. Canada, Finland, Mauritius, New Zealand, Norway, Peru, the Philippines and the United States.

217. Although the question about links between general and technical education did not refer specifically to teacher training, it is obviously implicit in any changes made in such education. Some answers mentioned this connection. Barbados said that the technical teacher is expected to have studied the general subjects on the secondary school syllabus. France stated that fully qualified secondary school teachers provide the theoretical teaching in training colleges for technical teachers.

#### Other measures affecting the training and responsibilities of teachers

218. Quebec states that a new teacher training policy is being prepared. In Ecuador, agreements have been reached for providing pre-school and primary teachers with a university training. In certain developing countries, the introduction of agricultural work at school has meant that teachers in charge of school "farms" have had to be trained in agricultural science and technology.

#### Adaptation of teacher preparation programmes (paragraphs 19-20)

219. The economic, social and cultural developments which are a feature of contemporary society have had an impact on the entire education system and have inevitably affected teacher-training programmes. The updating of syllabuses and methods is vital if teachers are to be able to communicate efficiently with students and parents whose social environment has evolved. Section 15 of the questionnaire lists:

(a) various themes which could serve as a basis for training programmes in order to take into account social and cultural change, e.g. links between school and out-of-school education; functional rural education; education concerning the responsibilities of life in society; education for international understanding and co-operation; introduction of an interdisciplinary approach; introduction of productive work into school; and controlling the influence of the mass media;

(b) innovations in teaching methods such as participation in the organisation and running of their education; self-education and group-education techniques; the new teaching materials; improved evaluation techniques; introduction of the mass media; and improved practical training for future teachers (e.g. teaching practice, micro-teaching).

220. On the whole, answers to this question did not go into details. The wording of the question and the request to provide a "yes" or "no" answer to a series of suggestions are probably responsible for this. Quebec thought that the question was "intrinsically ambiguous" with "ill-defined ideas so that answers could not be of any significant value". Answers were either very brief (Mauritius, Jordan, Cyprus) or vague (Sweden, Ukraine) or took up the suggestions in the questionnaire by ticking the relevant spaces.

221. Austria, Colombia, Gabon and Switzerland did not provide any information on this section.

222. The following 25 countries acknowledged that new guidelines recently introduced into their training programmes and teaching methods corresponded, in general, to the ideas suggested in the questionnaire: Bangladesh, Bulgaria, Byelorussia, Canada (and Quebec), Cyprus, Czechoslovakia, Egypt, Federal Republic of Germany, Hungary, India, Israel, Jordan, Kenya, Mauritius, Norway, Pakistan, Peru, Sri Lanka, Sweden, Tanzania, Thailand, Ukraine, the United Kingdom (Scotland), USSR and Venezuela.

223. Most of the answers to the suggested themes and innovations were constructive. Norway indicated that all the suggested themes would be dealt with and some would be more fully explored, while teaching methods would be integrated into teacher training. It would have been interesting to know the relative importance of each of the suggested themes and innovations in teacher training. This would have made it possible, firstly, to identify the over-all trends and, secondly, to pursue consideration of the justification for, or way of, introducing any particular theme or innovation into teacher training.

224. While stating that most of the suggested examples corresponded to innovations introduced into their training systems, certain countries noted that a number of specific guidelines were not at present being implemented. Argentina and Chile, for example, were not in favour of pupil participation in the organisation and running of their education. "The teaching of productive work" was not approved of by Australia, Denmark and Indonesia. "Functional literacy" aroused reservations on the part of Ecuador, German Democratic Republic, Malta and Tunisia. The mass media were not used in Barbados, Malta and Nicaragua. Chile did not believe that intensification of the practical training of future teachers deserved any special priority. Cuba has not introduced group-education techniques and makes no use of the media in education. Ecuador and Japan stated that they have no plans for links between formal education and extracurricular activities.

225. An observation made by both the United Kingdom and the Netherlands stressed the fact that, in view of the autonomy which their training colleges enjoy and the differences in their respective curricula, it is impossible to say that every innovation is being introduced in every establishment. It would appear, none the less, that the trends outlined in section 15 of the questionnaire are to be found in most establishments.

226. Several answers highlighted specific innovations in addition to the proposals set out in the questionnaire. Ecuador, for instance, has opened colleges to train teachers who can teach in the vernacular of the country. The United States are introducing multicultural programmes and bilingual teaching (English-Spanish) in order to adapt education to certain ethnic minorities and immigrants. In France, future teachers are expected to follow a three-week course in a working environment or spend a period of time working in a company. Nicaragua has instituted a compulsory period of community service for future teachers. New Zealand has added "training in trades union practices" to the list of subjects to be included in the new curricula. Spain has very radically adapted the curricula for teachers working in rural areas by introducing such subjects as livestock breeding, farming methods, etc. The Philippines have launched a system of "mobile schools" for people living far from urban areas. Another innovation mentioned by them is the integration of primary and secondary teacher training in the same institutions.

Participation of teachers in out-of-school activities  
for young people and adult education  
(paragraphs 20(d) and 74)

227. Paragraph 20(d) of the Recommendation refers to "practice in teaching and in conducting extracurricular activities" as being among the essential components of a teacher training programme. Social and educational developments during the last

ten years have confirmed the wisdom of provision 20(d). Surveys conducted in recent years have shown how necessary and timely it is to broaden the school-associated and extracurricular activities of teachers in the interests of both the community and the teaching profession. Such activities comprise programmes to prepare young people for community living, family life and productive work and programmes for adults, whose educational needs are being recognised in both the developing and the industrialised countries.

228. Answers to section 16 of the third questionnaire provide recent information on the way in which teachers take part in out-of-school education and on what governments believe will be the future trends in this field. The questionnaire raises the following points: (a) participation by teachers in out-of-school activities and the optional or compulsory nature of such participation; (b) the subjects dealt with, in order of frequency; (c) the nature of the training received by teachers for such activities; (d) in-service training courses; (e) further information about developments in teacher participation in out-of-school activities.

229. Colombia, Denmark, Gabon and the Netherlands did not answer section 16 of the questionnaire.

Actual participation of teachers in out-of-school activities and the optional or compulsory nature of such participation

230. All the answers showed that teachers in the countries concerned take part in out-of-school activities for young people and in adult education, in addition to their academic work. In two countries (Kenya and Tanzania), such activities are compulsory. In Argentina and Indonesia, teacher participation is compulsory whenever the regional authorities so decide but is otherwise optional. In Sweden, although participation is usually optional, teachers are expected to supervise their pupils' sports activities five days a year. They are also required to accompany their pupils for 2-3 week periods for "training in industry".

231. In some 43 other countries, participation is optional. Although no question was asked about the number of teachers involved, some general indications were given in the reports: "many teachers" (Australia, Malta, Tunisia); "very numerous" (Canada); some (Nicaragua, Norway, Pakistan); "take part frequently" (Israel). Chile stated that during the 1976-80 period, 6,800 teachers took part voluntarily, and France said that in 1979, some 30,000 secondary teachers took part, as overtime, in adult education activities.

232. In addition to France, the following countries referred to paid extracurricular activities: Egypt, India, Luxembourg, Malta and the United States. The United Kingdom, however, said that such activities carried out by teachers for their pupils were not paid.

233. With regard to the nature of the extracurricular activities, a large number of answers referred to activities for young children. They included the running of young people's associations and groups with a special interest in science and culture, sport and tourism (Bangladesh, Barbados, Bulgaria, Canada, Chile, Czechoslovakia, Guyana, Hungary, Jordan, Luxembourg, New Zealand, Pakistan, Sri Lanka, Ukraine, United Kingdom (Scotland), United States and USSR) (cf. p. 16, paragraph ).

234. Although courses for adults are by far the most frequently mentioned in the context of out-of-school activities, it should be noted that adult education in several countries has, for historical reasons, had its own organisation and a teaching staff trained outside the education system (Canada, Japan, Spain, Tunisia). In Hungary, there are special primary and secondary schools reserved exclusively for adults having had no formal education. In Finland, certain local authorities appoint "dual-purpose" teachers who teach both children and adults.

Subjects, in order of frequency, covered by teachers in out-of-school education

235. The subject which most frequently heads the list of extracurricular educational activities is literacy (Argentina, Bangladesh, Chile, Ecuador, Egypt, Kuwait, Nicaragua, Pakistan, Tanzania and Venezuela). Literacy is also listed among other subjects by Thailand and the United Kingdom (Scotland). Community



development is included in the curriculum in Indonesia and Thailand and is referred to, among other subjects, by Bangladesh, Barbados, Ecuador, Guyana, New Zealand, Sri Lanka, the United Kingdom (Scotland) and Venezuela. General and/or technical education is listed as a priority subject by Canada (Quebec), Finland, France, Guyana, Israel, the Philippines and Sri Lanka. The same subject is listed among others by Argentina, Chile, Egypt, India, Nicaragua, Pakistan, the Philippines and Thailand.

236. In Bulgaria, Byelorussia, Chile and Czechoslovakia, the development of science and technology constitutes a priority subject. Arts education is placed at the top of the list in answers from Cameroon and Cuba and is quoted among other subjects by Czechoslovakia, Finland, Indonesia, Israel, Kuwait, Luxembourg, Nicaragua, Tunisia and the United States.

237. Extracurricular activities for young people are put in first place by the USSR, and among other programmes by Barbados, Czechoslovakia, Guyana, Jordan, New Zealand, Pakistan, Scotland, Sri Lanka and Ukraine.

#### Teacher training for extracurricular educational activities

238. A number of countries stated that teacher training for extracurricular activities formed part of normal teacher training: Byelorussia, Canada, Ecuador, Finland, Federal Republic of Germany, German Democratic Republic, Guyana, Hungary, Israel, Japan, New Zealand, Nicaragua, Pakistan, Sweden, Tanzania and the United Kingdom (including Scotland). (Israel and Hungary provided a brief description of the relevant programmes.) Several countries stated that only part of the preparation for out-of-school education was provided by conventional training colleges and that additional training was given by other institutions, e.g. by the Ministry for Youth and Sport (Tunisia); refresher courses (Kenya); and youth organisations (Hungary).

239. A similar number of answers stated that training for extracurricular educational activities is given outside conventional training colleges in a variety of institutions, e.g. the training centre for adult education (Spain); a specialised department of the Ministry of Education (Chile); the educational centre for youth (Bulgaria); specialised departments in certain teacher training establishments (USSR); the regional centres for extracurricular education (Venezuela); the education departments of certain universities (Canada); and by specialised non-governmental organisations for young people, such as the scout movement or the Red Cross (Bangladesh, Barbados and Sri Lanka).

240. In other countries, teachers are trained for extracurricular activities in a less systematic way through seminars and study courses of varying duration, often combined with practical experience: Argentina, Cuba, Egypt, France, Jordan, Norway (which suggested that the teaching practice which forms part of normal teacher training could provide a useful basis for training for out-of-school education), and Thailand.

241. The following countries observed that their education systems did not provide any training for extracurricular activities: Cameroon, India, Indonesia, Kuwait, Luxembourg, Malta and Mauritius. Czechoslovakia, Iraq and Ukraine did not supply any information on this question.

#### Refresher courses for teachers involved with out-of-school education

242. According to the information received, refresher courses are regularly organised in the following 15 countries: Bangladesh, Bulgaria, Canada, Cuba, Egypt, Iraq, Luxembourg, Nicaragua, Norway, the Philippines, Sri Lanka, Tanzania, Thailand, Tunisia and USSR. In other countries, courses are held from time to time or for a small number of teachers: Byelorussia, Cyprus, Finland, New Zealand and Venezuela. In addition to nationally organised courses, Cuba refers to provincial and local ones. In the United Kingdom (Scotland), such courses are run by the local authorities. In Venezuela, refresher courses form part of the operational activities connected with educational projects conducted in various parts of the country with the support of the Organisation of American States.

243. The Federal Republic of Germany, France and the United Kingdom noted that certain in-service training courses provide useful material for teachers involved in out-of-school education. There are no refresher courses for teachers engaged in out-of-school education in the following countries: Guyana, Indonesia, Japan, Jordan, Kenya, Kuwait, Malta, Pakistan, Spain, Sweden and the United States.

Forecasts of the future development of  
teacher participation in out-of-school  
education

244. Among the various opinions expressed about the future development of teacher participation in out-of-school education, an overwhelming majority of answers (29) predicted a substantial increase in this field while 5 answers envisaged a decline.

245. Among the latter, Barbados and Canada referred to the currently low rate of involvement by their teachers. The United States was pessimistic because of the reduction in educational expenditure. Cyprus mentioned the opposition of teachers' unions and the steady decline in the rural population for which out-of-school educational programmes were mainly intended. Finland attributed the decline in teacher involvement to the excessive workload with which teachers already have to contend.

246. The 29 countries which anticipated increased teacher involvement in out-of-school education put forward a variety of reasons. A number of countries emphasised the priority to be given to out-of-school education in the implementation of national development planning. Indonesia spoke of the development of a national programme for the extension of fundamental education up to the age of 30. Chile mentioned its national literacy campaign. In Byelorussia, Ecuador, Egypt, Guyana, Jordan, India, Sri Lanka and Tanzania, the development of out-of-school education with active teacher participation is a permanent feature of national educational policy. In the Philippines, the recent creation by the Government of the Bureau for Youth and the Non-formal Education Board confirms the growing trend in out-of-school education.<sup>1</sup> Thailand and Venezuela stressed the need for improving teachers' skills and motivation in order to improve the quality of out-of-school education. Hungary believed that out-of-school education would expand because of the general increase in leisure time. Mauritius stated that teacher involvement was desirable "in order to make the best use of manpower". Cuba and Luxembourg believed that out-of-school education was vital for providing young people with a well-balanced education and for bringing school closer to everyday life.

247. Several answers stressed the human and educational value of teacher participation in out-of-school activities. Israel, for instance, believed that more active teacher participation would contribute to strengthening their role as "educators" in addition to their traditional task of "purveyors of knowledge". The German Democratic Republic stated that the importance of teacher participation was becoming more widely recognised and that "experience has shown that the effects of out-of-school education are more lasting than those of formal education".

Further education for teachers as part of  
lifelong education

248. Section 17 of the questionnaire was aimed at obtaining information more on the practical and administrative aspects of further education programmes than on their subject-matter and effects. The questions focused on the following themes: (a) further education institutions and services; further education courses and the use made of them by the teaching profession; (b) the cost to participants; (c) the optional or compulsory nature of the courses; (d) the contributions made by universities and research institutes; (e) the influence of teachers and their organisations on further education courses; (f) the benefits to teachers who attend in-service training courses; (g) the number and percentage of teachers who attended further education courses from 1974 to 1978.

---

<sup>1</sup> Jordan expressed a similar point of view in referring to the recent creation of a department for out-of-school education in the Ministry of Education.

### Further education systems and services

249. Information provided by Member states shows that there are four distinct objectives of further education programmes: (a) completing the training of under-qualified teachers (e.g. Cyprus, Indonesia, Peru, Tanzania and Tunisia); (b) improving or broadening the skills of qualified teachers through study for higher degrees; courses corresponding to this objective are described in most of the answers received; (c) up-dating teachers' skills to cope with changes in subject-matter and methods resulting from educational reforms and innovations; (d) providing all teachers with the opportunity of keeping abreast of innovation in their subjects and in teaching methods. To further this particular aim, a wide variety of fairly short courses is currently provided for teachers by specialised bodies, training establishments (including universities), education authorities (e.g. inspectors of schools), schools, and teachers' organisations. Colombia speaks of the role played by inspectors in in-service training for teachers, both nationally and regionally. They assess the work of teachers in the classroom and help them to improve or readjust their teaching methods. Other countries also referred to short seminars organised by inspectors for primary or secondary teachers.

250. The courses listed in paragraph 17.6 of the questionnaire seem to correspond to those available in most countries. In actual fact, more than half of the countries (23 out of 42) which provided details on this matter stated that they offered at least eight of the nine types of course mentioned, for a varying proportion of their teachers (cf. tables 5 and 6). The vacation courses/summer services, short full-time courses, evening courses, and day release courses were among the most frequently mentioned, and those attended by the largest number of teachers. Approximately 36 per cent of the countries which answered the question stated that they offered no evening courses for further education for teachers. A similar percentage (though not necessarily comprising the same countries) made no use of teachers' centres. In addition, school-board conferences are not used by 40 per cent of the countries that provided answers. For each of the following types of course: day release courses, correspondence courses, radio and television courses, paid educational leave or sabbatical leave for 3 months or more, the proportion of non-users was approximately 26 per cent.

251. Some countries referred to types of further education course other than those listed in the questionnaire. These included:

- study trips;
- regional centres for educational documentation;
- specialised press services (Argentina);
- study groups at school, directed by qualified consultants (Denmark, Israel). Israel reports the introduction of an institutional in-service course whereby a school principal may choose a topic for a course for his entire staff to be run at his school. This is usually in response to an instructional or educational problem confronting the school staff. The course may take various forms, e.g. guest lectures, workshops, deliberations, etc.;
- courses in schools (Barbados);
- participation in the activities of scientific associations (German Democratic Republic);
- weekend courses (Ireland);
- training courses in industry (month or year) (Japan);
- practical courses in technical subjects (Mauritius);
- study and discussion groups for the renovation of education (Spain);
- special courses for teachers to introduce educational reforms and prepare the teachers to implement them (Spain).

252. The answers did not make it possible to establish how far the various types of course satisfied the teachers' needs for further education. Nevertheless, the national programme of courses is often organised by a central body which draws up its plans in accordance with applications received and the needs stated by the education authorities.

253. Some 42 countries answered the question in detail. Information of a general nature was provided by 7 countries. After trying a free further education service for teachers, Colombia was forced to give it up for economic reasons. Czechoslovakia stated that it had a uniform system for post-graduate teacher training involving residential courses, extracurricular studies, seminars, symposia, etc. India spoke of the permanent nature of the further education services provided for teachers by national and federal educational institutions.

Teachers can take a long period of study leave in order to obtain an additional certificate or qualification. Jamaica stated, without further details, that use was made of all the types of course referred to. In Malta, teachers can receive grants over a long period for further education abroad. Further education courses are also organised locally by the University and the Department of Education. The United Kingdom indicated that all the types of course referred to were available for many, not to say the majority, of serving teachers. In Greece, primary and secondary teachers with five years' service can attend a two-year further education course if they pass an entrance examination. For a one-year course, no entrance examination is required but admission depends on the applicant's record and references.

254. In some countries, further education programmes are a consequence of the new slant given to initial teacher training. In France, for example, "training courses in industry" have been organised for primary and secondary teachers to familiarise them with the facts of economic life. In Israel, further education courses are frequently conducted in schools, with all the staff concerned taking part. In the United States, further education courses tend to be focused on learning problems and on the teacher's ability to communicate effectively with the students. In Czechoslovakia, emphasis is placed on individual study combined with periodical consultations with specialists. Between the fifth and tenth year of service, a graduate teacher is required to take a two-year course of guided study which leads to a diploma entitling the teacher to promotion. In their further education programmes, Hungarian teachers are increasingly involved in research work and surveys. In the United Kingdom, regional further education programmes are organised, with the assistance of the Ministry, in specific subjects corresponding to regional educational needs. In Byelorussia, two-month courses are organised for secondary school head-teachers. In Tanzania, a national further education programme was instituted in 1980 for all primary teachers. It consists of a nine-month correspondence course followed by a three-month residential course at the National Education College.

#### The cost to participants

255. Attendance at further education courses is free in almost all the countries which replied to the questionnaire. In addition, the accommodation and travel expenses of those attending are paid for by the organisers in some countries, e.g. Israel, Jordan, Norway and the USSR. In general, courses organised by education authorities are free (and often compulsory).<sup>1</sup> Canada and Spain said that their teachers normally pay the cost of courses, while in Cameroon, although some courses are free of charge, those attending evening classes have to pay a fee. In Tunisia, the cost of accommodation and travel is borne by those attending a course. The cost of extended courses leading to a higher degree is usually borne by the teachers concerned (e.g. Nicaragua, Norway, the United Kingdom (Scotland) and the United States). In Denmark and the USSR, teachers attending certain courses during school hours are exempted from certain duties. The funds for further education courses are provided in most cases by the Ministry of Education. Funds also come from other institutions, e.g. initial teacher training establishments (Denmark and Norway); regional and national institutes for further education for teachers (Cuba, Ecuador, the Federal Republic of Germany, India, Israel, New Zealand and the USSR, etc.); local education authorities (the Philippines and the United Kingdom); and local councils (Sweden).

#### The optional or compulsory nature of courses

256. Attendance by teachers at all further education courses is optional in the following countries: Australia, Bangladesh, Barbados, Denmark, Ecuador, India, Israel, France, Gabon, Malta, Mauritius, the Netherlands, Quebec, Thailand, the United Kingdom and the United States. In the countries listed below, apart from optional courses, there are compulsory courses usually run by the education authorities in school time, either for all teachers or for particular categories of staff: Argentina, Bulgaria, Byelorussia, Cuba, Cyprus, Czechoslovakia (compulsory

---

<sup>1</sup> There are, none the less, other further education courses organised by the Ministry of Education. In general they are not free but the enrolment fees are sometimes paid by the education authorities.

Table VI: Types of in-service training programmes available to teachers and degree of utilisation

Countries	Not available (X) Not mentioned (-)									Modes of in-service training programmes utilised by									few		
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9			
Argentina										X	X								X	X	X
Australia									X												
Austria (no information)																					
Bangladesh (no info.)																					
Barbados					X	X															X
Byelorussia														X	X	X					
Bulgaria																					
Cameroon (no info.)																					
Canada																					
Chile																					
Colombia*																					
Cuba																					
Cyprus																					
Czechoslovakia*																					
Denmark																					
Ecuador																					
Egypt																					
Finland																					
France																					

Table VI: Types of in-service training programmes available to teachers and degree of utilisation (cont.)

Countries	Not available (X) Not mentioned (-)									Modes of in-service training programmes utilised by								
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
	all or many									few								
Madagascar (no info.)																		
Malta*	X	X				X	X	X										
Mauritius	X	X	X	X		X	X	X	X									
Mexico																		
Netherlands (no info.)																		
New Zealand						X				X	X	X	X		X			X
Nicaragua									X	X	X	X	X		X	X		X
Norway									X	X	X	X		X	X	X		X
Pakistan	X	X				X	X	X		X	X	X						X
Papua New Guinea (no info.)																		
Peru	X	X	X			X	X	X							X	X	X	X
Philippines									X						X			X
Quebec									X									X
Saudi Arabia																		
Spain						X	X	X		X	X	X			X	X		X
Sri Lanka	X	X				-				X	X	X			X			X
Sweden									X	X	X	X			X			X
Switzerland																		
Tanzania	X					X				X	X	X			X	X		X



Table VI: Types of in-service training programmes available to teachers and degree of utilisation (cont.)

Countries	Not available (X) Not mentioned (-)									Modes of in-service training programmes utilised by all or many									few								
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
Thailand									X									X				X	X	X	X	X	X
Tunisia										X	X							X				X	X	X	X	X	X
United Kingdom* (Scotland)								X										X				X	X	X	X	X	X
Ukraine (no info.)																											
Uruguay (no info.)																											
USA																											
USSR																											
Venezuela	X	X	X			X	X	X	X									X				X	X				X

\* Refer to para. ( )

The numbers in the first row refer to the different modes of in-service training programmes as listed in the questionnaire.

- 1 Evening courses.
- 2 Day releases.
- 3 Short full-time course of one week or less.
- 4 Vacation courses/summer services.
- 5 Teachers' centres.
- 6 School-board conferences.
- 7 Correspondence courses.
- 8 Radio/TV-based courses.
- 9 Paid educational leave or sabbatical leave for 3 months or more.



Table VII: Degree of utilisation of in-service training programmes (summary)

Further education programme	Number of countries in which the further education programme is		
	Non-existent or not <sup>1</sup> mentioned in answer	Used by	
		All or a large number <sup>2</sup>	At least a few <sup>3</sup>
Evening courses	15 (36%)	17	27 (64%)
Day release courses	10 (24%)	16	32 (76%)
Short full-time course of one week or less	6 (14%)	22	36 (86%)
Vacation courses/ Summer services	4 (10%)	26	38 (90%)
Teachers' centres	16 (38%)	12	26 (62%)
School-board conferences	17 (40%)	15	25 (60%)
Correspondence courses	12 (29%)	10	30 (71%)
Radio/TV-based courses	11 (26%)	11	31 (74%)
Paid educational leave or sabbatical leave for 3 months or more	11 (26%)	8	30 (74%)

- (a) The figures in columns (1) and (3) add up to 42, the number of usable answers received.
- (b) The figures in column (2) represent countries which make use of a further education programme for a reasonably large number of teachers.
- (c) Each further education programme is used by over 60 per cent of the countries that answered the question, as shown by the percentages in column (3).
- (d) Evening courses - a type of course frequently used for obtaining a higher degree.

Day release courses - this was interpreted by some countries as a day off for study.

Correspondence courses - such courses are often linked to other long-term courses such as holiday courses leading to a diploma (Norway).

Radio/TV courses - these are used for special education in certain countries (Norway).

Paid study leave - this is used in order to attract teachers to certain underprivileged areas (e.g. northern Norway).

course between the fifth and tenth years of teaching), Egypt, Finland, Federal Republic of Germany, German Democratic Republic, Guyana, Indonesia, Iraq, Kuwait, New Zealand (compulsory courses for primary teachers), Nicaragua, Norway, Sri Lanka, Sweden, Tanzania (primary teachers), Tunisia, Ukraine, the United Kingdom (Scotland) (compulsory courses for special education teachers). In Japan and the USSR, teachers are required to attend a further education course every five years. In Chile, attendance at such courses is compulsory in order to qualify for promotion.

#### Contribution made by universities and research institutes

257. With only a few exceptions (Finland, Norway, the Netherlands), all answers received emphasised the very active part played by universities in the development of further education for teachers. In Ecuador, the Ministry of Education has concluded a contract with the university, making the university responsible for organising and running further education activities. Other answers indicated similar responsibilities for universities in Bangladesh, Cameroon and Canada (Quebec), Kuwait and the United Kingdom (Scotland). Universities continue to provide extended further education leading to a degree. Nevertheless, there is considerable evidence of the contribution made by universities to the continuous education with which most teachers are concerned. In this connection, departments of education and research institutes have produced a variety of documents on current teaching methods and the findings of educational research for teachers attending conferences and on study leave (e.g. Australia, Bulgaria, Byelorussia and the United States). In addition to the collaboration of universities as institutions with further education, mention was made of the individual contributions of lecturers and research specialists to courses (Australia, Egypt, Finland, the Netherlands and Norway).

#### The influence of teachers and their organisations on further education courses

258. In a number of countries, teachers and their organisations have taken the initiative of promoting in-service education. The interest shown by the teaching profession in lifelong education has undoubtedly grown stronger and has spread in recent years. The answers given by governments to this question show that, in most instances, teachers and their organisations are drawn into the planning and preparation of the curricula. Nevertheless, Bangladesh, Barbados, Ecuador, Peru, the Philippines and Thailand said that the influence of teachers in this field was insignificant. Conversely, answers from 26 countries described various ways in which teachers and their organisations can influence further education policy and courses. In several countries, the representatives of teachers' organisations sit on the co-ordinating bodies or national or regional advisory committees set up by the authorities to plan and supervise the development of lifelong education for teachers (Australia, Byelorussia, Hungary, India, Indonesia, Nicaragua, Norway, Tunisia and the United Kingdom). In some cases, they contribute to the decisions taken about the funding of courses. Elsewhere, and more frequently, the organisations submit recommendations to the education authorities or propose new courses at regular consultations held with them (Bulgaria, Cameroon, Finland, France, the Netherlands, Spain and Thailand). They sometimes bring pressure to bear on political bodies, nationally and regionally (Canada, France, Sri Lanka and the United States). In many countries, close co-operation regarding further education has been developed between the teachers' organisations and the initial teacher training establishments. This is true particularly of Canada, Cuba, Guyana, Israel, Kenya and the United Kingdom (Scotland). In such cases, teachers often assume responsibility for the subject-matter and organisation of further education courses (Canada, Israel and the United Kingdom (Scotland)).

#### Benefits to teachers who attend further education courses

259. The question asked was: "In what circumstances does participation in further education programmes lead to the award of a diploma or to career or other benefits?" Answers referred both to extended courses generally organised in co-operation with the universities and leading to the award of a degree, and to short-

---

<sup>1</sup> Lomonosov University (USSR) organises annual further training courses for teachers in rural areas.

term courses organised for teachers by various bodies to help them update their knowledge and teaching skills. Teachers who complete an extended course and are awarded a degree generally receive promotion and an increase in salary. In several countries, a large number of teachers undertake in-service study for higher degrees: in Australia, 15 per cent of all teachers; in Canada, 75 per cent (1979); in the United Kingdom, 21,000 (1980). In Cameroon, Egypt, Jordan, Mauritius and Tunisia, attendance at further education courses leading to a degree improves the candidates' career prospects. The further education system in Hungary requires a year's university study together with individual work. In Czechoslovakia, all graduate teachers between their fifth and tenth year of service have to take a two-year correspondence course and go for regular consultations with a specialist at the university. The diplomas awarded at the end of these courses entitle the teacher to a salary increment. Material benefits were also granted to teachers who successfully completed a further education course in Canada (Quebec), Israel, Jordan, Peru, the Philippines, Sweden and Tanzania. Several countries stated that attendance at short-term further education courses did not warrant the award of any special diplomas, e.g. Finland, France, Federal Republic of Germany and the Netherlands. In other countries, those attending are awarded certificates which in some cases are taken into consideration for promotion: Argentina, Byelorussia, Canada (Quebec), Cuba, Israel, Nicaragua and Tanzania.

Number and proportion of teachers who  
took part in further education pro-  
grammes (1974-78)

260. A large number of answers did not provide the statistics requested, which suggests that the authorities in many countries may not possess the facilities for obtaining statistics in this field. One country referred to the difficulty of obtaining accurate numbers of those attending further education courses as the same teachers frequently follow more than one. None the less, the Netherlands announced that a satisfactory registration system had been devised which would be introduced in 1982. Table VIII provides figures on attendance at further education courses in 25 countries. The table is only a rough guide on account of the loose wording of the replies to the questionnaire, which makes it impossible in several cases to know to which period the figures apply, from what branch of education those attending the courses came, or what types of programmes were available.

Participation in teaching by persons  
other than qualified teachers

261. Various categories of staff besides qualified teachers are currently involved in the educational process in the classroom or school. Since 1966, a number of studies and meetings have examined the contribution which they can make to improving the quality of education. Although not all countries hold similar views on the use of "ancillary staff" in school, the International Conference on Education in 1975 (35th Session) recommended that ... "the educational system should be provided with other professionals and specialists in the education system on a full-time or part-time basis to participate with teachers in the realisation of the educational programme".

262. To examine the part at present played by such staff, the questionnaire asked for information about:

- (a) the categories of personnel who, in various education systems, carry out duties in connection with education;
- (b) familiarity with educational problems and the type of educational training given to such staff;
- (c) existing or planned regulations for facilitating the participation of such staff in educational activities and even their integration into teaching teams.

263. Colombia, Denmark, Gabon, Greece, India, Ireland, Madagascar, Spain and Thailand did not answer this part of the questionnaire.

Table VIII: Participation of teachers in further education programmes (1974-78)

Countries	Primary and secondary levels	Type of courses
Argentina	20 000 (out of 600,000) (3.3%)	
Australia	15%; 54%; 37%	Part-time university studies. Curriculum studies; teaching methods
Barbados	about 3%	
Bulgaria	200 000 (est.)	
Cameroon	35%	
Canada (Quebec)	24%	University further training programme
Chile	34% 1 335 teachers	Further education courses Multinational Projects Scheme of the Organisation of American States
Cuba	210 000 (all teachers)	Further education seminars
Cyprus	0.9%	Courses abroad
Denmark	22 425	
France	44.9% (primary)  52 616 (secondary school teachers in 1980)	Refresher courses lasting 6 weeks or 3 months  Secondary in-service programme on new teaching methods
Fed. Rep. of Germany	33% of the whole teaching force	
German Dem. Rep.	All teachers	
Hungary	Nearly all teachers	
Israel	40%	About 30% of teachers participate in summer vacation courses
Japan	30% - 40%	
Luxembourg	27% pre-primary and primary teachers	
Malta	20%	
Nicaragua	20%	During 1974-78, only university organised further education programmes
Norway	Almost all (1974-78) 33% (1980)  722 teachers	"Study and Planning days"  Further education Degree courses
New Zealand	10%	

Table VIII: Participation of teachers in further education programmes (1974-78)  
(cont.)

Countries	Primary and secondary levels	Type of course									
Peru	1 374 teachers	Courses through the College of Vocational Education system									
Philippines	About 80% of teachers in government schools										
Scotland <sup>1</sup>	52 400 (1973) 59 000 (1979)										
Spain	37 050 (26.8%)	Courses organised by Ministry of Education only									
Tunisia	All primary school teachers 30% of secondary school teachers										
United Kingdom <sup>2</sup> (England and Wales)	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>Full-time</th> <th>Part-time</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1976</td> <td>3 102</td> <td>8 393</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1980</td> <td>5 989</td> <td>21 047</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		Full-time	Part-time	1976	3 102	8 393	1980	5 989	21 047	Long in-service courses
	Full-time	Part-time									
1976	3 102	8 393									
1980	5 989	21 047									

<sup>1</sup> It is pointed out that a considerable number of teachers may attend more than one in-service course per year.

<sup>2</sup> Current in-service programmes are the responsibility of individual local education authorities. Their statistics were not available.

Specialists belonging to other  
recognised professions

264. As an indication, the questionnaire listed the following specialists: "doctors, psychologists, social workers, librarians, school advisers, media specialists, speech therapists, artists and cultural workers, engineers, technicians, agricultural workers and craftsmen". These specialists were all referred to in most of the answers. A number of other specialists in this category were added to the list: architects (Argentina, Chile); sociologists (Czechoslovakia, Egypt and Peru); economists (Peru); nurses (Barbados, Canada and Malta); food experts (the Philippines); writers (Cyprus); "eminent" workers (Bulgaria); therapists (France, Gabon); scientists (Ukraine); factory technicians (German Democratic Republic); hotel managers, army officers and police officers (for vocational guidance) in Guyana; industrialists (Peru, Tunisia, Ukraine); and public relations experts (Venezuela). It is clear that the contribution made by specialists in this category is usually limited to their technical expertise in their particular field, as agreed with the teachers concerned. In Kuwait, educational work is allotted to certain specialists in this category, e.g. doctors are responsible for hygiene classes and engineers are in charge of classes in mechanics. Doctors who give lessons are required to hold a diploma in education.

Persons performing non-teaching duties  
in schools

265. In general, answers kept to the examples given in this part of the questionnaire, namely: "programme specialists, educational advisers, inspectors and supervisors, personnel in charge of further education and in-service training for teachers". Documentalists represented an additional special field referred to by Argentina, while manufacturers of teaching aids were mentioned by Argentina and Chile.

Auxiliary staff working under the  
direct supervision of teachers

266. The functions of pupil supervisor and house tutor in boarding schools, both mentioned in the questionnaire, were referred to very frequently. The function of "house tutor" was often quoted under different titles, e.g. "tutor" (Czechoslovakia, Ecuador, Hungary); "matron and bursar" (Tanzania); school hostess (Sweden); children's home supervisor (Bulgaria). Special supervision is provided for pupils who stay on at school after class because their parents return home late from work (Czechoslovakia, German Democratic Republic, Ukraine).

267. Maintenance staff for technical equipment and laboratories were mentioned in all the answers.

268. Few references were made to staff working under the direct supervision of teachers. Venezuela referred to "teacher aides" or "assistant teachers" who help the qualified staff, while Bangladesh mentioned "demonstrators" and Kuwait spoke of the role of "coaches". In the French system, "instructors" are in charge of physical education and sports, music, handicrafts and teaching the foreign languages of immigrants. Parents act as voluntary instructors in the education system in Canada and the Netherlands. In Guyana, schools responsible for farms employ personnel with first-hand experience of agriculture and stock-breeding.

Administrative staff

269. In general, answers to this particular question were neither numerous nor detailed. Several countries gave no answer at all, e.g. Argentina, Australia, Barbados, Bulgaria, Indonesia, Japan, Jordan, Kenya, Luxembourg, Mauritius, the Netherlands, Pakistan and Tanzania.

270. Two groups of administrative staff can be identified:

- (a) staff responsible for the practical and administrative running of educational establishments, e.g. secretaries, typists, accountants, storekeepers, drivers, caretakers, messengers, catering and cleaning staff, etc.;
- (b) staff responsible for the management of the establishment: head-teachers, deputy head-teachers, tutors, inspectors.

Elementary training for ancillary staff  
in educational problems

271. Bangladesh, Cyprus, Kenya, Malta, Sri Lanka and Venezuela stated that no such training was provided.

272. The majority of answers (33) referred to various forms of elementary training in educational problems given to ancillary staff. Specific programmes aimed at all staff in this category are provided in Austria, Byelorussia, Czechoslovakia, Ecuador, Egypt, Finland, German Democratic Republic, Hungary, Japan, Luxembourg, Nicaragua, Pakistan, Sweden and the USSR.

273. In several countries, elementary educational training in the form of information courses and seminars is given to staff of this kind while in service: France, Canada, Federal Republic of Germany, Guyana, Tunisia and the United States. In Ecuador and the German Democratic Republic, ancillary staff attend in-service courses for teachers.

274. In the countries listed below, educational training is provided only for specialists in certain fields: in Barbados and Chile, for psychologists; for social workers in Chile; for doctors responsible for teaching hygiene in Kuwait; for staff working in special education in Norway; and for assistant teachers helping qualified staff in Peru. Finally, certain countries maintained that ancillary staff, while not receiving formal educational training, learn from their practical experience in their contacts with teachers and pupils: Israel, Jordan, Mauritius, Norway and Tanzania.

Regulations which have been established  
or are under consideration to facilitate  
the participation of such staff in  
education activities and even their  
integration in teaching teams

275. Several countries stated that their education system had regulations governing the part played by such staff in educational activities, without specifying the nature of the regulations. Australia, Jordan, Mauritius, Tanzania, the United Kingdom (Scotland), the United States and Venezuela stated that no regulations had yet been introduced in this field. Bangladesh said that it was the authorities' intention to equate librarians and demonstrators with teaching staff. The Ministry of Education Plan in Peru provides for educational training for all non-teaching ancillary staff. Furthermore, it is interesting to note that in Byelorussia, ancillary staff who have received elementary educational training are allowed to attend meetings of educational councils in schools. In the Ukraine, this particular privilege is granted only to specialists belonging to other recognised professions.

CHAPTER IV

CONDITIONS FOR EFFECTIVE TEACHING AND LEARNING

276. The questions in this part of the questionnaire dealt with class size, hours of work, annual holidays with pay, study leave, conditions applicable to teachers under bilateral or multilateral exchange programmes abroad, leave to enable teachers to participate in the activities of their organisations, sick leave, school buildings and teachers in rural or remote areas. Maternity leave is dealt with in Chapter V.

277. All the countries shown in table I as having replied to the questionnaire, with the exceptions of Denmark and Greece, replied to some or all of the questions in this section.

Class size (paragraph 86)

278. The questions on this paragraph related to standards for class size and actual average numbers of pupils per class and sought information regarding past and anticipated trends in the two fields, and also information on the extent, if any, to which the introduction of new teaching methods and techniques (such as programmed learning and closed-circuit television) had affected class sizes and pupil-teacher ratios.

279. Out of the governments replying to the questionnaire, 57 supplied information which throws light on the situation in the countries and territories for which they are responsible with regard to maximum permitted and actual average class sizes. Table IX summarises the information received. The figures in columns 2-5 relate to public schools; where figures have been supplied for private schools, these are given in column 6. The figures are for 1980 except where otherwise stated.

280. As regards primary schools, only seven countries (Bulgaria, Canada (Quebec), Finland, France, Italy, Norway and Sweden) report permitted maxima of less than 30. At the upper extreme, the permitted maximum is 70 pupils in Madagascar, 55 in Sri Lanka, 50 in Cameroon, Egypt, India, Japan and Kenya, and 45 in Chile, Nicaragua and Peru. The other governments which provided information apply ceilings of 30-40 pupils per primary class.

281. At the same time, the great majority of the replies shows that actual average class sizes are substantially lower than the permitted maxima, often by as much as 20-30 per cent, and by even more in some cases; in Sri Lanka average primary school class sizes were reported as 25.3-30.5, as against a permitted maximum of 55. Approximately half of the governments which provided information on this point in terms of class sizes (as opposed to pupil-teacher ratios) report averages of 30 or less; Argentina, Finland, Italy and Norway report averages of less than 20, and Australia (Capital Territory), Byelorussian SSR, Canada (Alberta and Quebec), Czechoslovakia, Finland, France, German Democratic Republic, Federal Republic of Germany, Malta, Peru, Sweden and the United Kingdom (Scotland) report averages of 20-25, in all or part of their primary school systems. The countries reporting the highest averages are Cameroon (51), Gabon, Madagascar, Tanzania and Thailand (45), Bangladesh (42), Nicaragua (41) and Pakistan (40-50); Jamaica reports a pupil-teacher ratio of 45-55:1, a range indicative of average class sizes of at least 50. Tanzania mentions in this connection that the introduction of universal primary education from 1977 onwards has led to a sharp rise in average class sizes in primary schools. Bangladesh reports an average class size in excess of the permitted maximum; Cameroon, Cyprus and Kuwait report averages at substantially the same levels as the permitted maxima - which would suggest that those maxima are exceeded in a certain number of cases (unless a system of regulation is used such as that in force in primary education in the Netherlands, where as soon as the number of pupils in a school exceeds a certain level an additional teacher must be recruited).

282. In secondary schools, as in primary schools, maximum permitted class sizes are stated to be in the 30-40 pupil range in the great majority of the countries which provided information on the subject. The highest figure given is 50, for Bangladesh (upper secondary), India and Japan (lower secondary), and the lowest 25 for



Table IX: Permitted and average class sizes (and/or pupil-teacher ratios) in replying countries

Country	Maximum permitted class size		Actual class size (average) (public schools)		Remarks
	Primary (2)	Secondary (3)	Primary (4)	Secondary (5)	
Argentina	—	40	19	31	Col.4: urban, 26; rural, 8.
Australia <sup>1</sup> (Capital territory) 1972	{ 30:1	32:1	25.7:1	16.2:1	Col.4: private schools: 1972, 28.6:1; 1978: 24.0:1.
1978		25:1	21.1:1	12.8:1	
Bangladesh	40	40, 50	52	42	Col.5: private schools: 1972, 18.8:1; 1978: 16.2:1.
Barbados <sup>1</sup>	30:1	25:1	25:1	19:1	Cols.4 and 5: figures for urban areas (corresponding figures for rural areas, 36 and 32).
Bulgaria	20-30	35			
Byelorussian SSR (1978-79)	40	35	24.9, 24.6	24.6, 26.3	Col.4: grades 1-3, 4-6. Col.5: grades 7-8, 9-10. Average class sizes in rural areas considerably lower than in urban areas.
Cameroon	{ 50	{ 40	49	37	
1976			51	40	
Canada (Alberta)	{ -	{ -	—	24.7	
1976			—	23.5	
1980					

Table IX (cont.)

(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
Canada (Ontario) <sup>1</sup> 1973 1979	{ -	{ -	25.1 23.5:1	17.1:1 17.1:1	Actual averages expected to remain at 1979 levels till 1990.
Canada (Quebec)	27, 29	33	25, 27	30	Trend towards smaller class sizes, achieved by negotiation.
Chile	45	45	.	.	Figures apply to both public and State-supported private schools.
Cuba <sup>1</sup>	varies according to size of classroom available		18:1	13:1	Col.5: basic secondary education.
Cyprus	35	25(max), 20(min)	35	38, 35	Cols.4 and 5: figures for urban areas; corresponding figures for rural areas 30, 30, 20.
Czechoslovakia 1974 1981	{ 34	{ 40	19.6 21.1	13.4 14.8	
Ecuador	-----	40 -----	33:1 <sup>1</sup>	15:1 <sup>1</sup>	Cols.4 and 5: figures for country as a whole (both public and private schools).
Egypt	50	40, 36	.	.	
Finland	25, 32	32, -	19.9, 28.0	28.0, 29.1	Unit is basic teaching group. Cols.2 and 4: first figure, grades 1 and 2, second figure, grades 3-6. Cols.3 and 5: first figure, grades 7-9. No maximum for upper secondary. Population trends make for decrease in average class sizes.

Table IX (cont.)

(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
France	20-25	30, 40	24, 3:1 <sup>1</sup>	23.85, 127.7 18.2:1 <sup>1</sup> , 15.1:1 <sup>1</sup>	Col.2: indicative. Col.4: average class size in lower secondary schools in 1976-77: 26.2.
Gabon	.	.	45	30	Col.4: in urban areas classes of up to 130 pupils encountered. Col.5: in principal towns, 40.
German Democratic Republic	30	-	-----	21.8	Cols.4 and 5: urban areas: average 24; rural areas: average 19-19.5. Since 1974, average class size has decreased by 4 pupils. Trend continuing.
Germany, Federal Republic	-	-	28 24	29, 32 26, 30	Cols.2 and 3: Maxima vary from State to State. Col.4: grades 1-4. Col.5: lower secondary, grades 5-10, upper secondary, grades 11-13. It is government policy to reduce class sizes. Class sizes believed smaller in rural than in urban areas.
Guyana	40	35	30.8	29.7, 40.9	
Hungary					
1975	{ 15-40	{ 30-40	25.5	31.4	Cols.2 and 3: minimum and maximum permitted sizes. As a result of population growth, class sizes expected to rise until 1992.
1980			26.6	30.5	Class sizes higher in urban than in rural areas.

Table IX (cont.)

(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
India	—	50	—	30-40	—
Indonesia 1976 1980	{ -	{ -	30 33	40, 36 41, 38	Col.4: private schools, 32. Col.5: private schools, 40.
Ireland 1974-75 1979-80	{ —	40	33.0 32.1	(28.5, 22.7	Col.4: class sizes larger in urban than in rural areas. Col.5: figures for 1976-77. No significant change in averages expected.
Israel 1973-74 1980-81	{ 40	{ 40, 38	— —	27 28.6	Cols.4 and 5: class sizes larger in urban than rural areas.
Italy (1978-79)	16-25	25-30	16.6 16.3:1 <sup>1</sup>	22.7 11.5:1 <sup>1</sup>	Col.5: pupil-teacher ratio figure is for 1977-78.
Jamaica <sup>1</sup>	.	.	45-55:1	30:1	
Japan (1974-78)	50	50, 40	33	37	Col.4: private schools, 36. Col.5: private schools, 44. Col.5: lower secondary only. Averages remained stable over entire period. No significant change expected.
Jordan 1974 1980	{ variable	{ variable	37.5 34.1	32.3, 35.8 31.3, 35.3	Cols.2 and 3: the higher the level of the class, the higher the maximum permissible class size.

Table IX (cont.)

(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
Kenya	50	40, 35	.	.	
Kuwait 1973-74	{ {30	{ {30	32.1 (boys) 30.8 (girls)	26.6 (boys) 27.4 (girls)	Cols. 4 and 5: upper secondary only. Average expected to have risen by one unit by end of 1983.
1977-78	{ {	{ {	30.9 (boys) 30.7 (girls)	28.5 (boys and girls)	
Madagascar	70	70	45	45	
Malta	30	30, 25	23.76	22.44	Col. 5: private schools, maximum 30. No change anticipated.
Mauritius				40-45	
Netherlands <sup>1</sup> 1972	{31.1	{variable	29-31:1	.	No significant changes anticipated before end 1983.
1979	{	{	26-27:1	.	
New Zealand <sup>1</sup> 1974	{35:1	{35:1	25.0:1	17.1:1	Cols. 2 and 3: maxima for individual classes; over-all average pupil-teacher ratio in any school should be 25-31:1 in primary and lower secondary schools and 20-25.6:1 in upper secondary schools. Private schools: averages lower than in State schools.
1979	{	{	24.2:1	15.1:1	

Table IX (cont.)

(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
Nicaragua	—	35-45	—	41:1 <sup>1</sup>	—
Norway	(	12-30	16.3:1 <sup>1</sup> 14.7:1 <sup>1</sup>	12.3:1 <sup>1</sup> 10.8:1 <sup>1</sup>	—
1974					
1978					
Pakistan	-	-	—	40-50	—
Papua New Guinea <sup>1</sup>			31.2:1	25.8:1, 16.2:1	
Peru	(	30-45	24 23	41 39	
1974					
1980					
Philippines	40	40	.	.	
Spain	40	40	30.5		

Cols. 2 and 3: minimum and maximum. Cols. 4 and 5: figure is for urban areas (rural, 48:1).

Cols. 2 and 3: maximum varies according to number of pupils in school, number of year groups in class and type of education. Col. 4: average class size: 1974: 21.2; 1978, 21.0.

Col. 2: in private schools ideal pupil-teacher ratio is 25-30:1. Cols. 4 and 5: figures include both public and private schools. Private schools: range 25-70.

In emergencies, classes of up to 50 pupils are permissible. In a two-session school the same teacher may have morning and afternoon classes of up to 30 pupils each.

Col. 4: figures apply to basic general education (primary and lower secondary); private schools, 36.5.

Table IX (cont.)

(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
Sri Lanka	55	45	25.3-30.5	19.2-28.5	Col.2: first figure, pupils aged 7-9; second figure, aged 10-15. Col.3: upper secondary. Col.5: figures for 1979-80; lower figure for upper secondary applies to top class. In primary education average class sizes tend to be lower in rural than in urban areas.
Sweden	25, 30	30	20-23	26.5, 21-27	
Tanzania	.	.	45	35-40, 22-25	Since 1977, average class sizes in primary schools have risen sharply following the introduction of universal primary education.
Thailand	.	.	45	40	Cols.4 and 5: actual range 20-50.
Tunisia 1974-75 1980-81	{ 30-38	{ 40, 36	36(41.1 <sup>1</sup> ) 33.8(38.7:1 <sup>1</sup> )	31.0 34.2(20:1 <sup>1</sup> )	
Ukrainian SSR	40	35			Col.2: first 8 grades. Col.3: grades 9, 10.

Table IX (concl.)

(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
United Kingdom (England)					
1960	{	determined locally	33.1(29.4:1 <sup>1</sup> )	30.0(20.7:1 <sup>1</sup> )	
1970	{		32.7(27.5:1 <sup>1</sup> )	23.0(23.0:1 <sup>1</sup> )	
1980	{		25.7(22.7:1 <sup>1</sup> )	21.6(21.6:1 <sup>1</sup> )	
(Scotland)					
1974	{33	{33, 30	29	21	Cols.2 and 3: normal maxima
1979	{33	{33, 30	24	19	(absolute maxima: 39; 39; 34).
(Northern Ireland) <sup>1</sup>	33:1	35:1	23.8:1	15.3:1	Cols.2 and 3: maxima negotiated with unions.
	—	27-35	—	25-30:1 <sup>1</sup>	Cols.4 and 5: figures for 1981.
United States					Cols.2 and 3: range in 20 States which set ceilings on class sizes.
USSR	40	35			Col.2: first 8 grades.
Venezuela		30			Col.3: grades 9 and 10.

N.B. Where two figures appear in the same column separated by a comma, the first figure applies to the lower grades, and the second to the higher, in the category of schools concerned.

<sup>1</sup> Pupil-teacher ratio.

. = Information not provided.

- = None fixed.



Cyprus, Finland (lower secondary) and Malta (upper secondary). In most countries the maxima for secondary school classes are lower than, or the same as, those for primary schools; but they are higher in Canada (Quebec), Czechoslovakia, France and Northern Ireland, in lower secondary education in Tunisia, and in upper secondary education in Bangladesh and Guyana. The actual average class sizes reported are, as with primary schools, significantly below the permitted maxima in practically all cases. The majority of the countries which provide actual average class sizes give figures in the 26-40 range, but Canada (Alberta), the German Democratic Republic, Italy, Malta, Sweden, Tanzania and the United Kingdom (England and Wales) report averages of over 20 but less than 25, and two countries report averages of less than 20 - Czechoslovakia (14.8) and Scotland (19). Some of the pupil-teacher ratios reported - Australia (Capital Territory) 12.8:1, Cuba 13:1, Ecuador 15:1, France (in upper secondary schools) and New Zealand 15.1:1, and Norway 10.8:1 - suggest that in those countries too the average class size in secondary education is small.

283. The following countries provided separate figures for class sizes and/or pupil-teacher ratios in urban (U) and rural (R) areas: Argentina (primary): 26 (U), 8 (R); Bangladesh (primary): 52 (U), 36 (R); (secondary): 42 (U), 32 (R); Cyprus: 30-39 (U), 20-30 (R); German Democratic Republic: 24 (U), 19-19.5 (R); Nicaragua: pupil-teacher ratio 41:1 (U), 48:1 (R). The Byelorussian SSR, Gabon, the Federal Republic of Germany, Hungary, Ireland, Israel and Sweden all indicate that average class sizes are lower in rural than in urban areas.

284. A few countries - Australia (Capital Territory), Indonesia, Japan, Malta, New Zealand, Peru and Spain - gave some indication of average class sizes or pupil-teacher ratios in private schools. In all these countries except New Zealand average class sizes in private schools appear to be significantly greater than in public schools.

285. A number of countries gave figures on class sizes and/or pupil-teacher ratios spanning several years. Those provided by Australia (for the Capital Territory), Canada (Alberta, Ontario), Federal Republic of Germany, Japan, Jordan, Netherlands, New Zealand, Norway, Peru and the United Kingdom (England and Wales, Scotland) show a general downward trend; those for Cameroon, Czechoslovakia, Indonesia and Israel show a general upward trend. In Ireland, Kuwait and Tunisia class sizes or pupil-teacher ratios are falling in primary schools and rising in secondary schools; in Hungary the opposite is the case. In Japan no significant change occurred during the reference period given (1974-78).

286. A few countries provided forecasts of expected trends up to the end of 1983 and in some cases beyond. Canada (Ontario), Ireland, Malta, the Netherlands and Sweden do not anticipate any significant change in the situation in the near future; Finland (on account of population trends), Cyprus and the Federal Republic of Germany (on account of government policies in this field) and the German Democratic Republic anticipate further reductions; and Guyana (on account of population trends) and Kuwait expect average class sizes to increase. Pakistan intends to decrease class sizes as additional funds for education become available.

287. On the subject of the effect of the introduction of new teaching methods and techniques on average class sizes and pupil-teacher ratios, 27 of the replying governments did not give any information; a further 20 said that the new techniques had had no effect, or no significant effect, on class sizes and pupil-teacher ratios. Of the remainder, four (Australia (Capital Territory), Barbados, Czechoslovakia and Tunisia) stated that, while the new methods had not affected class sizes, they had facilitated the splitting up of classes into groups for special projects, team teaching, etc. In Canada, Quebec stated that the new techniques only affected the size of experimental classes; Alberta that they only affected the size of remedial classes and classes for the handicapped; and Ontario considered that no cause and effect relationship between the new techniques and the general downward trend in class sizes had been identified. There appeared to have been some effect at the primary level of education in Italy and at the secondary level in Egypt.

288. Indonesia hoped that the new techniques would facilitate the achievement of greater productivity in education, enabling teachers to take classes of more than 40 pupils or even two classes simultaneously.

289. It should be noted that in some countries, such as Chile, the use of new teaching techniques appears still to be on an experimental basis.

Hours of work (paragraphs 89-93)

290. The six questions put on paragraphs 89-93 related to actual hours of work or class hours; the extent to which the factors mentioned in paragraph 90 are taken into account; the nature of the responsibilities other than class teaching falling (on a compulsory or a voluntary basis) on teachers; the arrangements made to adjust working hours where teachers engage in extra-curricular activities and to enable teachers to participate in in-service training programmes; and the participation of teachers in the fixing of standards concerning hours and volume of work.

Actual hours of work

291. Almost all the replies received contain information concerning teachers' hours of work (usually in the form of daily or weekly class contact hours).

292. The information provided on this subject is summarised in table X below. Except where otherwise stated, the figures relate to public schools.

293. The great majority of the replies indicate, either the amount of time spent teaching each week (and sometimes each day) by the teachers concerned, or the numbers of classroom periods taken by teachers per day. In most cases the normal maximum permissible hours are given; in a few cases minima are given as well. A few of the replies contain information on teaching hours actually worked. Several give figures concerning total weekly working hours as well as teaching hours.

294. In the great majority of countries for which the information related to hours of teaching, the amount of time spent on teaching weekly varies between 20 and 30 hours; the lowest level (16 hours) is found in secondary schools in Venezuela (for full-time teachers) and the highest (35 hours) in Chile (eighth-grade classes) and Thailand.

295. Many of the governments which provided information on the number of classroom periods taken by a teacher each day or each week omitted to specify the length of each period; in most of the countries which did provide information on this point, the duration of a classroom period is 40, 45 or 50 minutes. The shortest duration reported is 30 minutes in certain primary schools in Indonesia and the maximum 60 minutes in Argentina and in primary schools in Nicaragua. The number of periods to be taken per week falls somewhere between 20 and 30 in most cases; the largest number reported were in Indonesia and in secondary schools in Nicaragua (40) and the smallest in France (15 for agrégés). In Cyprus and Luxembourg, teachers have their compulsory teaching hours reduced after a certain period of service.

296. Several countries gave some indication of the total working hours (including non-teaching as well as teaching work). In Austria, Chile and the Netherlands a 40-hour working week is applied; in Bulgaria, teachers work a 6-day, 46-hour week; in Finland, the working week compares 37-1/2 hours; in Hungary, it is 44 hours; in Jordan, it is 36; in Sri Lanka, it is 30.

Account taken of the factors mentioned  
in paragraph 90 of the Recommendation

297. On the question relating to the account taken of the factors mentioned in paragraph 90 of the Recommendation, 24 of the responding governments either did not reply or gave information which makes no reference either to the Recommendation or to the specific factors referred to in paragraph 90, while 22 (Australia, Austria, Canada (Alberta, Ontario), Cuba, German Democratic Republic, Guyana, Ireland, Italy, Jamaica, Japan, Kuwait, Mauritius, New Zealand, Nicaragua (where possible), Norway, Pakistan, Spain, Sweden, Tunisia, Ukrainian SSR, USSR) state that all the considerations mentioned in paragraph 90 are taken into account. The Netherlands state that all relevant factors are taken into account.

298. Several governments (Bulgaria, Cyprus, Czechoslovakia, Ecuador, Egypt, Finland, Federal Republic of Germany, Indonesia, Jordan, Peru and Thailand) state that some, but not all, of the factors mentioned in paragraph 90 are taken into account or mention those factors in their replies. Six of those countries refer to the factor mentioned in subparagraph (a), nine to that mentioned in

Table X: Maximum class contact hours in public schools, 1980-81

Country	Daily hours or periods	Weekly hours or periods	Remarks
Argentina primary secondary	4 x 60 min. 6 x 60 min.	20 x 60 min. 30 x 60 min.	
Austria federal employees provincial employees		27 hours 24 hours	Within 40-hour week. Established in agreement with teachers' organisations.
Bangladesh	On average 5 x 40 min.		Attendance requirement 37 hours per week (of 6 days).
Barbados primary secondary	7 x 40 min. 6 x 40 min.	35 x 40 min. 30 x 40 min.	
Bulgaria grades 1-3 grades 4-8 grades 9-10		22 x 45 min. 24 x 45 min. 36 x 45 min.	All teachers work a 6-day, 46-hour week.
Byelorussian SSR		18 hours	Minimum: up to 27 hours permitted.
Canada Alberta	5 hours, 20 min.	26 hours, 40 min.	Actual average instruction hours in the 11 city systems in the province: primary, 24.82 hours; lower secondary, 23.83 hours, upper secondary, 22.1 hours.
Quebec primary secondary		22 hours, 30 min. 22 x 50 min.	

Table X (cont.)

Country	Daily hours or periods	Weekly hours or periods	Remarks
Chile (grades 1-8)		30-35 hours	Classwork requirement varies from grade to grade (grade 1, 30; grade 8, 35). Total working week: minimum, 30 hours; maximum, 40 hours.
Colombia primary secondary		30 hours 20-24 hours	
Cyprus primary secondary		30 x 45 min. 26 x 45 min.	Six-day week. Number of periods reduced by 2 per week after 10 years' service and by a further 2 after 20 years.
Czechoslovakia basic secondary		21-23 hours 19 hours	In grades 1-4, 23; in grades 5 and above, 21.
Ecuador		35 periods (for full-time teachers)	Working hours must be spread over the 5 or 6 working days of the week.
Egypt	average 4 hours	average 24 hours	
Finland comprehensive upper secondary		23 hours 17-22 hours	Corresponds to working hours of public servants (37.5 hours/week). Secondary: hours vary according to subject taught.
France		15-27 periods	Instituteur, 27; professeur général d'enseignement des collèges, 21; professeur certifié, 18; professeur agrégé, 15.

Table X (cont.)

Country	Daily hours or periods	Weekly hours or periods	Remarks
German Democratic Republic		22-24 hours	Minimum.
Germany, Federal Republic	primary and lower secondary	27-28 hours	Nation-wide averages; actual requirements vary from State to State.
	upper secondary	23-24 hours	
Guyana		25 hours	Somewhat less for secondary school teachers.
Hungary	lower primary	23 hours	Within 44-hour working week which is general practice in Hungary.
	upper primary	21 hours	
	secondary	20 hours	
Indonesia	primary	minimum 25 x 30 or 40 min. maximum 40	In private establishments teachers give not less than 24 hours of instruction each week
	secondary	minimum 18 x 45 min. maximum 40	
Ireland	primary	22 hours	Minimum.
	secondary	24 hours 18 hours	
Italy	primary		Minimum (5-day week).
	secondary	5 hours	
Jamaica		5 hours	

Table X (cont.)

Country	Daily hours or periods	Weekly hours or periods	Remarks
Japan			
primary		22.4 hours	Averages in October 1977. In public schools the working day is 8 hours and the working week 44. In private schools working hours may not exceed 8 per day or 48 per week.
lower secondary		17.8 hours	
upper secondary		14.6 hours	
Jordan			
primary		26 periods	Normal working week deemed to be 36 hours.
secondary		24 periods	
Kuwait			
primary		30 periods	Actual teaching hours: primary, 16-22; lower secondary, 10-18; upper secondary, 10-21.
secondary		37 periods	
Luxembourg			
primary		26 x 50 min.	Reduced with length of service.
secondary		22 x 50 min.	
Malta			
primary		27 1/2 hours	Within 40-hour working week.
secondary		26 x 45 min.	
Mauritius			
	6 x 50 min.		
Netherlands			
primary		26 x 50 min.	Actual requirement varies according to level of education.
secondary		29 x 50 min.	
New Zealand			
	5 x 1 hour or 7 x 45 min.	25-27 hours	

Table X (cont.)

Country	Daily hours or periods	Weekly hours or periods	Remarks
Nicaragua primary secondary (full-time)	5 x 1 hour 8 x 45 min.	25 x 1 hour 40 x 45 min.	
Norway basic secondary		22-29 periods 17-26 periods	Number of periods varies according to subject and to level of school.
Philippines	6 hours	30 hours	In emergencies teachers may be required to teach 2 hours per day above the maximum (at overtime rates of pay).
Spain	6 hours		Within 8-hour working day.
Sri Lanka primary secondary		22 hours 25 hours	Working hours 6 per day and 30 per week; time not taken up by class work is available for preparation.
Sweden age group 7-12 age group 13-15 age group over 15		29 x 40 min. 24 x 40 min. 21 x 40 min.	
Switzerland primary secondary		26-36 x 45 or 50 min. 22-25 x 40 or 45 min.	Hours vary from canton to canton.
Thailand		35 hours	Corresponds to actual working hours.
Tunisia primary secondary		30 hours 18 hours	

Table X (concl.)

Country	Daily hours or periods	Weekly hours or periods	Remarks
Ukrainian SSR primary secondary		27 hours 27 hours	Within a 41-hour working week. Norms are 24 hours for primary and 18 for secondary school teachers.
United Kingdom Scotland primary		25 hours	No formalised requirement for secondary school teachers.
Northern Ireland		20 hours	Minimum.
USSR		18 hours	Minimum: up to 27 teaching hours per week permitted.
Venezuela primary secondary (full-time)	6 hours	30 hours 16 hours	Within 36-hour week.



subparagraph (b), two to that mentioned in subparagraph (c), eight to those mentioned in subparagraph (d) and six to those mentioned in subparagraph (e).

299. Certain other factors are mentioned by some countries. Canada (Quebec) takes into account the number of lessons assigned to be taught each week; the Federal Republic of Germany mentions the additional burden of teaching in more than one school; Peru mentions educational activities within the community.

300. The Canadian Teachers' Federation and Malta state that the numbers of class hours taught are fixed by negotiation with the teachers' organisations concerned. In the United States, several of the factors referred to in paragraph 90 are recognised in a number of States as negotiable elements.

301. Venezuela states that in present circumstances, it is impossible to take into account all the factors mentioned in paragraph 90 of the Recommendation.

#### Responsibilities other than class teaching

302. Practically all the responding governments provided information on this subject.

303. The responsibilities other than class teaching assigned to teachers mentioned by the replying governments are many and varied. The pedagogic responsibilities mentioned included the preparation of lessons, of teaching material, of lesson plans and of course schedules; the preparation and marking of exercises, of homework and of examination papers; invigilation at examinations; the correction of pupils' work generally; the preparation of reports on pupil performance and the provision of individual attention for pupils requiring it; participation in pupil assessment; co-operation with other staff members; private study, in-service training and attendance at demonstration lessons; advice to pupils on study programmes; and meetings with parents. The activities less directly related to the actual teaching process, but performed in school, include the keeping of records of attendance and of work done; supervision of pupils during breaks; the organisation of games; attendance at staff meetings; participation in induction training for new teachers; and administrative tasks of various kinds, including the collection of fees. The extra-curricular activities mentioned include participation in the organisation and running of school clubs and societies and of sports and games activities; the organisation of excursions and of holiday activities such as camps; the running of the school library or co-operative; giving career advice; and giving road safety training. In the course of their work, teachers may need to maintain contacts with youth organisations, pupils' associations, parents' organisations, trade union branches and national service organisations. Lastly, in a number of countries teachers may, within the context of their jobs, have responsibilities outside the school and in the broader context of the community, participating in welfare work; community development activities of a great variety of different kinds, adult education activities, family planning work, and even participation in the administration of elections and population censuses.

304. It is clear from the above that the responding governments have not all interpreted the question on this point in the same fashion. To take one example, some governments refer to the preparation of lessons and the preparation, setting and marking of exercises as responsibilities separate from that of class teaching (even though they form an integral and essential part of the process of teaching in class), whereas other governments state that their teachers have no responsibilities other than teaching (although the teachers concerned certainly do prepare their lessons and prepare, set and mark exercises). In addition, certain tasks which are considered compulsory by some countries are considered voluntary, or are not mentioned at all, by others. There are certain tasks - such as the marking of exercises and of homework, the keeping of class records and meetings with parents - which appear to be essential parts of teaching and are considered to be compulsory in all the countries in which they are specifically mentioned; but none of these items is mentioned by more than a dozen or so governments. Participation in the general administrative work of the school is stated to be compulsory in nine countries and voluntary in four; in four others this type of work is stated to be the responsibility of teachers in promoted posts. In the field of extra-curricular activities generally, participation appears to be voluntary in the majority of the countries which make specific reference to the subject; but in some it is compulsory in respect of some or all extra-curricular activities. Several countries adopt the approach that all work done during school hours, or during the standard

working week, forms part of the normal duties of a teacher; some make specific allowance for non-teaching duties in the determination of the normal work week. Others appear to rely on a tradition of voluntarism for the performance of many non-teaching tasks. Others again include among teachers' responsibilities a number of tasks reaching beyond the normal framework of school activities and into the field of community welfare and development.

305. The compulsory workload of a teacher varies greatly from country to country. At one extreme, teachers in, for instance, Canada (Ontario), Cyprus, Luxembourg and Mauritius are not required to perform any non-teaching work, while in Malta they may only be requested to undertake supervision during breaks. At the other extreme, teachers in Chile are required to perform administrative work, participate in extra-curricular activities, attend meetings with parents and class councils and participate in community activities, even to the extent of working on Sundays and public holidays; while in Indonesia they are required to give information, counsel and guidance on a wide range of subjects to the communities in which they live. In an intermediate position are countries which endeavour to organise the compulsory workload of teachers within a fixed number of hours per week; these include Bulgaria (6 days, 46 hours), Chile (44 hours), Finland (37.5 hours - the same as public officials), Hungary (44 hours - as for workers in general), Japan (8 per day, 44 per week), Jordan (36 hours - as for government employees) and Peru (40 hours).

#### Extra-curricular activities

306. The question put specifically relating to paragraph 93 of the Recommendation sought information on how the working hours of teachers engaging in extra-curricular activities are rearranged to avoid overwork and on whether extra pay is given in respect of extra-curricular activities.

307. A substantial number of the replying countries appear to deal with the problem by separating extra-curricular activities from normal school hours, treating such activities as voluntary and leaving the decision on whether or not to participate in them to the individual teacher. This is the case, for instance, in Australia, Barbados, the Byelorussian SSR, Canada (Alberta and Ontario), Chile, Ecuador, India, Ireland, Jamaica, Madagascar, New Zealand, Norway and the United Kingdom. There are indications that in some at least of these countries, it is customary among teachers to participate in a certain amount of extra-curricular activity on a voluntary basis (Australia, for instance, makes specific reference to the short working week and the professional standing of teachers in this context).

308. There are, however, several countries in which teaching hours may be reduced to offset the burden of extra-curricular activities. These include Bangladesh, Canada (Ontario), Egypt, the Federal Republic of Germany, Guyana, Hungary, Indonesia, Iraq, Israel (some types of activity), Luxembourg, Sweden, Thailand and the Ukrainian SSR.

309. In several of the replying countries, normal working hours are officially deemed to include a certain amount of extra-curricular activity. In Austria, extra-curricular activities are taken account of in the over-all teaching commitment and are usually treated as extra working hours. In Chile, extra-curricular activities are considered as forming a normal element of a teacher's workload and falling within his 44-hour normal working week. In Italy, all teachers are expected to work 20 hours per month on non-teaching activities, including extra-curricular activities. In Jordan, extra-curricular activities are organised during teachers' free hours. Kuwait distinguishes between extra-curricular activities which fall within school hours (which are considered as forming part of a teacher's normal workload) and those which fall outside school hours (which are not). A similar situation seems to exist in Iraq. Some school districts in Canada (Alberta) reduce the teaching hours of physical education teachers, who are often involved in sports activities outside school hours.

310. Two countries - Cuba and Malta - state that the hours of work of a teacher performing extra-curricular activities are rearranged to avoid overwork without giving details. Kenya also rearranges hours of work; so does Tunisia, but that country states that there is no reduction of teaching hours to compensate for the additional burden of extra-curricular activities.

311. Venezuela states that teachers in that country do not perform any extra-curricular activities.

312. On the question of pay for extra-curricular activities, 19 of the 37 governments which supplied information stated that participation in extra-curricular activities does not give rise to additional payments. The German Democratic Republic, Indonesia, Iraq and the Ukrainian SSR state that teachers do or may receive remuneration for performance of extra-curricular activities; Cyprus, Israel, Peru and Thailand state that payments are made in respect of some types of activity only (Peru mentions literacy promotion); Japan and Kuwait make extra payments where the activities have to be performed outside school hours; Canada (Quebec) makes payments where the school has requested a teacher to undertake extra-curricular activities (but not where he volunteers); Czechoslovakia, Italy and Jordan make payments to the extent that time spent on such activities brings total working hours above the established norm; and Hungary and Luxembourg offer a choice between extra pay and compensatory time off. Chile gives compensatory rest where the activities are performed on a Sunday or a public holiday. In some states of the United States, payment for extra-curricular activities is a negotiable item in collective bargaining.

#### In-service training

313. Paragraph 91 of the Recommendation on in-service training is applied, in one way or another in practically all the countries the governments of which replied on the point. Only Madagascar stated that no arrangements for the purpose existed.

314. Of the governments giving information on this point, 26 state that teachers undergoing in-service training are granted leave of absence with pay to attend courses. However, the granting of such leave is not automatic. Several governments (including Japan, Malta, Spain and Scotland) specify that leave is given in some cases; Canada (Quebec) and Finland state that the necessary leave with pay is given only if the teacher is requested by his employer to undergo training; Peru grants leave only for courses sponsored by the Ministry of Education.

315. A few countries will, if necessary, arrange a teacher's working hours to enable him to attend in-service training courses during school opening hours. Argentina, Bangladesh, Egypt, Guyana, Jamaica and Jordan all have recourse to this practice.

316. In certain countries, a teacher is allowed a certain amount of time off each week or each year to attend in-service courses. Thus, in Canada (Alberta and parts of Ontario) and Norway teachers are allowed a certain number of days off school each year (known in Canada as "professional development days") for training purposes. (In Norway, a teacher may, in addition to these days, apply for leave without pay to undergo in-service training.) Jordan organises its teaching schedules in such a way as to give teachers one day off each week which they may use to attend in-service training courses. In the USSR, a similar arrangement exists to facilitate independent study. Cyprus reduces the working hours of teachers attending in-service training courses (1 day and 4 periods per week for probationers, 80 minutes per week for established teachers). In Italy, time for in-service training is included in the 20 hours of non-teaching work a teacher is required to perform each month.

317. In a significant number of countries, however, in-service training courses, or a substantial proportion of them, take place outside school hours. This is the case, for instance, in Barbados, Canada (Ontario), Ecuador, Iraq, Kenya, Kuwait, Scotland and Spain. In addition, Australia, Cuba, Ecuador, the German Democratic Republic, Indonesia, Spain, Sweden and Tanzania all organise some at least of their in-service training courses during the school vacations. In Scotland, some local authorities designate specific days for in-service training on which pupils do not attend school; others make no such provision, and the teachers in their employ wishing to undergo in-service training have to do so in their own time.

318. In some countries, it appears that the length of the school vacation is calculated so as to allow some time for in-service training. The information in the section on holidays with pay is relevant here.

Role of teachers' organisations in the  
fixing of standards concerning hours and  
volume of work

319. Fifty-one of the responding governments gave specific information on the application of paragraph 89 of the Recommendation, which deals with this subject. Eleven of them (Chile, Ecuador, Egypt, Guyana, Jordan, Kenya, Madagascar, Peru, Philippines, Spain, Sri Lanka) stated that teachers are not consulted, or not normally consulted, in the fixing of hours of work. Private school teachers in the Philippines, however, negotiate on the subject.

320. In the other countries, the degree of consultation varies and sometimes the wording used to describe it is vague. In Argentina and Tanzania, teachers' organisations may "make suggestions"; in Bangladesh and Tanzania, they may "make representations"; in Pakistan and Tunisia, they "co-operate"; in France, the Federal Republic of Germany, Luxembourg, Malta, the Netherlands, New Zealand and Northern Ireland, they are "consulted"; in Australia, they "make submissions" to the conciliation and arbitration machinery; in Iraq, they "have representatives on the decision-making bodies"; in Nicaragua, the Government and the teachers' organisations "work together"; in Hungary, Ireland and Jamaica, the Government has "discussions" with the teachers' organisations; in Barbados, Cuba and Cyprus, the organisations "participate"; in the provinces of Canada, Finland, Italy, Japan, Mauritius, Mexico, Sweden, certain states of the United States and Venezuela, teachers' organisations "negotiate"; in the Byelorussian SSR, the German Democratic Republic, Israel, Norway and the Ukrainian SSR, hours are fixed "in agreement with" the teachers' organisations; and in the USSR, the teachers' organisations are "involved" in the setting of hours.

Annual holidays with pay (paragraph 91)

321. Governments were asked to provide information on the length of school vacations; the actual period of teachers' annual holidays in the light of their professional obligations concerning school vacations; and the status of teachers during school vacations, particularly with regard to employment relationship and remuneration.

322. Table XI summarises the information supplied in reply to the questions on annual holidays with pay for teachers from the 53 governments which provided specific information on the subject.

323. The following observations can be made on the figures in the table.

324. In the great majority of the countries from which replies were received, the length of school vacations ranges from 10 to 16 weeks per year. The shortest vacations reported were in Bulgaria (two months), Cuba (two months in secondary schools) and Papua New Guinea (minimum nine weeks); the longest were 16 weeks in France, 17 in Japan, 20 in Indonesia and 17-20 in Kuwait. In a few cases, public and religious holidays formed a significant part of total vacations (in Israel as much as 50 days).

325. As regards teachers' holidays, although in the majority of the reporting countries, they were in the 10-14 weeks range (the biggest clusters being at 10 and 12 weeks), the spread was much greater, ranging from 17-20 weeks in Kuwait and 16 weeks in France to 4 weeks in secondary schools in Cuba, 27 days in the German Democratic Republic (with a further 20 days for study if required) and 12 days in Indonesia.

326. In the majority of the countries which provided sufficient information to throw light on the question, teachers are in practice on holiday throughout the school vacations. However, in a number of countries, their official holidays are the same as those of public servants generally; during the remainder of the school vacations, they are considered to be on standby duty and liable - in principle, at least - to recall for the performance of specific tasks such as organising examinations, administrative work, planning for the new term, etc. This is the case in Australia, Canada (Ontario), France, the Federal Republic of Germany, Italy, Japan, Kenya, Pakistan, Papua New Guinea and Spain. They may also be asked to take part in vacation activities such as supportive class work on a voluntary basis; this is the case in Luxembourg.

Table XI: Annual school vacations, annual holidays of teachers, employment status and pay entitlements

Country	School vacations	Teachers' annual holiday	Employment status and pay entitlements during holidays and vacations
Argentina	10 weeks (30.12-23.2 and 2 weeks in July). Often no activity in Dec.	30.12-23.2 All of Dec. if school inactive.	During vacations teachers enjoy full pay and social security coverage. If teacher has served only part of year, vacation pay is prorated.
Australia	10-12 weeks per year (6-7 in summer)	4 weeks in Dec.-Jan. Rest of vacation: on standby status.	Teachers receive full pay during holiday and standby periods.
Bangladesh	85 days, including 26 days in summer and 30 during Ramadan.	85 days	Employed status continues; teachers remain on full pay.
Barbados	14 weeks (3 at Christmas, 2 at Easter, 9 in summer)	14 weeks; but must attend staff meetings and in-service training courses (total 2-3 weeks per year)	Teachers remain on full pay (like other State employees).
Bulgaria	winter and spring: 10 days each; summer: primary, 3 months; secondary, 2 months	2 months	Teachers remain on full pay (like other State employees).
Byelorussian SSR	.	48 working days	

Table XI (cont.)

Country	School vacations	Teachers' annual holiday	Employment status and pay entitlements during holidays and vacations
Canada			
Alberta	12 weeks (2 at Christmas, 1 at Easter, all July and Aug.)	12 weeks (no responsibilities during vacations)	Teachers are paid over the 12 months of the year.
Ontario	11-12 weeks (1 or 2 at Christmas, 1 at Easter, all July and Aug.)	Same as school vacation, but on standby status (many use half or more of summer vacation for in-service training).	Teachers' contracts cover the 12 months of the year.
Quebec	About 10 weeks	About 10 weeks (no obligation of service outside 200 days of class teaching to be performed between Sept. and June each year).	Pay and social security entitlements maintained throughout calendar year.
Chile	16 weeks (mid-Dec. - early Mar.; 2 weeks in July; 1 in Sept.)	Public: about 10 weeks (remainder of vacation spent on planning, examinations, administrative work, etc.). Private: min. 15 working days; in practice same as public.	In all cases, status and remuneration maintained throughout year.
Colombia	Either: Holy Week; mid-June - mid-July; 1.12-20.1 (total 12 weeks); Or: Holy Week; 16.12-7.1; and all of July and Aug. (13 weeks)	Whole of vacation period.	Teachers in public schools remain on full salary; teachers in private schools do not.
Cuba	Primary: 11 weeks Secondary: 2 months	Primary: 1 month and 3 weeks Secondary: 1 month	Pay continues throughout holidays.

Table XI (cont.)

Country	School vacations	Teachers' annual holiday	Employment status and pay entitlements during holidays and vacations
Cyprus	Primary: 16 weeks (2 each at Christmas and Easter; all of July and Aug.; and 20 public holidays); Secondary: 13 weeks incl. 2 weeks each at Christmas and Easter; 10 July - 31 Aug.; 14 public holidays.	Same as vacations.	Permanent teachers receive full pay throughout holidays. Those on contract receive pay prorated to period of service during school year.
Czechoslovakia	12 weeks (Christmas 10 days, spring, all of July and Aug.)	7-8 weeks (all but last week of summer vacation); if called for duty may be given compensatory leave or financial compensation.	Pay continues at average of monthly earnings during school year.
Ecuador	.	2 months + 13 national public holidays	Normal pay continues throughout vacation but all other financial entitlements suspended.
Egypt	.	2 weeks for first year's service, 3 weeks after 1 year, 30 days after 10 years, 45 days if over 50. There must be a certain number of teachers in attendance at each school at all times.	Pay continues in full throughout vacations.
Finland	14 weeks (1.6 - 15.8; 11 days at Christmas, 5 at Easter and 6 at end of winter).	12-13 weeks. Under collective agreement in force, teachers must work 195 days per year (plus up to 2 days for repeat examinations).	Teachers on continuing contracts receive salary throughout year; others are paid according to number of hours taught.

Table XI (cont.)

Country	School vacations	Teachers' annual holiday	Employment status and pay entitlements during holidays and vacations
France	About 16 weeks (10 in summer, 1 in early Nov. and in Feb., 2 at Christmas and during spring).	30 consecutive days; for remainder of school vacation on call.	.
German Democratic Republic (1980-81)	About 15 weeks (18-26.10; 20.12-4.1; 7.2-1.3; 18 Apr., 2 and 9-17 May, 6 June, 4.7-31.8)	27 days (= 3 1/2 weeks) + 20 days for study.	.
Germany, Federal Republic of	About 75 working days (1.7-10.9; short periods at end Oct., Christmas, Easter, Whitsun)	As for public servants; for remainder of vacations, teachers on call (but in practice called in only exceptionally).	Teachers remain on full pay during vacations.
Guyana	13 weeks (3 at Christmas, 2 at Easter, 7 or 8 in summer).	Same as vacation; but teacher released for in-service training during year must remain on call.	Full pay with 2 exceptions: (a) interim teachers employed by the term; and (b) teachers taking holidays outside Guyana receive holiday pay only on resumption of duty or return to the country.
Hungary	.	48 working days	.
India	Varies from State to State.	6-8 weeks in summer, 10 days in autumn, 1 week in winter. Compensatory leave may be given if teacher has to attend in-service training during vacation.	Full pay continues throughout vacation.



Table XI (cont.)

Country	School vacations	Teachers' annual holiday	Employment status and pay entitlements during holidays and vacations
Indonesia	About 120 days	About 12 days (rest taken up by training, planning, evaluation, etc.).	Full pay continues throughout vacation.
Ireland	Primary: 14 weeks incl. July and Aug. Secondary: 16 weeks.	14 weeks. Primary teachers attending in-service training courses receive up to 5 days extra.	Employed status and all pay entitlements continue.
Israel	Primary: 21.6-31.8. Secondary: 1.7-31.8. All schools: about 50 religious and public holidays.	On holiday throughout vacation, but may attend in-service training courses lasting 2-3 days during summer.	All teachers paid for religious and public holidays. During summer holiday teachers paid according to period of service during previous school year.
Italy	Public: about 14 weeks (2 at Christmas, 1 at Easter, 3 months in summer). Private: same, but only 2 months in summer.	Public: on call throughout vacation. Private: 30 days' holiday during summer vacation.	
Jamaica	About 13 weeks (Dec., Apr., Aug.)	About 10 weeks	A teacher who completes a term's service receives full pay for ensuing vacation.
Japan	About 120 days (incl. Suns. and 6 weeks in summer, 2 each in winter and spring).	20 days' annual leave plus Sundays, 25 public holidays and 6 days at New Year; total about 100 days. Outside leave period, teachers are on call, but may be authorised to undergo training.	Employment status and all pay entitlements continue throughout year.

Table XI (cont.)

Country	School vacations	Teachers' annual holiday	Employment status and pay entitlements during holidays and vacations
Kenya	About 3 months (1 month after every 3-month term)	30 days; during rest of vacations, on call.	Remain on payroll throughout year.
Kuwait	17-20 weeks + 9 public holidays	Private: 60-90 days (during summer). Public: same as school vacations, save for last 2 weeks of summer vacation, used for repeat examinations.	Teachers with public servant status retain that status during vacations and receive full pay.
Luxembourg	15-16 weeks (9 in summer, 2 each at Christmas and Easter, 1 each at All Hallows, Carnival and Whitsun).	Same as school vacations; but teachers may be asked to volunteer for supportive class work or the conduct of repeat examinations.	Status and all rights and obligations deriving therefrom retained.
Madagascar	10 weeks (2 months in summer, 2 weeks each at Christmas and Easter)	2 months	Full salary paid during vacations.
Mauritius	10 weeks (2 at Easter, 4 in July-Aug., 4 in Nov.-Jan. period)	Whole of vacations unless they volunteer for in-service training.	Salary is paid in full throughout vacations.
New Zealand	10-12 weeks (mid-Dec. - 1 Feb.; 2 weeks each at beginning of May and end of Aug.)	10-12 weeks	Full pay continues. Teachers may accept paid employment during vacations.
Nicaragua	3 months (at end of school year) and 3 weeks (1 at Easter, 2 in mid-year)	2 months and 3 weeks	Teachers receive pay throughout vacations.

Table XI (cont.)

Country	School vacations	Teachers' annual holiday	Employment status and pay entitlements during holidays and vacations
Norway	14 weeks (mid-June - mid-Aug., 1 week at Christmas and in Feb.-Mar.; 4 days at Easter; various public holidays)	Difficult to estimate: substantial periods spent in in-service training during vacations.	Teachers are paid throughout the year.
Pakistan	About 3 months	Normally same as vacations, but teachers may be called back for specific jobs.	Full pay and allowances are due during vacation periods.
Papua New Guinea	Minimum 9 weeks	Same as vacation, but a teacher may be directed to remain on duty. When this occurs he must be given compensatory leave and/or pay in lieu.	Teachers receive full pay during vacations.
Peru	17 days (Christmas - end Mar.; about 2 weeks at beginning of Aug.)	60 days (mid-year and most of Jan. and Feb.)	If the teacher has served throughout the school year he receives full pay and allowances during vacations; otherwise pay prorated to number of months of service.
Philippines	12 weeks (2 at Christmas, 10 in summer)	Same as vacations.	If the teacher has served throughout the school year he receives full pay and allowances during vacations; otherwise pay prorated to number of months of service.

Table XI (cont.)

Country	School vacations	Teachers' annual holiday	Employment status and pay entitlements during holidays and vacations
Spain	.	11 weeks (2 at Christmas, 1 at Easter, 8 in summer). Official entitlement of teachers with public servant status: 30 days; but in practice they receive same holidays as others.	Teachers receive full pay during vacations.
Sri Lanka	12 weeks (3-4 weeks at end of each term)	Same as vacation.	Teachers receive full pay during vacation and may perform non-teaching work during holidays.
Sweden	12 weeks	40 days under collective agreement; but in principle employer cannot order teachers to work during vacations. In practice few teachers work more than 37 weeks per year.	All teachers receive salaries throughout the year with the exception of unqualified teachers employed on a day-to-day basis; but pay rates of latter are calculated to give prorated equivalences to salaries of full-time teachers.
Tanzania	.	35 days during school holidays; during rest of school holidays they may attend seminars, mark examination papers, etc. Leave with pay in excess of 35 days discretionary.	Teachers receive full pay during holiday.
Thailand	10 weeks (6 in summer)	Public and private: 6 weeks (= summer vacation).	Status and pay maintained.

Table XI (concl.)

Country	School vacations	Teachers' annual holiday	Employment status and pay entitlements during holidays and vacations
Tunisia	15 weeks (school year = 2 terms running from 15.9-30.6; one-week vacation in middle of each term, 2 weeks between terms, long vacation 1.7-14.9)	In practice, 105 days (= 15 weeks)	Teachers remain on full pay during vacations.
Ukrainian SSR	.	48 working days (usually taken during summer)	Teachers receive full pay during holidays.
United Kingdom			
England and Wales	About 10 weeks	Teachers are usually on holiday when children are.	Pay continues during vacations.
Scotland	About 10 weeks	Same as school vacations, but teachers usually expected to resume duties 1-3 days before pupils at start of each term.	.
Northern Ireland	About 10 weeks	Variable in practice	Full-time teacher continues to receive pay. Teacher paid by the day is regarded as unemployed during vacations.
USA	No holidays as such; teachers paid on basis of number of days' teaching contracted for.	Variable	Payment generally distributed evenly over year or pay periods in school year according to terms of agreement.
USSR	.	48 days (12-18 days extra for teachers employed in climatic hardship areas)	Pay calculated on basis of average earnings over previous 12 months
Venezuela	12 weeks (1.8-15.9; 20.12-7.1; Carnival; and Holy Week)	Coincide with school vacations.	Teachers in public sector receive full pay during vacations plus holiday bonus of up to 5 days' pay.

327. In a number of the reporting countries (Argentina, Barbados, Bulgaria, Chile, Cuba, Czechoslovakia, Finland, the German Democratic Republic, Jamaica, Japan, Kuwait, Madagascar, Nicaragua, Peru, Thailand) the holidays actually enjoyed by teachers are significantly shorter than the actual school vacations. During the periods during which the teachers concerned are not on holiday they may be required to perform such tasks as participation in staff meetings, the organisation and conduct of examinations (especially repeat examinations), administrative work, planning, evaluation, in-service training and supportive class work. In Scotland, teachers are required to return to school one to three days before the pupils at the beginning of each term. In Czechoslovakia and Papua New Guinea (in both of which holidays are relatively short), teachers recalled to duty during holidays must be given financial compensation or compensatory leave.

328. There appears to be a measure of expectation in some countries that teachers will undergo a certain amount of in-service training or carry out studies during part of the vacation periods. References to this situation are made by Barbados, Canada (Ontario), German Democratic Republic, India, Indonesia, Ireland, Israel, Japan, Mauritius, Norway and Tanzania. It is difficult to estimate the amount of holiday which is taken up by such courses. At one extreme, vacation courses in Israel last only two to three days (but a teacher may attend several in one vacation). At the other extreme, Canada (Ontario) estimates that many teachers devote half of their summer vacations, or even more, to in-service training; a similar situation appears to exist in Norway. In the German Democratic Republic, the amount of time allowed for study is almost as much as the amount of actual holiday. In Indonesia, the amount of time taken up by in-service training appears to be considerable. In India and Ireland teachers who undergo in-service training during holiday periods receive compensatory leave.

329. Three countries (Chile, Italy, Kuwait) provided separate information on the holidays with pay of teachers in private schools. In Chile, although only guaranteed a minimum of 15 working days' holiday, private teachers have in practice the same holidays as teachers in the public sector; in Italy and Kuwait they have less.

330. As regards status and pay entitlements during vacation periods, all the countries which provided information state that teachers with continuing contracts who are employed throughout the school year remain on full pay throughout vacation periods; Argentina and Canada (Quebec) also mention that their social security entitlements are maintained in full throughout vacations; in Czechoslovakia and the USSR vacation pay is calculated on the basis of average earnings during the school year. In Jamaica a teacher who completes a term's service is entitled to full pay for the ensuing vacation.

331. In some countries, teachers who are not employed continuously throughout the school year are in a somewhat different position from their fully employed colleagues. Thus, in Argentina, Cyprus, Finland, Israel and Peru a teacher who has been employed only part of the school year has his holiday pay (in the case of Israel, his summer holiday pay) prorated to his actual length of service or (in the case of Finland) the number of hours taught. In Guyana, interim teachers employed by the term receive holiday pay only on resumption of duty at the beginning of the next term; and a teacher spending his holiday abroad receives his holiday pay only on his return to Guyana or resumption of duty. Lastly, in Sweden, unqualified teachers employed on a day-to-day basis receive no holiday pay, but their pay rates are fixed so as to give prorated equivalence to the holiday entitlements of established teachers.

332. Colombia states that private school teachers do not receive pay during vacations.

333. Only nine countries make any specific reference to the question of maintenance of employee status. Bangladesh, Chile, Ireland, Japan, Luxembourg and Thailand specifically refer to the maintenance of the employee status of teachers during vacations; Barbados, Bulgaria and Kuwait make reference to the public servant status of teachers.

Study leave (paragraph 95)

334. The questions put under this head related to the applicability to teachers of laws and regulations of a general character on study leave and the existence of special arrangements for teachers, and on the numbers of teachers taking study leave, the periods for which such leave is granted and the nature of the studies or training undertaken. Leave for in-service training was treated as study leave for the purposes of the questionnaire.

335. All but five of the replies received contain specific references to study leave. Finland, Luxembourg, Mexico and Sweden mention entitlements under schemes for workers generally (in addition, Sweden has a special scheme for teachers); Argentina, Barbados, Peru and Tunisia refer to entitlements under schemes for public servants. The other replies describe the facilities available to teachers, for the most part without indicating whether or not they are also available to other categories; however, from the descriptive material supplied (and in particular the information on the purposes for which the leave is given), it seems clear that, certainly in the great majority of cases, the facilities referred to are for teachers only. The answers range from bare statements of the fact that facilities exist to detailed explanations of the purposes for which study leave is granted and the numbers of persons involved.

336. The purposes for which study leave is granted vary greatly. It may be granted for private study or for the preparation and taking of examinations connected therewith; to assist unqualified teachers to obtain teaching qualifications; for in-service training; and to enable teachers to undertake university or post-graduate studies, to improve their qualifications, or to acquire special skills needed by the education service.

337. The replies sometimes reflect differences in interpretation of the concept of study leave. A few reflect a relatively narrow approach, orientated to in-service training; thus Cuba and Indonesia state that in-service training is organised so as to take place during school vacations and that consequently there is no need for special provision for study leave. Japan, too, states that most teachers attend in-service training courses during vacations. Other countries, however, interpret the concept more widely, to embrace several of the elements mentioned in the previous paragraph.

338. The duration of study leave varies considerably from two hours in a year in Ecuador to as much as six years in Guyana. In Malta, study leave is usually one to three months in duration, and is granted primarily for in-service training; but long-term release is sometimes given. In Luxembourg, up to 36 days may be allowed; in Barbados the duration of study leave ranges from a few weeks to three years; in Argentina the usual duration is six months or one year; in Jamaica the maximum is one year; in New Zealand the normal duration is one year; and in Sri Lanka study leave may be granted for up to two years. Several countries provide for regular periods of release for study purposes, either on a year-by-year or a sabbatical basis. Thus, in Bulgaria, the Ukrainian SSR and the USSR, teachers are allowed 30 days' study leave each year for in-service training, private study and preparation for examinations. In Hungary the study leave allowance is 33 days per year; in the German Democratic Republic it is 20 days. In addition, in the USSR a teacher pursuing post-graduate studies may apply for one day free per week (on half pay) for study purposes. Among the countries giving study leave on a sabbatical basis, in the Byelorussian SSR a teacher can apply for one month's leave every five years to undergo further training and pass examinations; in the Philippines a teacher is allowed one year of study leave after seven years' service; in Sweden, in addition to entitlements under the general educational leave scheme, a teacher is entitled to 360 days' leave of absence with part pay in any ten-year period; and in many school districts in Canada and the United States sabbatical leave is awarded on the basis of local negotiations.

339. Leave for study with full pay is specifically stated to be granted with full pay in Chile (for attendance at an officially recognised course), France (for instituteurs undergoing upgrading training), the Federal Republic of Germany (for short-term leave), Guyana (to improve teaching qualifications), India (on an ad hoc basis), Iraq (for university courses leading to a higher teacher qualification),

Jamaica (if the course is work-related and subject to a service bond), Kuwait, Malta (if in the interests of the service), New Zealand and Sri Lanka (for attendance at degree courses at a university), Nicaragua (for courses of up to one year's duration), Sri Lanka (for the first two years only), and Tunisia (if the teacher is required by the authorities to attend the course). Leave is stated to be with half pay in Finland, in some cases in India, in Israel (where there is a contributory study leave scheme), Nicaragua (if the leave exceeds one year), Norway and the Philippines (60 per cent). Leave is stated to be without pay in Australia (Queensland) (but a certain number of study grants are available), in Bangladesh, Cameroon, Cyprus (for study abroad), France (general rule), Jordan (for post-graduate study), Luxembourg (if long term), Madagascar and Tunisia (private study). Several countries state that decisions on whether to allow leave with full or part pay or without pay are taken on an ad hoc basis according to the merits of each case. In Ireland provision exists for a teacher to be granted leave with pay provided he furnishes a suitable substitute at his own expense; in two cantons in Switzerland a teacher taking study leave is required to contribute to the cost of his replacement.

340. As regards seniority and pension entitlements, Argentina, Colombia, the Federal Republic of Germany (if the leave is work-related), New Zealand and the Philippines state that pension entitlements continue to accrue during study leave; the same countries, together with the Byelorussian SSR, Canada (Quebec), Cyprus and Guyana, also state that seniority entitlements continue to accrue. In contrast, in Cameroon, a teacher wishing to take study leave must apply for reserve status, under which pay and the accrual of seniority and pension entitlements are all suspended. It seems that France, the Netherlands and Canada (Quebec) do not allow pension entitlements to accrue during study leave, since they allow a teacher to validate such periods retroactively by paying the contributions due in respect thereof. Israel simply states that all a teacher's rights are maintained during periods of study leave.

341. Most of the countries replying either gave no information, or stated they had none, on the numbers of teachers taking study leave. In most of the cases where figures have been given, the numbers of teachers taking study leave are very small. There are, however, three exceptions. In France, in 1978-79, over 30,000 of the 300,000 instituteurs in post took leave to attend the special updating and upgrading courses organised for them; in Israel, some 3,000 teachers took sabbaticals in 1980-81; and in Sri Lanka, during the period 1974-78 some 25,000 teachers obtained study leave of an average duration of two years.

Conditions applicable to teachers under  
bilateral or multilateral exchange programmes  
(paragraphs 96 and 104-107)

342. The questions put related to the nature of existing exchange programmes; the manner in which teachers participating are selected; the rights of national teachers going abroad under exchange programmes as concerns leave, careers and pensions and information concerning the numbers and qualifications of the teachers concerned and the average duration of their stay abroad; and information regarding the status and treatment of the foreign teachers participating in the exchanges.

343. Thirty-seven of the countries replying indicated that they operated teacher exchange programmes; the remainder gave no information or stated that no such programmes exist. All in all, the replies were not sufficiently detailed to permit more than an illustrative analysis.

344. Three countries indicate specific objectives for exchange programmes: obtaining higher degrees (Egypt); the promotion of mutual understanding between the countries concerned (Japan); and the need to introduce improvements in the education service (Nicaragua).

345. The selection authority most frequently mentioned is the central government or ministry of education, within which a committee (sometimes comprising a representative of the host country) is set up to screen, interview and select candidates. The method of attracting candidatures most frequently mentioned is that of advertising exchange opportunities (but in Canada (Ontario) it appears that local employers are invited to submit names).



346. The selection criterion most frequently mentioned is that of academic qualifications, including a teacher's diploma and in some cases (Canada (Ontario), Egypt, Nicaragua, United States), a university degree is specifically mentioned as well. Experience is mentioned by several countries; performance by Tunisia; and physical health and psychological stability in the United States. Egypt gives preference to young graduate teachers. Czechoslovakia requires a knowledge of the language of the host country.

347. As regards conditions of service during periods spent abroad on exchanges, the German Democratic Republic, the Federal Republic of Germany and England and Wales state that all a teacher's rights are maintained during periods spent abroad under exchanges; France considers its teachers to be still in service; Luxembourg, Tanzania and Tunisia state that teachers keep all their rights as public servants; and Egypt and Italy place them on an official mission status. Bangladesh, Canada (Ontario and Quebec), Finland, the Federal Republic of Germany, Italy, Jamaica, Japan, New Zealand (for all countries but the United States), Nicaragua, Peru, Tanzania, Scotland (for some local authorities) and the United States indicate that teachers going abroad under exchanges continue to receive full salary. Australia, Austria, Barbados, Ireland and Jamaica state that leave, pension and seniority rights continue to accrue during exchanges; Cyprus, Finland and the USSR refer to accrual of leave rights, Canada (Ontario and Quebec), Cyprus, New Zealand, Peru and the USSR refer to accrual of pension rights; and Canada (Quebec), New Zealand and Peru refer to accrual of seniority rights. In a few countries - Barbados, India (where teachers are placed on leave without pay), New Zealand (for exchanges with the United States) and Scotland (some local authorities) - exchange teachers become subject to the conditions of service of the host countries.

348. The duration of exchanges varies considerably. In some cases (Cyprus, Finland, Mexico) it may be as little as a few weeks; at the other extreme, Tunisia organises individual exchanges of as much as four years in duration. The period most frequently mentioned is one school year; but exchanges of a duration of one term or of two years are not infrequent.

349. Most of the replies appear to rest on an assumption that a teacher on exchange will be able to return to his previous post. However, the United States mentions the case of teachers whose posts are abolished while they are abroad, and who may have difficulty in securing appointment to another post on their return.

350. A substantial number of countries either gave no information on the numbers of teachers participating in exchanges or stated that no information was available. Where information was provided, the numbers of teachers taking part in exchange schemes were generally extremely small. Only three countries - the United States (with 647 during the period 1974-78), the Federal Republic of Germany (430 in 1978-79) and England and Wales (341 in 1978-79) - reported exchanges involving significantly more than 100 teachers in a year.

351. Very few countries provided any information on the conditions of service of foreign teachers in their own countries under exchange programmes. Australia, Canada (Quebec), New Zealand, Nicaragua, Peru, England and Wales and Scotland state that the conditions of service of these teachers are determined by their countries of origin; in Canada (Quebec) the education authority may pay a cost-of-living allowance to supplement the salary of a foreign teacher paid to him by his country of origin. In Tanzania a foreign teacher employed on a public servant basis receives his salary and allowances from the Government; in the United States foreign teachers are treated in the same way as professional members of the staff of the schools to which they are assigned.

National teachers attached to technical assistance programmes abroad (paragraph 97)

352. The questionnaire requested information on the nature of technical assistance programmes involving teachers, the rights of the teachers concerned, their number and qualifications and the duration of their stay abroad.

353. Twenty-five countries state that their teachers participate in technical assistance programmes abroad. The field in which the assistance is given may be advising education authorities (German Democratic Republic, England and Wales), curriculum and methodology development (New Zealand, Spain), teacher training (German Democratic Republic, New Zealand, Spain) or teaching specific subjects in schools (Australia, Bulgaria, Indonesia, Ireland, Italy, Japan).

354. In all the 25 countries referred to, some arrangement exists for the protection of some or all of teachers' acquired rights.

355. In Bangladesh, Chile, Czechoslovakia, Peru and Spain, teachers are placed on leave of absence with full pay when they are assigned to a technical assistance programme. In Italy and New Zealand, they are seconded to the technical assistance authority which pays them; and in England and Wales, they are advised to apply for secondment. In Egypt, they are given official mission status. (Argentina, however, gives leave without pay; so does Chile in certain cases.) Arrangements of this kind imply that a teacher's post will be kept open for him on his return (Czechoslovakia, Japan, Norway and Peru make specific reference to this point). However, restrictions may be placed on the amount of leave allowed (two years in Chile and Norway; up to four years in Finland).

356. Canada (Ontario), Chile, Cuba, Egypt, the German Democratic Republic and Ireland all state that all the acquired rights of teachers attached to technical assistance programmes are preserved. Japan makes specific reference to seniority rights in this connection; Japan and Sweden refer to leave; Japan, New Zealand, Sweden and the USSR refer to the safeguarding of pension rights; and the last three mentioned refer to eligibility for promotion.

357. There are some countries which not only safeguard acquired rights but in addition allow some of them to accrue during a teacher's period of service in a technical assistance programme. Seniority continues to accrue in Bangladesh, France, Hungary, Peru, Spain, Tunisia (at the highest rate) and the USSR; eligibility for promotion accrues in Hungary and Italy; and pension entitlements continue to accrue in Argentina (if the teacher is in the employ of an international organisation), in France and (with a special weighting) in Italy. In Australia and in England and Wales, teachers wishing to accumulate additional pension rights during these periods of service must pay the contributions themselves.

358. A few countries give information on the numbers of teachers attached to technical assistance programmes abroad and the average duration of their assignments. Bulgaria sent 370 teachers abroad during 1974-78; Cuba has 4,500 teachers working in 20 countries; France has 2,300 lower secondary school teachers in technical assistance assignments; the German Democratic Republic had 200 teachers so engaged, and Tunisia 692 in 1980. Indonesia sends about 30 teachers abroad every year, Italy about 25 and New Zealand about 50. The average duration of assignments ranges from one month (Bulgaria) to five years and eight months (Australia); in France, Indonesia and Peru, the average duration is of the order of three years; other countries give figures ranging from nine months to two years.

Leave to enable teachers to participate  
in the activities of their organisations  
(paragraph 99)

359. The questionnaire inquired about the arrangements concerning such leave and the numbers of teachers who had taken it.

360. Nineteen of the replies received gave no information on this point, stated that no information was available or provided information which was unclear. Jordan, Mauritius and the Philippines state that the question is not applicable. No leave arrangements of this kind exist in the Byelorussian SSR, the German Democratic Republic (save in exceptional cases), India, Madagascar and Peru; the first two countries mentioned state that trade union activities generally take place outside school hours. Argentina grants leave only in special cases.

361. Ireland and Mauritius state that the necessary arrangements are made in accordance with the Recommendation without giving further details.

362. The other replies deal with three types of trade union activities: the activities of union officials on behalf of their members; the union activities of teachers generally (primarily attendance at union meetings); and training activities.

363. Most of the replies received refer exclusively to the activities of union officials, either within the individual school or at the national level. The general practice in the countries which stated that leave or time off is given to union officials is to allow each official the time off necessary for the performance of his union duties, or a reasonable amount of time off for their performance. This is the practice, for instance, in Austria, Bangladesh, Barbados Canada (Alberta and Ontario), Chile, Czechoslovakia, Ecuador, Guyana, Italy, Jamaica, Kuwait, Pakistan, Thailand, the Ukrainian SSR, the United Kingdom (England and Wales, Scotland) and the USSR. Sometimes the amount of time off which may be granted is limited (to 50 days per year in Canada (Alberta); to half of normal working time in Cyprus (primary teachers) and the Netherlands). Several countries specifically mention that the time off is allowed without loss of earnings for the teacher concerned. In a few cases, the government states the purpose for which the leave is granted - to negotiate with employers (mentioned by Jamaica and Japan); to take part in conciliation and arbitration proceedings (Papua New Guinea); to undergo union training (Sweden) and to investigate grievances (United States). A few countries specifically refer to the possibility of full-time release of certain officials - Australia, Canada (Alberta) for the union president, Canada (Quebec), Israel, Italy, Jamaica, New Zealand (national officials), Sri Lanka. The release is stated to be with pay in Italy (unless the union pays the teacher a salary) and New Zealand. In Quebec, the union concerned may be required to reimburse the education authority employing a teacher released with pay to take up union office the amount of his salary. In Israel and Jamaica releases for this purpose are without pay. In Australia, releases are with or without pay according to the case. Sweden operates a scheme which pays teachers working full time for the teachers' organisation at a pro forma rate of one person per 500 employees. Norway has a certain number of vacant "teaching" posts on which full-time officials of the teachers' organisation may be placed.

364. A few countries allow individual teachers time off to attend union meetings, or some types of union meetings. This is stated to be allowed, without loss of pay, in Barbados, Bangladesh, Bulgaria, some districts of Quebec, Finland (for meetings taking decisions on collective agreements), Italy (up to ten hours per year) and Sri Lanka (annual general meeting only). In Luxembourg, a teacher who attends a union meeting during working hours must make up the lessons lost during the same term to avoid loss of pay.

365. None of the replying countries give any information on the numbers of teachers taking leave of this kind. Several state no information on the subject is available.

#### Sick leave (paragraph 101)

366. The questionnaire asked for information on the sick leave arrangements available to teachers.

367. Fifty-eight of the replying governments stated that some form of sick leave provision exists for teachers. Some replies were not specific (for instance, Bulgaria states that the sick leave entitlements of teachers are the same as those of other workers; Chile states that sick leave is granted according to law; Finland and Tunisia state that the public service regulations on the subject are applicable; Indonesia and Iraq state that sick leave is given in accordance with medical certification). However, 45 governments provided specific information on the sick leave entitlements of teachers in terms of both duration and pay. The information given is summarised in table XII.

Table XII: Sick leave provision

Country	Maximum allowable periods of sick leave			Remarks
	With full pay	With part pay	Without pay	
Argentina	45 days (ST) 2 years (IT)	1 year at 50%	1 year	As for public servants generally.
Australia Tasmania	1 week per year (cumulative) + 1 month when paid entitlements exhausted	1 week per year at 50%	1 year	
Austria established	1 year			After 1 year of incapacity teacher placed on retired status.
non-established	42-182 days accord- ing to length of service	unspecified period at 50%	-	
Bangladesh	15 days (quarantine only)	-	-	Ordinary leave at half pay may be converted into sick leave on full pay.
Barbados	21 days	-	-	May be extended to up to 12 months if teacher is likely to recover fitness for service.
Cameroon	6 months in any period of 12 months; may be extended to 2 1/2 years	2 years at 50%	-	

Table XII (cont.)

Country	Maximum allowable periods of sick leave		Remarks
	With full pay	Without pay	
Canada			
Alberta	20 days per year, cumulative	-	Individual boards often grant leave on full or part pay for longer periods.
Ontario	Statutory minimum 20 days per year (prorated for part-time teachers)	-	Actual arrangements often made by collective agreement.
Quebec	7 days per year + 1 year (following year on part pay)	1 year at 85%	
Colombia	3 days	unspecified period	For a teacher with a fixed-term contract, payment of sickness benefit ceases with expiry of contract if incapacity not of occupational origin.
Cuba	-	From 4th day of incapacity until recovery	-
Cyprus	42 days	-	Medical board may award an additional 6 months on full pay followed by 6 months on half pay.

Table XII (cont.)

Country	Maximum allowable periods of sick leave		Remarks
	With full pay	Without pay	
Czechoslovakia	1 year or until date of retirement on health grounds	-	
Ecuador	90 days	70 days at 75% then up to 6 months at 66 2/3%	As for workers in general.
Egypt	3 months; may be made indefinite by medical board	6 months at 50%	
France public servants	3 months	9 months at 50%	
others	1-3 months according to length of service	1-3 months at 50% according to length of service	
long illness	1 year	2 years at 50%	
German Democratic Republic	-	6 weeks at 90% followed by up to 72 weeks at 70-90% according to number of dependent children	
Germany, Federal Republic of	3 months in any 6 months; more if possibility of recovery		For established and non-established teachers alike.

Table XII (cont.)

Country	Maximum allowable periods of sick leave			Remarks
	With full pay	With part pay	Without pay	
Guyana	1 month per year	2 months per year at 50%, cumulative in certain cases	-	
Hungary	-	1 year at 75% in exceptional cases, 2 years	-	
India	1 month per year			Varies from State to State.
Ireland	12 months in any 4 consecutive years	-	6 months	If illness exceeds 31 days in duration, continuance of sick pay is dependent on the employment of a substitute by the school.
Israel	3 days per month, cumulative to maximum of 30 days per year of service	3 months at 50%	-	Entitlements on full pay double those of workers in general.
Italy established	12 months	6 months at 50%	6 months	Period of unpaid leave not counted for purposes of seniority and pension rights.
non-established (primary)	15-30 days according to length of service	up to 60 days at 50% after 5 years' service	up to 90 days after 5 years' service	

Table XII (cont.)

Country	Maximum allowable periods of sick leave			Remarks
	With full pay	With part pay	Without pay	
Jamaica	Up to 40 days according to length of service	Up to 40 days at 50% according to length of service	-	Further leave granted on a discretionary basis.
Japan	90 days (long-term: up to 3 years)	9 months at 50% followed by period at 80%	-	Non-occupational; for diseases or injury of occupational origin, entire period of treatment on full pay.
Jordan	4 months	4 months at 50%, extensible by further 4 months	-	
Kenya	3 months	3 months at 50%	-	
Kuwait public servants	2 years	-	-	
non-established	2 months in any 1 year	2 months in any 1 year	-	
private schools	6 days	6 days at 75%, 6 at 50%, 6 at 25%	Leave over 24 days	As provided by Labour Code. In practice many schools allow 1 month on full pay.
Luxembourg	12 months	-	-	



Table XII (cont.)

Country	Maximum allowable periods of sick leave			Remarks
	With full pay	With part pay	Without pay	
Malta teachers appointed up to 15.1.79	6 months	6 months at 50%	-	
teachers appointed since 15.1.79	30 days per year	30 days per year at 50%	-	After 6 months' service.
Mauritius	28 days + 30 days if required	30 days at 50%	For a teacher with 5 years' service: 3 months	Entitlements arise after 12 months' service.
Mexico	10-60 days, accord- ing to length of service	10-60 days at 50%, according to length of service	6 months (but receive equivalent of half- pay from social security scheme)	
New Zealand	7-306 days, accord- ing to length of service	-	-	
Norway	12 months	-	-	
Papua New Guinea	10 days per year of service, cumulative	10 days at 50% per year of service, cumulative	discretionary	
Peru	20 days (employer pays)	12 months less 20 days at 70% (pay- able by employer)	-	

Table XII (concl.)

Country	Maximum allowable periods of sick leave		Remarks
	With full pay	Without pay	
Philippines	3 weeks per year, cumulative up to 10 months	-	Entitlement begins after 6 months' continuous and satisfactory service.
Sri Lanka	20 days (tuberculosis: 9 months)	-	
Sweden	-	30 days at 92%, thereafter 94%	As for public service.
Switzerland	6-12 months	variable	Varies from canton to canton.
Tanzania	180 days in any 3-year period	180 days at 50% in any 3-year period	Established staff.
Thailand	15 days (60 if hospitalisation necessary)	-	
United Kingdom Northern Ireland	100 working days in any year	100 working days in any year	Maxima.
United States	10 days per year, cumulative without limit	-	Most common arrangement at State level (32 States provide for sick leave).

School buildings (paragraphs 108-110)

368. Governments were asked to supply the texts of major laws or regulations applying to the construction of school premises and to safety and health on school premises and information on the manner in which teachers are consulted when new school buildings are to be constructed.

369. Of the 52 governments which replied to this question, all state that school buildings are subject to some form of regulation; the majority confine themselves to stating that regulations exist. In most countries, there are special regulations applicable to the design of schools; but in Bulgaria, Cameroon, Canada (Alberta), Finland, Jamaica, Japan, Kenya (schools in urban areas), New Zealand and Sweden, the regulations on buildings generally are applicable. Argentina, Canada, Chile, Ireland, Japan, Luxembourg and United Kingdom (Scotland) supplied the texts of the regulations applicable.

370. Bangladesh, the Byelorussian SSR, Canada, Chile, Ecuador, Iraq, Israel, Japan, the Netherlands, Nicaragua, Norway, the United Kingdom and the United States all state that there is formal consultation of teachers, either direct or indirect (e.g. through principals of schools) on the design of new school buildings. Consultation also takes place, but on an informal basis, in Finland, Gabon and New Zealand. In Argentina, Barbados, Indonesia, Kenya and Malta, principals only are consulted; in Spain, the authorities consult school principals, who in their turn usually consult teachers. Barbados, Cyprus, Egypt, Indonesia, Italy, Jamaica, Jordan, Luxembourg, Mauritius, Pakistan, Peru and Tunisia state that teachers are not, or not normally, consulted. In Bulgaria, only teachers at the institute of architecture are consulted. In the Philippines, the views of teachers are sought on new buildings as they are brought into service and the information obtained is used in subsequent designing work.

Teachers in rural or remote areas  
(paragraphs 111-113)

371. The question on this subject sought information on any special conditions regarding theoretical and practical preparation, hours of work and total workload for teachers participating in community activities in rural and remote areas and, more generally, on the indemnities, facilities and special advantages accorded to teachers in such areas.

372. Fifty-eight of the governments replying gave information on some or all of the matters mentioned in the question. Of these, five stated that there were no areas designated as rural or remote in their countries and three stated that no special arrangements existed for teachers in rural or remote areas.

373. Several governments (Bangladesh, Chile, Cuba, Cyprus, Czechoslovakia, Iraq, Nicaragua, Pakistan, Sri Lanka and Thailand) state that teachers assigned to rural or remote areas are given special preparation. In most cases, however, the preparation appears to be designed to enable the teacher to cope with teaching problems (especially multi-class teaching). Where the preparation does relate to non-school activities, it appears to be focused mainly on adult education, and particularly adult literacy. On the other hand, several countries (Australia, Canada, Indonesia, Israel, Kuwait, New Zealand and Norway) state that community activities do not form part of a teacher's normal duties and that participation in them is voluntary on his part.

374. Classroom hours in rural or isolated areas do not normally differ from those in urban areas; but some governments point out that multi-class teaching requires more preparation on the part of the teacher concerned and thus increases his total workload.

375. As regards facilities and incentives, 26 governments state that special allowances are paid to teachers working in some or all rural or isolated areas; the amounts of the allowances vary from 10 per cent to 100 per cent of basic pay. It is not stated whether or not the allowances are pensionable. In addition, 23 governments state that these teachers receive free or subsidised housing or rental allowances. Other advantages and facilities mentioned by individual countries include incremental advance at higher rates than normal; free travel to the place of assignment for the teacher and his family; removal expenses; installation grants; housing loans; free electricity, lighting or heating; regular paid travel to a local population centre or to the teacher's home; regular study leave; longer holidays; the loan of a vehicle; and the free transportation of a certain quantity of perishable goods every week.

CHAPTER V

WOMEN TEACHERS AND TEACHERS  
WITH FAMILY RESPONSIBILITIES

376. The Committee had considered that it would be desirable to give special consideration, at its 1982 session, to the application to women teachers of certain paragraphs of the Recommendation (including some the general application of which were to be examined at the same time) of particular concern to them. The paragraphs in question are paragraph 7 on equality of opportunity; paragraphs 33, 34 and 36 on in-service training; paragraphs 43 and 44 on recruitment, advancement and promotion; paragraphs 45 and 46 on security of employment; paragraphs 115-122 on remuneration; paragraphs 54, 55 and 57 on the effects of marriage and pregnancy on security of employment and conditions of work; and paragraph 102 on maternity leave. In the same context, the Committee decided to examine the application of paragraphs 57-58 and 103, concerning teachers with family responsibilities, which, although applicable to both sexes, are of particular concern to women on account of the substantial share of such responsibilities which in the majority of cases fall to their charge.

377. To some extent the questions overlapped with the question in Part A on equality of opportunity and remuneration and several governments referred to the reply given to that question (see Chapter I).

378. On the subject of equality of opportunity and treatment, all the countries which provided information replied positively. The replies, however, can be divided into two categories; those which indicate that equality exists both in law and practice and those which refer only to equality under the law or equality in the application of the relevant rules. Moreover, the United States points out that equality in law does not prevent individual cases of inequality of treatment from arising in practice. In this connection several governments (Canada (Ontario, Quebec), Israel, Netherlands, Peru, Spain, Sweden) state that, although formal equality of opportunity exists, men tend to outnumber women in positions of responsibility. This tendency is borne out by the figures given by Sweden and by eight other countries (Ecuador, Hungary, Italy, Japan, New Zealand, Nicaragua, United Kingdom (Northern Ireland) and the United States), which indicate that the highest proportions of women are found in primary education, a substantially lower proportion in secondary schools and the lowest proportions of all in school headships (however, in New Zealand the majority of senior teachers and in Northern Ireland the majority of vice-principals are women). Canada (Ontario) and Israel consider that the relative paucity of women in higher-level posts is due to the loss of relative seniority which occurs when a woman teacher interrupts her career to give birth to children and bring them up. Canada (Ontario) has asked directors of education to review their practices with regard to promotional appointment; the German Democratic Republic organises special courses to prepare women for school headships.

379. Only seven governments provide information on the proportion of women undergoing in-service training. Argentina states that 75 per cent of in-service trainees are women; in Bangladesh, 25 per cent are women; in Canada (Ontario), the proportion of women rose from 13.8 per cent to 32.1 per cent between 1975 and 1981; in Hungary the proportion of women in in-service training is the same as the proportion of women in the population; in Iraq, during the period 1974-78, 50 per cent of all in-service training participants were women; in Jordan, since 1975-76 there have been four times as many women participants as men; and in Scotland 70 per cent of participants are women.

380. All the countries which replied state that conditions of employment and remuneration are identical for the two sexes.

381. Thirty-two of the governments replying provide information on the proportions of teachers who work part time. Ecuador, Ireland, Kenya, Kuwait, Madagascar and Tanzania have no part-time teachers; Cyprus, Guyana, Hungary, Pakistan and Sri Lanka have only a few (in Sri Lanka only relief teachers work part time). Malta has some; Israel, Jordan and the Philippines have substantial numbers. In the other countries, the proportion varies considerably from one to another. In Austria, Barbados, Canada, as a whole, France, Mauritius and Northern Ireland the proportion of teachers working part time is 5 per cent or less;

New Zealand reports 7.4 per cent in primary and 12.9 per cent in secondary schools; the percentage for Canada (Ontario) is 27, that for Sweden 28 (and rising) and that for Norway 29; while in Argentina (possibly owing to the organisation of the teaching profession in that country) 90 per cent of teachers work part time. Eight of these countries indicate that the majority of teachers working part time are women; in six of them the percentage is of the order of 80. The other countries give no information on the subject.

382. On the subject of marriage and pregnancy, 33 governments state that these have no effect on employment or conditions of work. Finland, however, mentions a problem with part-time women teachers on one-year contracts who sometimes find it difficult to obtain a renewal if they become pregnant. Guyana observes that the frequent absences and lowering of performance standards to which women teachers with family responsibilities are prone is likely adversely to affect their chances of securing promotion. On the subject of conditions of work, Bangladesh and Japan endeavour to reduce a woman teacher's workload during pregnancy. Several countries (e.g. Bangladesh, Canada (Ontario), Chile, Jamaica) endeavour to post married couples who are both teachers in the same locality or school or to appoint women teachers in the localities where their homes are.

383. The Committee noted at its 1976 session (Report, para. 228) the case of a country in which women teachers who married were not entitled to remain in pensionable posts. The country in question stated that security of employment for married and pregnant women teachers was introduced in 1981.

384. The situation with regard to maternity and parental leave and to other facilities provided for teachers of either sex with family responsibilities in the 54 countries and territorial units, the governments of which provided specific information on the subject, is shown in table XIII.

385. It will be recalled that the Maternity Protection (Revised) Convention, 1952 (No. 103) provides for a compulsory period of maternity leave of at least 12 weeks, including at least six weeks after confinement.

Table XIII: Maternity and parental leave and other facilities for teachers with family responsibilities

Country	Maternity leave		Parental leave (mother only except where otherwise stated)	Other facilities	Remarks	
	With full pay	Without pay				
(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
Argentina	90 days <sup>2</sup>	-	-	Leave to look after sick member of family: 20 days with pay, 70 days without pay	Nursing breaks	As under general scheme.
Australia (Tasmania)	-	-	12-52 weeks	-	-	Accumulated sick leave entitlements may be used.
Austria <sup>1</sup>	8+8 weeks <sup>2</sup>	-	-	Up to 3 years	-	As under general scheme.
Bangladesh	3 months	-	-	In special cases	-	
Barbados	during vacation period	120 days	-	In special cases	-	
Bulgaria	10-14 weeks	-	-	Up to 3 years without pay	-	Col.5: during parental leave mother covered by social security scheme.

Table XIII: (cont.)

(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
Canada						
Alberta	-	-	Average 4-6 months	-	-	Unemployment benefits payable.
Ontario	Minimum 17 weeks	-	-	To make total leave of up to 2 years depend- ing on school board	-	Pay and accrual of seniority and pen- sion rights; but social security benefits paid under general scheme.
Quebec	-	20 weeks at 93% of salary (10 if not member of unemployment insurance scheme)	-	-	Husband receives 5 days' leave with pay when wife gives birth. Either parent may take up to 2 additional weeks but with- out pay.	Seniority accrues during maternity leave; life in- surance entitle- ments maintained.
Chile	6+12 weeks	-	-	Discretionary in private schools	-	-
Colombia	4+4 weeks	-	-	-	Child of school age entitled to board and lodg- ing in govern- ment schools at reduced rates.	-
Cuba <sup>1</sup>	6+12 weeks <sup>2</sup>	-	-	-	-	-

Table XIII: (cont.)

(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
Cyprus	-	4+4 weeks at 50%	-	During 1974-78, 1 case (leave without pay, 1 year)	Teachers who leave service for family reasons encouraged to return to teaching.	Col.3: with full pay if maternity leave falls during summer vacation.
Czechoslovakia	-	4+24 weeks at 90% in form of benefits	-	Without pay till child reaches age 2. Up to 6 days off with benefits to look after sick child.	-	Col.5: if teacher has 2 or more children, benefits payable during unpaid leave.
Ecuador <sup>1</sup>	-	15+30 days at 75%	-	-	-	-
Egypt	3 months	-	-	Nursing breaks 1 hour/day until child reaches age 2 without loss of acquired rights.	Exemption of women teachers from obligation to accept transfers.	-
France	6+10 weeks (first 2 children) 8+18 weeks (succeeding children)	-	-	Post-natal leave with pay, 6 months at a time, max. 2 years. Leave without pay (max. 9 years) to look after child following serious illness or accident. Teacher of either sex looking after child may obtain up to	Teacher may apply to be put on half-time status with half pay to look after child under 16.	-



Table XIII: (cont.)

(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
France (cont.)				15 days' paid leave to care for child when sick.		
German Democratic Republic	6+20 weeks	-	-	Leave without pay till child reaches age 2 (paid if mother has 2 or more children)	Working women allowed 1 day/month off to attend to household duties. For women teachers with 2 or more children under age 16, number of lessons to be given weekly reduced by 2. Three extra working days' holiday per year if 3 or more children at home.	
Germany, Federal Republic of	6+8 weeks compulsory; optional till child reaches age 6 months	-	-	Reduction of teaching workload by half, or up to 3 years' leave without pay, to care for a child under 16 requiring special care.		

Table XIII: (cont..)

(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
Greece	Public: 9+9 weeks		Private: 6+6 weeks	Public: extra 30 days' leave/year. May begin work an hour late or leave an hour early till child reaches age 1 year.		Col.4: maternity allowances equiva- lent to full pay are granted.
Guyana	3 months	-	-	In special cases, without pay.	-	
Hungary <sup>1</sup>	5 months	-	-	Leave without pay till child reaches age 3 years.	-	Col.5: during this period allowances equivalent to 30-40% of salary payable.
India	3 months	-	-		-	
Indonesia	3 months (may be extended by 1 1/2 months)	-	-		-	Qualifying period of 1 year's service.
Iraq		6 months at 50%		Up to 6 months at 50% to care for a child under 4.	-	Col.5: A woman teacher is entitled to such leave 4 times during her period of service.
Ireland	14 weeks	-	4 weeks	An adoptive mother may take 6 weeks' leave to establish mother-child relationship.	Teacher may resign and sub- sequently resume service.	

Table XIII: (cont.)

(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
Israel	12 weeks	-	As required	-	A woman teacher with a child under 14 may have her workload reduced by 20%.	
Italy <sup>1</sup>	2+3 months	-	-	Leave on part pay till child reaches age 1 year. Leave on adoption. Leave (either parent) to look after sick child for 2 months.	Various family benefits.	Col.5: leave to look after sick child; with pay for established teachers only.
Jamaica	Minimum 2 months	-	-	-	Teacher who resigns encouraged to resume service	
Japan	6+6 weeks	-	-	Leave without pay until child reaches age 1 year.	-	Col.5: in 1978, 13,210 women teachers took advantage of this provision.
Jordan	1 month, extensible	-	-	-	-	
Kenya	2 months	-	-	In exceptional cases on ad hoc basis.	-	

Table XIII: (cont.)

(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
Kuwait	Public: 2 months; private: 30+40 days	-	-	Leave without pay of 6 months to 4 years' duration to look after young children	-	Col.2: established teachers; special leave. Non-established and private: sick leave granted on production of medical certificate.
Luxembourg <sup>1</sup>	-	-	8+8 weeks	Leave without pay for up to 1 year following maternity leave. Half-time status to look after children under 12 or sick child.	-	Col.4: sickness fund pays benefits equivalent to full salary (both public and private). Col.5: seniority rights accrue during leave without pay.
Madagascar	1+1 month	-	-	On ad hoc basis, to look after sick child.	-	
Malta	13 weeks	-	-	-	-	
Mauritius	2 months	-	-	-	-	Qualifying period: 8 months' service at time of confinement.
Mexico			6+6 weeks			Col.4: social security benefits = 100% of average earnings.

Table XIII: (cont.)

(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
Netherlands <sup>1</sup>	From 2 months before expected date of birth until 6 weeks after birth.	-	-	-	-	-
New Zealand			Starting at any time before birth, lasts until minimum 3 months and maximum 12 months after birth.	Leave with pay to care for a child or spouse over-taken by sudden illness.	A few crèches exist.	Col.4: during leave without pay teacher receives flat-rate, income-tested benefit.
Nicaragua	40+40 days	-	-	Leave without pay to care for a child, with pay if child falls sick.	Contribution by State to living expenses of children of teachers if at secondary school or university.	
Norway	18 weeks	-	-	Up to 10 days' leave with pay a year to look after sick child. Leave without pay (either parent) up to 1 year's duration to look after children.	Possibility of applying for part-time status.	

Table XIII: (cont.)

(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
Pakistan	Not specified	-	-	In practice married Teachers who women teachers with interrupt service small children to bring up exempted from children extra-curricular work. encouraged to return.		
Peru	-	-	45+45 days			Col.4: full earnings paid by social security scheme.
Philippines	60 days (subject to 2 years' service)	60 days at 50% (with less than 2 years' service)	-	Contingent on necessities of service save where child is seriously ill.	-	Cols.2 and 3: for established staff only. Pay entitlements of temporary staff less.
Spain <sup>1</sup>	3 months	-	-	-	-	
Sri Lanka	6 weeks	-	-	-	-	
Sweden	6 weeks for mother before birth, followed by 270 days for either parent	-	-	Leave with full pay (either parent) till child reaches age 1 1/2 years, thereafter with reduced pay till child reaches age 8 years. Leave with pay up to 18 days/year to care for child when it or person who normally looks after it falls ill.		

Table XIII: (cont.)

(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
Tanzania	84 days every 3 years	-	If required	-	-	
Thailand	Up to 45 days	-	-	-	-	
Tunisia	1 month, with extra 15 days if required	-	-	Up to 3 years' leave without pay to care for young children	-	
Ukrainian SSR <sup>1</sup>	4 months	-	1 year, with right to re-instatement	Leave with part pay to look after child up to age 1 year; may be followed by further 6 months' leave but without pay.	-	
United Kingdom Northern Ireland Dept. of Educ. 4 weeks rules		2 weeks at 90%, then 12 weeks at 50%				Col. 3: reduced salary supplemented by social security benefits to ensure no loss of income. Qualifying period: 1 year of full-time continuous service or equivalent.

or

Table XIII: (concl.)

(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
General scheme -		From 11 weeks before presumed date of birth till up to 29 weeks after birth at 90%	-	Discretionary	-	Col.3: qualifying period 2 years, continuous service with same employer. Social security benefits payable for 4 weeks. Woman must notify employer of intention to return to keep job open.
USSR <sup>1</sup>	56+56 days (plus 14 days if required)	-	-	Leave on part pay to look after child till it reaches age 1 year, followed by leave without pay of 6 or 12 months' duration.	-	
Venezuela	7+7 weeks, extensible	-	-	-	-	

<sup>1</sup> Government has ratified the Maternity Protection (Revised) Convention, 1952 (No. 103).

<sup>2</sup> Figure provided by ILO.

In column 2, where maternity leave is indicated in "x+y" form, the first figure stands for leave to be taken before the anticipated date of confinement and the second for leave after confinement.



## CHAPTER VI

### SHORTAGES AND SURPLUSES OF TEACHERS

386. Part of the questionnaire (question 30 onwards) goes quite deeply into the problems of shortages and surpluses and its purpose is to discover the current situation in the different countries. It starts by examining the qualifications of serving teachers and the type of contracts they hold. The questions dealing with teacher shortage look at its effects on class size and on the class hours of teachers, and at different ways of increasing the number of teachers and improving their qualifications. Questions are thus asked regarding the measures taken to improve the economic and social position of teachers and the special facilities and advantages provided for attracting candidates to the teaching profession.

387. The questions on surpluses deal with their effects on class size and teacher workload. The governments are asked to describe any measures taken to adjust training to take account of staff needs as well as the different steps taken to transfer or re-employ surplus teachers. For shortages as well as surpluses, questions are asked concerning (a) their causes and (b) forecasts for the next ten years. The last question covers the consultation of teachers' organisations regarding the problem of the supply and demand of teaching personnel.

388. Colombia, Gabon, Greece, Switzerland and the USSR did not reply to section 30 of the questionnaire.

#### Statistics

##### The proportion of underqualified teachers

389. Forty countries provided figures, several of them indicating that they were approximate (see table XIV). The following countries stated that all their teachers were fully qualified: Cyprus, Egypt, German Democratic Republic, Luxembourg, Madagascar, Spain, Sri Lanka and the United States. In several countries the proportion of underqualified teachers is minimal, being either less than 1 per cent of the total or slightly more (see table ): Australia, Canada, Federal Republic of Germany, Malta, New Zealand and Tunisia. The highest proportion of unqualified teachers is to be found in the following countries: Bangladesh (over 50 per cent), Cameroon (48 per cent), Cuba (only secondary level 40 per cent), Guyana (30 per cent), India (primary level 37.04 per cent, secondary level 20.24 per cent), Israel (over 25 per cent), Nicaragua (70 per cent) and Venezuela (primary level 21.80 per cent, secondary level 23 per cent).

##### The proportion of teachers with permanent contracts

390. Table XV shows the data supplied on this subject by 21 replies. A particularly large number of replies - 20 of them - did not provide the information requested. In some cases the absence of data is due to the fact that this question is not covered in the official statistics, as in the cases of Argentina and the United Kingdom. Egypt, the German Democratic Republic, Luxembourg, Nicaragua and Sri Lanka state that all their teachers possess permanent contracts. In the following countries, 80-98 per cent of teachers possess permanent contracts: Australia, Cyprus, India, Israel, Malta, New Zealand, Quebec and Tunisia.

##### Survey of the supply and demand of teaching personnel

391. The following countries stated that they have neither a shortage nor a surplus of teachers: Czechoslovakia, German Democratic Republic, Ireland, Kuwait and Venezuela. The following 32 countries reported shortages: Bangladesh, Barbados, Bulgaria, Byelorussian SSR, Cameroon, Chile, Cyprus, Cuba, Egypt, France, Guyana, Hungary, Indonesia, Israel, Jordan, Kenya, Luxembourg, Madagascar, Malta, New Zealand, Nicaragua, Pakistan, Peru, Philippines, Scotland, Spain, Sri Lanka, Sweden, Thailand, Tunisia, United Kingdom, and the United States.

Table XIV: Proportion of underqualified teachers  
(The figures below apply for the most part to 1980-81)

Country	Percentage		Observations
	Primary	Secondary	
Australia		Less than 1	
Bangladesh		46	
Barbados	15	from a total of 2 684	
Bulgaria		5.5	
Byelorussian SSR	1	4.4	
Cameroon	48		
Canada		Less than 0.5	
Canada (Quebec)		12	
Chile		20	
Cyprus		none	
Czechoslovakia	6.8	12.2	Technical secondary: 16%
Cuba		40	
Ecuador	3	1	
Finland	1.3	4.6	
France	1.51	10.9	
German Dem. Rep.		none	
Germany Fed. Rep.	none	"a few"	
Guyana		30	Pre-primary: 7.2%
Hungary	3.8		
India	37.04	20.24	Lower secondary: 19.77%
Israel		30	
Italy		Public ed.: 6.4 Private ed.: 6.2	
Jamaica		23.47	
Japan		8	
Luxembourg		none	
Madagascar		none	
Malta		less than 1	
Mauritius		3	
Netherlands		3.7	
New Zealand	1.7	1	Pre-primary: 2.3%
Nicaragua		70	
Norway	3.9		
Peru		22	
Spain		none	
Sri Lanka		none	
Sweden		10	
Thailand		(15 759)*	
Tunisia	1.05		
Ukrainian SSR		1	Pre-primary: 20.6%
United Kingdom (1977)		Maths.: 15 Phys.: 22 Engl.: 17 Business Stud.:36	

Country	Percentage		Observations
	Primary	Secondary	
United States		none	
Venezuela	21.8	27	

\* This figure indicates the number of teachers, as the percentage was not supplied.

Table XV: Proportion of teachers holding a contract of indeterminate duration or a fixed-term contract

Country	Indeterminate duration			Fixed-term		
	Total	Primary	Secondary	Total	Primary	Secondary
Australia	cca 90%			cca 10%		
Barbados	70%					
Canada (Quebec)	88.8%			11.2%		
Cyprus		83.75%	78.31%			
Egypt	100%					
Finland					20%	
Germany, Fed. Rep.	60%			40%		
Guyana		54.4%				
Hungary					8.6%	3%
India	79.86%					
Israel	cca 91%					
Italy	77%	99%	63%*			
Jordan	121			30		
Luxembourg	100%					
Madagascar	-	-	-	-	-	-
Malta	95%					
New Zealand		98.8%	89.6%			
Nicaragua	100%					
Sri Lanka	100%					
Tunisia	98.95%	95.8%			1.05%	4.2%

\* Italy also supplied the following figures: 68 per cent of lower secondary, 56.5 per cent of upper secondary.

392. Bangladesh, Cameroon, Indonesia, Kenya, Nicaragua and Pakistan reported an over-all shortage of teachers at all levels. In other countries shortages are limited in scope and arise with regard to teachers at a particular level (primary or secondary for instance), teachers specialising in certain subjects (mathematics for example), or else in certain geographical regions (such as rural areas). Thus pre-primary teachers are lacking in the Byelorussian SSR, Cyprus, Guyana and Hungary. The Byelorussian SSR and Hungary also report a shortage of primary teachers specialising in music, art and physical education. There are frequent shortages of secondary teachers specialising in mathematics and in scientific and technical subjects. This is mentioned in particular by Barbados, Cameroon, Chile, Guyana, Luxembourg, New Zealand, Nicaragua, Scotland, Sri Lanka, Sweden, Thailand, Tunisia and the United Kingdom. Nicaragua also reports a lack of teachers specialising in agricultural and industrial subjects, while Sweden and Tunisia are short of teachers specialising in artistic subjects including music, and Thailand is in need of teachers trained in handicrafts. Furthermore, Egypt mentions a shortage of language teachers, and Israel that of physical education and music teachers. The Netherlands report a shortage of teachers (800) for teaching the Dutch language to foreign pupils in their own language and from the viewpoint of their culture at pre-primary and primary level. The factors that led to this shortage are the rapid increase in the number of foreign pupils in the country and the fact that courses for teachers speaking other languages have not yet been introduced in the teacher-training colleges. In several countries the shortages are due to the geographical environment. Rural and isolated zones are mentioned by Argentina, Chile, Madagascar, Peru and Tunisia, while Norway mentions the northern part of the country and Israel its northern and southern regions.

393. Certain countries suffer from a shortage of teachers in one or more specific areas and at the same time have surpluses in other sectors or in certain parts of the country. Thus Scotland has a 6 per cent shortage of physics teachers, yet has a 7 per cent surplus of teachers for "modern studies" and a surplus in geography and history. In Sri Lanka, certain regions suffer from a shortage of English, mathematics and science teachers, of which there are surpluses in other areas. In Madagascar there is a shortage of teachers in the country districts and a surplus in the towns. Jordan mentions a shortage of 305 men teachers, although it reports a surplus of 124 women teachers.

394. Seventeen countries have reported a surplus of teachers: Australia, Canada, Cyprus, Ecuador, India, Japan, Jordan, Luxembourg, Mauritius, Netherlands, New Zealand, Philippines, Quebec, Scotland, Sri Lanka, Thailand and the United States. As with the shortages, one can distinguish between surpluses occurring at certain educational levels, those occurring in certain subjects and those linked to the geographical and sociological environment. In Australia, Canada, Cyprus, India, Japan, Mauritius (private secondary schools), the Netherlands, Quebec and the United States, surpluses occur for the most part throughout the profession. In Ecuador, Luxembourg (chemistry, Latin, philosophy), New Zealand (English, social studies), Scotland ("modern studies"), Sri Lanka (English, science) and Thailand (social sciences) they are confined to secondary teachers and particularly to certain subjects. Like the shortages, surpluses are sometimes linked to a specific geographical or sociological environment. Chile, Cyprus, Madagascar, Peru and the Philippines note that surpluses build up in the large towns and the capital.

#### Views on the causes of the shortages and surpluses

395. According to Cuba, Hungary, Kenya and Madagascar, the shortage is due to the expansion of the education system, which in turn stems from the efforts to provide schooling for all children of school age in a short space of time. A similar explanation is given by Sweden where - unlike the other European countries - the number of schoolchildren is currently on the increase, so that new secondary schools are needed. The lack of training establishments and the failure of existing ones to adapt to changing requirements for teaching staff are mentioned as causes of the shortage by Bangladesh, Hungary, Malta, Thailand and Tunisia.

396. Several countries, both industrialised and developing, consider the inadequacy of the education budget in general, and the insufficient expenditure on teaching staff in particular, to be largely responsible for the shortages, e.g. Cameroon, Federal Republic of Germany, Pakistan, Peru, Philippines, Spain and the United States. The worsening status of teachers is the reason for the difficulty in recruiting new staff and explains the fact that teachers are leaving the profession and turning to more lucrative careers (administration, industry, trade). This

is stressed by Barbados, Cameroon, Ireland, Jordan, Peru, Tunisia, the United Kingdom and the United States. In Quebec, rigid regulations do not allow teachers to transfer from a region in which there are surpluses to one which is suffering from shortages. In Tunisia, the fact that teacher-training colleges are to be found only in urban areas indirectly contributes to the shortages in rural zones, which hold little attraction for newly qualified teachers trained in the towns.

397. The following seven countries give as the reason for the surpluses the decrease in the birth rate, which means that there are less schoolchildren and that consequently fewer teachers are needed: Australia, Canada, Federal Republic of Germany, Japan, Mauritius, Netherlands and New Zealand. All but one are industrialised countries. According to India and Thailand, the shortage is mainly caused by the lack of data and planning, and by the absence of co-ordination between the training colleges and educational administrators.

#### Forecasts for the next ten years

398. Argentina, Czechoslovakia, Cuba, Ecuador, Ireland, Malta and Tunisia hope either to maintain or to establish a balance between staff needs and the number of teachers available. Argentina is relying on its currently low rate of population growth to achieve this. Cuba considers that its establishments for the training and further training of teachers are capable of providing an adequate supply of teachers for the next ten years. Czechoslovakia hopes to attain its purpose by stringent socio-economic planning. Ecuador, which has not reported any shortages at primary level, is relying on its national five-year plan, which includes estimates for the training of primary and pre-primary teachers, to maintain a balanced supply in the future.

399. Chile fears that the shortage might worsen because 500 private secondary schools were opened in 1981. Scotland expects the shortage of physics teachers to continue, although the current need for mathematics and technology teachers will probably be met more rapidly. The United Kingdom notes with satisfaction that the recently introduced certificate in mathematics and physics is attracting an increasing number of candidates, and it will thus be able to make good the shortage of teachers in these subjects. The United States consider that the shortage will disappear if salaries and working conditions are improved, so that teachers can obtain greater work satisfaction.

400. As for the elimination of the surplus of teachers, the views expressed by the governments are far from optimistic. Canada, Cyprus, Denmark, the Federal Republic of Germany, Japan and Norway believe that there will continue to be surpluses in some cases up to the 1990s and beyond. Australia expects the demand for primary teachers to decrease by 40 per cent in 1984 as compared with 1978, and by 30 per cent for secondary teachers. The demand for secondary teachers will continue to lessen after 1984, while the demand for primary teachers will begin to rise.

#### Measures taken in the event of shortage

401. In countries suffering from a shortage of teachers, it might become necessary to increase the size of classes. Such a measure has only been taken - or is under consideration - in a limited number of the countries concerned: Argentina, Bangladesh, Cameroon, Guyana, Indonesia, Ireland, Nicaragua, Pakistan, Sweden, Tanzania and Thailand. In other countries experiencing shortages, class sizes have not been increased: Israel, India, Jordan, Kenya, Madagascar, Norway and Sri Lanka. In Barbados and Peru, class sizes have been reduced, and they are due to be reduced in Cameroon. In Egypt and Pakistan, the class hours of teachers have been increased, and their salaries raised accordingly.

402. The "short-term intensive preparation programmes" referred to in paragraph 142 of the Recommendation consist of short training programmes with a reduced content. A few countries appear to have recourse to this type of training in the event of shortage, although they do not go into any detail. The Byelorussian SSR, Indonesia, Madagascar, Nicaragua, Spain, Thailand, Scotland and Kenya maintain that "accelerated" training is unacceptable because it amounts to training "on the cheap". However, in several countries, the training programmes for teachers who have not been fully trained are comparable in content to those offered at regular training colleges. They combine evening classes, correspondence courses and sometimes the use of radio, with seminars and private study. They often extend over several years, e.g. Egypt and Kenya, 2 years; Guyana, 2-3 years; Peru, 5 years; and Tanzania, 3 years.

The United Kingdom is considering setting up a two-year programme to train teachers in subjects where there are shortages. In Chile, the training of underqualified teachers is integrated with the in-service training programme.

403. The following countries use foreign teachers to reduce shortages: Cameroon, Jordan (258 Egyptians), New Zealand (108 at primary level, 676 at secondary level), and Tunisia (506 at secondary level, mostly French). In Kuwait, there are a considerable number of teachers from other Arab countries as a result of agreements reached between those countries and Kuwait. Some countries recruit foreign teachers to provide instruction for the children of immigrants or of linguistic minorities: Austria (100 Yugoslavs and Moroccans), Finland (50 Swedes), Netherlands (456 Turks and Moroccans). Several countries have a small number of foreign teachers to teach their respective languages (Barbados, Egypt, Japan, etc.).

404. The following countries are endeavouring to induce persons who have left the profession, in particular pensioners and women, to return to teaching: Argentina, Bulgaria, Chile, Czechoslovakia, Egypt, Guyana, Hungary, Jordan, New Zealand, Peru, Scotland, Tanzania and Tunisia. The replies of these countries do not include any information on the number of people who have resumed teaching, nor on the conditions under which they have done so. Other countries are either not in favour of such persons taking up teaching again or else do not assist them to do so: Austria, Barbados, Cameroon, Cuba, Finland, Kenya, Luxembourg, Malta, Netherlands, Norway, Pakistan, Quebec and Spain.

405. A large number of countries employ staff lacking the requisite qualifications for teaching. This will obviously be the case in countries suffering from large-scale shortages, e.g. Cameroon, Egypt, Guyana, Kenya, Pakistan, Peru, Sri Lanka and Tunisia. However, several industrialised countries admit to being obliged to employ underqualified personnel when they lack teachers with the full qualifications in a subject: Austria, Finland, Quebec, Sweden (16 per cent at primary level, 12 per cent at secondary level), the United Kingdom (10 per cent of mathematics and physics teachers, all recent recruits) and the United States (teachers trained in one subject but teaching another). All countries using unqualified teachers indicate that to continue in the profession, such teachers are required to obtain the necessary qualifications within a given time limit (varying from country to country). The only exception is Peru, which does not require underqualified teachers working in rural and mountainous areas, of whom there are over 30,000, to complete their studies, conditions in the country being such that the teachers could not be replaced whatever their professional level. Several countries cite regulations that make it an offence to recruit teachers who are not fully qualified, e.g. Israel, Luxembourg, Philippines, Scotland and Spain.

406. The contribution of new teaching methods (audio-visual aids, mass media, self-teaching techniques) to mitigating staff shortages is disputed in most of the replies, except for Pakistan (the use of radio) and the Philippines. It is acknowledged that the use of such methods is likely to improve the quality of the teaching (Bangladesh), facilitate the teacher's task in overcrowded classrooms (Chile) and enhance the effectiveness of training college courses (Israel). However, a large number of replies (17) do not consider there to be any connection between the use of new teaching methods and the reduction of teacher shortages. Czechoslovakia considers, on the contrary, that the introduction of such methods leads to an increase in ancillary staff.

407. Few replies acknowledge that an improvement of the economic and social position of teachers contributes to overcoming the shortage (Jordan, New Zealand, the Philippines). Tanzania notes that pay increases and improvements in the promotion system have not lessened the shortage. The United Kingdom considers that the shortage should not be overcome by increasing the salaries of teachers specialising in the subjects where there are shortages. The United States share this view and draw attention to the fact that teachers' organisations are opposed to a policy that favours one group of teachers without this being justified on professional grounds. A fair number of replies draw attention to current or imminent improvements in the working conditions of all teachers, e.g. Bangladesh, Bulgaria, Cuba, Czechoslovakia, German Democratic Republic, Hungary, India, Indonesia, Jamaica, Japan, Malta, Nicaragua, Scotland and Sri Lanka. In Cuba and Tunisia, teachers are in a privileged position compared to other public employees. Mauritius' reply states that the improvement in salaries and working conditions of teachers in recent years attracted too many candidates to the profession and has led to a surplus of teachers. Guyana notes that since teachers were awarded their last pay rise in 1973, other groups of workers have obtained greater increases and this has diminished the esteem enjoyed by the teaching profession.

408. To induce teachers to work in isolated or backward areas, various advantages are offered, e.g. financial benefits (Chile, Egypt, Japan, Kuwait, Norway, Pakistan, Sri Lanka); free travel (Indonesia, Norway, Spain); free accommodation (Chile, India, Kuwait); and opportunities to take study leave (Guyana, Mauritius). Peru notes that official regulations benefiting teachers in deprived areas exist but are not applied.

409. Among other measures taken to make good the shortage, the following are mentioned. In Egypt, graduates from various non-educational faculties have been asked to teach in secondary schools. In Peru, students in the fifth year of secondary education are recruited for teaching at primary level. The Philippines grant material advantages to the teachers in vocational schools. A pilot project is currently being tried out in the United Kingdom for advanced students who take a two-year course in mathematics, physics and chemistry. They receive a grant of £500 and are guaranteed a teaching post. In Tanzania, an accelerated promotion system has been introduced so as to retain in the profession teachers who might otherwise be attracted by other careers.

410. In short, each country has to its credit some of the aforementioned measures as well as others that are not listed here. For the country concerned, they form a package of measures, the effectiveness of which is due not only to the nature of each individual measure but also to their relationship with one another within the economic conditions prevailing in the country that adopts them. A brief survey of the situation in several countries will bring the problem into perspective.

411. India is dealing with the shortage of teachers by using a number of unqualified teachers who are, however, required to possess the minimum academic qualifications in order to teach their subject. They are offered certain facilities to enable them to complete their training, either full-time or by means of a correspondence course that includes personal contact with the teacher. A four-year experimental teacher-training programme has been introduced in certain teacher-training colleges.

412. Pakistan states that class sizes have increased gradually over recent years. Unqualified teaching staff are used when there are serious shortages. These teachers are, however, required to attend training courses to complete their qualifications.

413. As a result of increasing the workload of teachers, Egypt has raised their salaries. Training programmes are organised for unqualified teachers during the school and public holidays.

414. Bangladesh, while suffering from a shortage of trained teachers mainly due to the lack of adequate training facilities, does not generally employ foreign teachers at school level (except for specific language and technical courses at higher school level) but relies on short training courses and new educational approaches such as school broadcasts to improve teaching methods. Improvements in the salary scale and in the teaching service regulations are also expected to attract more worthy elements to the profession.

415. Kuwait, while maintaining class sizes and officially decreasing teachers' workloads, copes with the shortage of teachers by employing a large number of non-Kuwaiti teachers, principally from Arab countries, and a considerable number of teachers with only secondary education to teach at primary level. Men and women teachers are allowed to return to work provided they have not reached retirement age. Measures taken to improve the socio-economic status of teachers lead to positive results in the retention of teachers. These include financial and residential facilities for teachers for remote areas.

#### Measures taken in the event of surpluses

416. In a number of countries with surpluses, the standards and practices regarding class size and teacher workload have been relaxed, e.g. Canada, Federal Republic of Germany, Finland, Luxembourg, Mauritius (under consideration), New Zealand, Philippines, Sri Lanka (under consideration), Sweden, Thailand and Tunisia. The Federal Republic of Germany has introduced measures such as employing teachers with half the normal workload and a correspondingly reduced salary, and giving teachers more days off if they have school-age children of their own. Cyprus points out that the standards applying to class size have become unrealistic as a result of the destruction of many schools during the recent war.

417. The majority of the replies refer to governmental planning bodies which ensure that admission to training takes into account the real demand for teaching staff, e.g. Chile, Finland, German Democratic Republic, Israel, New Zealand, Norway, Philippines (regional bodies), Scotland, Spain, Sweden, Thailand and the United Kingdom. In other countries with surpluses, admission to training is not limited through government planning but by making the public and students aware of employment prospects in teaching. This applies to Canada, the Federal Republic of Germany, the Netherlands, and Quebec. The following figures show how enrolments in training colleges have decreased. There will have been a drop of 20 per cent in Australia, for example, between 1978 and 1984, and in Canada, 6,700 teachers qualified in 1975-1976 as against only 3,183 in 1977-1978. Jordan reports a different approach to the problem of surpluses. It organises refresher courses for surplus teachers to enable them to adapt theoretical teaching to the practical needs of their classes. Other courses train surplus primary teachers for teaching at kindergarten and pre-primary levels.

418. In certain countries surplus teachers are transferred - sometimes after taking refresher courses - to schools suffering from shortages. This is done on the decision of the educational authorities in charge of staffing, e.g. Austria, Chile, Jordan, Kuwait, Mauritius and Sri Lanka. In Cyprus, surplus teachers are transferred to different ministries, such as the Ministries of Education, Information and Social Services. In other countries the central authorities are not directly involved, e.g. Canada, Federal Republic of Germany, Israel, Japan, Netherlands, New Zealand, Norway, Scotland, United Kingdom and the United States. The replies do not provide information on what individual teachers do in this matter. In several countries the teachers' organisations negotiate with the authorities on this subject. In New Zealand, a list of surplus teachers is periodically circulated among the headmasters of schools. In Malta, teachers can transfer more easily due to the fact that primary and secondary teachers are interchangeable. Surplus qualified teachers in Cuba replace their underqualified colleagues, who are given study leave. In other countries, surplus staff are used to improve pupil supervision and the quality of the teaching, e.g. German Democratic Republic, Jordan, Luxembourg, Netherlands and Tunisia.

419. The countries which encourage their surplus teachers to seek work abroad are few and far between. India reports that a "large number" of its teachers are working in Africa and the Arab countries. Jordan and Pakistan also indicate that nationals of their countries are teaching abroad. Surplus Cypriot teachers used to be encouraged to go abroad but this practice has been abandoned. Several countries state that information about the possibility of working abroad is made available to teachers, without further help being offered them.

420. Surplus teachers unable to find another job retain their contracts and their rights, e.g. Canada (and Quebec) and Cyprus. They are required to accept temporary assignments. The teachers' organisations in Canada organise "employment markets" at which teachers have the opportunity to meet industrialists and businessmen and discuss employment prospects with them. The educational authorities in the United States also keep teachers informed about job prospects outside the education field, while encouraging them to obtain qualifications in subjects where there are staff shortages.

421. Several administrative measures mentioned in the replies aim to make teaching posts wholly or partly free for surplus teachers. These measures include reduction in class sizes, reduction of class hours, sharing the responsibilities of a single class among several teachers, ending overtime and encouraging early retirement.

422. A number of replies contain information showing that countries wish to take advantage of the teacher surplus to improve the education system. Thus in Mauritius each class is divided into several units, each under a different teacher. The teachers are thus in a position to adapt their teaching to individual requirements. In Jordan and Malta surplus teachers are sent on refresher courses so that they can introduce new features into traditional teaching, e.g. remedial work, art education and physical education. Surplus teachers in the Philippines are given responsibilities such as editing a school newspaper or running youth groups for the pupils.



Consultation of teachers' organisations

423. Among the forty replies received, fifteen countries indicated that teachers' organisations were not consulted by educational authorities regarding the problems of supply and demand of teaching staff, viz. Argentina (considers that this matter does not fall within the province of teachers' organisations), Barbados, Chile, Ecuador, India, Jordan, Madagascar, Nicaragua, Norway (considers such consultation to be unnecessary), Pakistan, Peru (on account of tension between the teachers' union and other organisations), Philippines, Quebec, Spain and Sri Lanka.

424. From the twenty-six positive replies, it can be seen that the teachers' organisations are consulted in a variety of ways. In most cases consultation takes place through regular contacts between representatives of the Ministry of Education and teachers' representatives. In other cases, consultation takes the form of written exchanges between the organisations and the authorities (Luxembourg, Thailand). In several countries the organisations are represented on official bodies responsible for the supply and demand of teaching personnel (Austria, Israel, Jamaica, Sweden, United Kingdom).

Table XVI: Shortages and surpluses of teachers

Country	Balanced supply	Shortages	Surpluses
Argentina		L (rural zones)	
Australia			G
Bangladesh		G	
Barbados		S (maths., science, business studies)	
Bulgaria		L (isolated areas)	
Byelorussian SSR		S (pre-primary educ., music, phys. educ.)	
Cameroon		G (science, technology)	
Canada (Quebec)			G (20%)
Chile		L (rural zones) S (science, technology)	
Cyprus		S (pre-primary educ.)	
Cuba		S (secondary educ.)	
Czechoslovakia	X		
Ecuador			S (chemistry, Latin)
Egypt		S (languages)	
France		T	T
German Dem. Rep.	X		
Guyana		S (pre-primary educ., science)	
Hungary		S (pre-primary educ., music, phys. educ.)	
India			G
Indonesia		G	
Ireland	X		
Israel		L (isolated areas) S (music, phys. educ.)	
Japan			G
Jordan		305 <sup>1</sup>	124 <sup>2</sup>
Kenya		G (10%)	
Kuwait	X		
Luxembourg		S (science)	S (Latin, philosophy)
Madagascar		L (isolated areas)	L (towns)
Malta		T	G
Mauritius			S (private secondary schools)
Netherlands			G (8.5%)
New Zealand		S (science)	S (English, social studies)
Nicaragua		G (science, industry, agriculture)	
Norway		L (isolated areas)	

Table XVI contd.

Country	Balanced supply	Shortages	Surpluses
Pakistan		G	
Peru		L (isolated areas)	L (towns)
Philippines			L (towns)
Sri Lanka		S (science)	S (science, English)
Sweden		G (16% in primary education, 12% in secondary educ.)	
Thailand		S (science, handi-crafts)	S (social sciences)
Tunisia		S (science, artistic subjects, music)	
United Kingdom		S (science)	
United Kingdom		S (physics)	S (geography, history)
United States		S (maths., science, agriculture)	G
Venezuela	x <sup>3</sup>		

G - shortages, surpluses throughout all educational levels.

S - shortages, surpluses confined to a single educational level, to certain specialised disciplines.

L - limited to certain geographical zones.

T - temporary and minor shortages and surpluses.

<sup>1</sup> Men teachers.

<sup>2</sup> Women teachers.

<sup>3</sup> Venezuela however has reported the presence of under qualified teachers in its education system (see table XIV).

## CONCLUSIONS

425. Like the previous two questionnaires, the third consists of two parts (A and B). The first part deals with general questions concerning the application of the Recommendation as a whole and the second with specific questions. While retaining the general layout of the previous two questionnaires, the third has attempted to introduce a new element: a survey of the application of the Recommendation in the light of the changes in educational systems. It has therefore introduced a dynamic perspective which is concerned not with a country's progression towards a fuller application of the Recommendation considered as a definitive document but rather with the tendencies at work in educational systems, the changes introduced into those systems in the organisation of education, the training of staff and the updating of curricula in response to the new needs of peoples undergoing rapid change. The Committee notes with satisfaction that the replies, in spite of their lack of precision, have however confirmed the new tendencies within education systems which have led them to devise curricula better adapted to the socio-economic needs of society and towards methods of accelerated and yet continuing staff training. As far as the Recommendation is concerned, the Committee notes with satisfaction the efforts accomplished by UNESCO to link up more closely activities relating to the dissemination and application of this standard-setting instrument with the substantive and operational activities included in the regular programme of the organisation.

426. These conclusions have been prepared in the dynamic perspective which the Committee adopted at its First Session, namely with a view to ascertaining, not only the situation at a given point of time, but also the main trends in the conditions which determine the status of teachers. Thus, each subject is examined with particular reference to any relevant observations the Committee may have made, or conclusions it may have reached, at previous sessions.

### Conclusions on general questions

427. Although this part of the questionnaire deals with the Recommendation as a whole, member States were of course not required to repeat information which they had given in previous reports. Specific topics which had not been dealt with or had received only cursory treatment in previous questionnaires had been selected under each section of the Recommendation and member States were asked to give information on them if they had not done so before or indicate changes which had taken place in law and in practice and any difficulties encountered since their last report. The conclusions therefore have been taken in conjunction with those arrived at in previous reports on the same topics.

428. In the section on preparation for the profession, member States were asked specific information on the following topics: conditions of access to teacher training, facilities granted to future teachers, duration and content of teacher preparation programmes and the organisation of teacher preparation institutions.

429. On the conditions of access to teacher training, the Recommendation requires that candidates for teacher preparation should have completed an appropriate secondary education course, and show evidence of possessing personal qualities worthy of members of the profession. About 12 countries out of 52 answering the questions, i.e. 23 per cent, stated that their admission standards fall below the minimum standard stated by the Recommendation. A comparison with figures given in the two previous reports indicate a notable progress. However, this statement must be qualified, since the basis for comparison is not provided by the same countries over the three cycles of consultations. The Committee notes further that most countries compensate for low entry standard by a longer training course. This provides a provisional answer to the need to give a sound academic background to the teachers.

430. A number of countries have mentioned the existence of a lower category of teachers, assistant primary teachers with primary school-leaving certificates. While realising that such measures may be necessary in the face of teacher shortage, the Committee considers that no efforts should be spared to upgrade the academic knowledge of these teachers while giving them a good professional training.

431. The Recommendation requires that financial assistance should be available to students wishing to take up teaching as a profession and that the existence of such opportunities should be known of by students. Seventy-one per cent of the countries which answered the question stated that teacher trainees were granted facilities in their training. This assistance takes the form of financial grants in the way of salaries, allowances or scholarships which may be awarded subject to the parents' income. Particularly most developing countries provide salaries or grants to their teacher trainees.

432. The Committee notes with satisfaction that the situation in the majority of States conforms to the requirements of the Recommendation, which aims at the establishment of a system of free teacher-preparation institutions. It observes that in five industrialised affluent countries, in general, state loans are provided to teacher trainees. This method, if it does not deprive completely a section of the population of the possibility of taking up the profession, has the advantage of providing motivation to candidates to take their work seriously and achieve success. Moreover, the Committee is well aware of the financial implications of the assistance given to teacher trainees and is convinced that national teacher training plans have to be matched with general teacher employment plans so that the cost-effectiveness of the national teacher manpower programme is enhanced.

433. The Recommendation, in examining the purposes of a teacher-preparation programme, outlines the general profile of the teacher in terms of his general education and personal culture, ability to teach and educate others, awareness of principles underlying good human relations, sense of responsibility to contribute to social, cultural and economic progress. Such a profile is required of teachers of all levels whether primary, secondary, technical, specialist or vocational. The teacher education programme for those levels therefore should contain elements common to all of them. The Recommendation considers that these elements should be taught in universities, university-level institutions or special teacher education institutions.

434. On the duration and content of teacher-preparation programmes, the answers from member States have concentrated mainly on the duration of the courses, an aspect which was only cursorily dealt with in the previous questionnaire (see 1976 report). On the whole, it appears that teacher-preparation programmes have increased in duration. Ranging from one- to five-year programmes, they consist of academic and professional courses taken consecutively as in post-graduate education courses, or concurrently, as in education degrees or teacher training certificates or diplomas.

435. Most countries have stated that the content of their training programme covers the areas indicated in the Recommendation. Ten countries have mentioned the introduction of additional courses specific to the country and more relevant to the socio-economic needs of the society.

436. The Committee considers that the variety of programmes mentioned for teacher preparation bears witness to the varied conditions existing in member States. It notes with satisfaction the trend toward increasing allotted time for pedagogic training and the introduction of training given to teachers in subjects more specific to the country and relevant to its needs.

437. On the organisation of teacher training institutions, the Recommendation considers it desirable that different types of teachers should be trained in organically related or geographically adjacent centres. The advantages of such a system lie in the contribution it makes to reducing the differences in status associated with levels of education thereby promoting greater mobility within the profession. This makes it possible for all teachers to effect their maximum contribution to teaching. In its previous report (1976) the Committee had noted that for a growing number of countries, the teacher education programmes for both primary and secondary levels are held in the same institutions. They are organised along the same lines and include a number of major common professional components.

438. The 1981 survey has now confirmed significantly this trend which aims at bringing nearer together the different categories of teachers. Steps taken by a number of countries in this direction include the following: training primary and secondary teachers in the same type of institution; training pre-primary, primary and lower secondary teachers in same institutions, promoting a uniform level of pedagogic preparation for all age levels and educational frameworks; raising primary teacher training to the university level; closer co-ordination between colleges training primary teachers and universities training secondary teachers; the transfer of teacher education to universities with the effect of unifying the education of the various teacher groups and creating closer contact between teacher education and research in education.

439. The Committee notes with satisfaction this trend which expresses itself in many different ways, some more effective than others. The various measures will be effective in the context of the Recommendation in so far as they promote the pedagogic element common to all teaching levels.

440. In the previous reports, it was established that in the majority of countries teaching experience was a required entry qualification for teacher educators, five years being the minimum period in most cases. The Recommendation adds that school-teaching experience should be periodically refreshed by secondment to teaching duties in schools.

441. There are still a number of countries which mention the lack of teaching experience in teacher educators or of the possibility of periodically refreshing such experience. The Committee, however, notes that a growing number of countries are attaching importance to meaningful school-teaching experience in teacher educators and recommends that efforts should be made to provide educators with opportunities of renewing such experience.

442. The Committee has observed that a substantial part of research activity in the field of education is carried out in developed countries, generally in university faculties of education. The Committee encourages developing countries to intensify their efforts to undertake such research work as could help them to find appropriate solutions to education problems facing them. Furthermore, the Committee notes with interest that more operational research activities are being encouraged for example in practising schools, at the Ministry of Education and in the classroom on such topics as teacher effectiveness, and points out that the communication to and application of research findings by teachers are equally important as stated in paragraph 26 of the Recommendation.

443. On the subject of recruitment conditions and policies, the Committee observed at its 1976 Session (Report, paragraphs 214 ff.) that in all countries professional qualifications were the primary criterion applied in recruiting teachers; stressed the importance of the qualities and skills referred to in paragraph 11 of the Recommendation; and emphasised that no account should be taken of criteria unrelated to the exercise of the profession. It stated that any requirement that a candidate for the teaching profession support the ruling political system or ideology, and that any requirement relating to documentary evidence concerning standards of conduct which would have the effect of making admission to the teaching profession subject in practice to political control on the part of the public authorities or of a political party, was incompatible with paragraph 7 of the Recommendation. It observed that in most countries teachers' organisations participated in one way or another in defining recruitment policy, but was unable to determine the degree of influence they exercised in that field.

444. The Committee notes that academic and professional qualifications continue to be the principal recruitment criteria accepted by virtually all countries and that in addition, many countries apply other criteria such as good character, physical and mental fitness and aptitude for teaching. However, the Committee observes that, notwithstanding the relevant provision in paragraph 38 of the Recommendation, teachers' organisations are associated with the definition of recruitment policies in a limited number of countries only.

445. At its 1976 Session, when considering the subject of advancement and promotion, the Committee noted (Report, paragraphs 217 ff.) that, in all the countries which had replied to the questionnaire, promotion criteria were essentially professional. It was unable to assess the objectivity of the promotion procedures in use, but drew attention to the importance of clear and full definition of all promotion criteria, such as character, attitude and personality, and to maintain the greatest possible objectivity in evaluating such qualities. Lastly, it observed that the role of teachers' organisations in determining promotion criteria generally appeared to be informal and consultative in character, and pointed out that situations in which teachers had no role in that field were not in accordance with paragraph 44 of the Recommendation.

446. The Committee notes that the criteria most frequently used for promotion purposes are academic qualifications, experience (or length of service) and performance as a teacher. It also notes that in a number of countries there is no bar to the promotion of experienced teachers to posts of inspector and educational administrator and that experienced teachers are appointed to such posts; however, on the basis of the information available, it is unable to state to what extent the statement in paragraph 43 of the Recommendation that such posts should be given "as far as possible" to experienced teachers is applied. It also observes that in some countries, notwithstanding the relevant provision in paragraph 44 of the Recommendation, teachers' organisations are not consulted in the establishment of promotion criteria.

447. On the subject of disciplinary rules and procedures, the Committee noted at its 1976 Session (Report, paragraph 221) that the procedural safeguards provided for in paragraph 50 of the Recommendation appeared to be applied in most - but not all - countries and emphasised the importance and necessity of provision for the right to defend oneself and be defended and the right of appeal. It also called on governments and responsible authorities to involve teachers and their organisations more closely in the establishment and application of disciplinary procedures.

448. It is apparent from the government replies that formalised disciplinary procedures exist in all the countries concerned. However, the Committee notes with regret that only two governments specifically state that teachers' organisations have participated in the establishment of disciplinary machinery. It also notes that in a number of countries provision exists for peer participation, either direct or indirect, in disciplinary proceedings against teachers, but that in others such participation is excluded. In addition, it observes that, although in all cases provision is made for formal hearing of disciplinary cases, the teacher concerned appears in some countries to be denied access, either in person or through a representative, to the hearing. The Committee considers that such a situation is prejudicial to the right of the teacher to defend himself and incompatible with paragraph 50(c) of the Recommendation.

449. When considering the subject of equality of opportunity and remuneration for men and women at its 1976 Session, the Committee noted (Report, paragraphs 226 ff.) that, while generally speaking no distinction between teachers on grounds of sex existed in law, measures seemed to be necessary to ensure that women teachers enjoyed equal career opportunities in practice, and that, where inequitable circumstances surrounding the career development of women teachers persisted, the absence of need for corrective measures could no longer be validly argued.

450. The information received confirms the general absence of discrimination between men and women in law with regard to opportunity and remuneration. Some countries, however, state that there are difficulties in the way of implementing the principle of non-discrimination (although in certain cases the situation appears to be improving). The Committee suggests that governments conduct investigations into the causes of these difficulties as a basis for the framing of measures to overcome them. It has included additional conclusions in paragraphs 472 and 554 on possible forms of discrimination based on sex relating to pay and social benefits.

451. As regards the rights and responsibilities of teachers, the Committee had observed at its 1976 Session that many reports pointed to considerable teacher participation at the level of individual schools and local communities in activities to renew educational curricula and methods such as the preparation of school textbooks and teaching materials. This is confirmed by the present survey which reveals that

out of 52 member States who answered a question on the participation of teachers in decision making regarding the contents and methods of teaching, only one member State indicated that no participation of teachers existed in curriculum development and in the selection of teaching methods and materials. Forty-five member States report that teachers either participate in curriculum development and working groups or are consulted individually or through their teachers' organisation.

452. The Committee notes that this participation in decision making ranges from the minor and routine action of consultation on the selection of textbooks through that of choosing and adapting teaching materials and methods to actions of greater significance such as the participation in developing new courses, textbooks and teaching aids.

453. The Committee, while expressing satisfaction at the development in the participation role of teachers in preparing curricula and teaching material notes that only a few countries have stated that teachers are consulted on the selection of textbooks.

454. It considers that in the spirit of the Recommendation (paragraphs 61, 62 and 63) this teacher participation, although undoubtedly an expression of professional freedom, to be effective must not only be within the framework of approved programmes but also supported by educational authorities and services such as systems of inspection or supervision. In other words, observance of a principle of coherence and regulation is essential to safeguard against the possible disruptive effects on the system as a whole of piecemeal innovations, however valuable in themselves.

455. The answers to the question do not permit the Committee to assess the over-all value for the education system of this specific participation role of teachers.

456. The Committee considered the question of the freedom of teachers to belong to a professional organisation or a teachers' union at both its 1970 and 1976 Sessions. At the latter session (Report, paragraph 207) it reaffirmed that teachers' organisations could not fulfil the role assigned to them in various parts of the Recommendation unless teachers enjoyed full freedom to form and join organisations of their own choosing.

457. It notes that in the great majority of countries there are no restrictions on the right of teachers to join a professional organisation or a union. It observes, however, that in some countries there is only one organisation which teachers may join. To the extent that the existence of only one teachers' organisation is imposed by law and does not result from the will of the teachers themselves, the Committee recalls that such a system would constitute a restriction of the right of workers to establish and join organisations of their own choosing without previous authorisation as laid down in the ILO Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organise Convention, 1948 (No. 87), referred to in the preamble to the Recommendation, and would thus appear to be incompatible with the spirit of the Recommendation.

458. As regards the freedom of teachers to belong to a political party, a religious organisation or a social or cultural organisation of their choice, the Committee notes that practically no restrictions appear to exist on membership of social and cultural organisations, provided that their activities are compatible with good order and good morals, and that only one country specifically refers to restrictions on membership of a religious organisation. However, it observes that, while in the majority of countries there is no formal restriction on membership of political parties, there are several in which teachers - or at any rate teachers in government schools - are not allowed to join such parties and others in which they are required to refrain from open and militant political activity. To justify such restrictions some governments explain that they are a necessary corollary of the political neutrality required of teachers in the public education service, or of public servants generally, nevertheless, this position is in clear contradiction with paragraph 80 of the Recommendation.



459. On the freedom of teachers to express unorthodox although legal views in the classroom on politics, religion, race, sexuality, the Committee notes that the majority of countries have stated that teachers have this freedom. However, they have added qualifying statements that generally relate this freedom to the teacher's responsibility to the pupil, the parents, the community and the nation at large.

460. The Committee fully recognises the complexity of the issues involved in the exercise of such freedom in the specific historic, socio-cultural and political context of nations. It expresses the wish, however, that governments should note the spirit of paragraph 61 of the Recommendation and, in placing limitations on teachers in the exercise of their freedom to express unorthodox views in the classroom, consider limitations of the type mentioned in paragraph 96 of the report.

461. Some countries have given guarded replies agreeing to the teachers' freedom on some but not all of the four subjects. For example, sensitivity on politics and race is related to the political regime and the ethnic composition of the nation. On matters of religion and sex, restraints are mostly provided by the social, cultural and personal values traditionally cultivated in the society.

462. The Committee notes that all the governments replying state that teachers are free to enjoy all civil rights generally enjoyed by citizens, and that many specifically refer to eligibility for public office; several refer to special arrangements to safeguard the acquired rights of teachers during terms of public office. However, in assessing the degree of application of the Recommendation in this field, the Committee must bear in mind the restrictions, mentioned in paragraph 480, applying in some countries to the freedom of teachers to join the political parties of their choice and to engage in political activity. It also observes that in some countries teachers are prohibited from standing for public office, in some cases on the grounds of their status as public servants. This is contrary to the provisions of paragraph 80 of the Recommendation, which provide that teachers should be free to exercise all civic rights generally enjoyed by citizens and should be eligible for public office.

463. On the subject of codes of ethics established by teachers' organisations, the Committee, at its 1976 Session (Report, paragraph 222), drew attention to the differences between codes established by teachers' organisations and those imposed by public authorities or employers, which, when adopted without consultation or with the agreement of teachers' organisations, were contrary to paragraph 71 of the Recommendation.

464. The Committee notes that, in 15 out of the 27 countries which gave information on codes of ethics for teachers, the organisations of teachers either have established codes of ethics or are in the course of doing so. However, it observes that in 11 of the remaining countries codes of teacher ethics are laid down by law (although two of the governments concerned state that teachers' organisations were consulted). The Committee can only reaffirm its earlier position on the subject. It also observes that in several countries teachers are subject to ethical standards of a general character, applicable to other categories of workers as well as teachers. It considers that, whatever the value of such standards, they may fail to contribute to ensuring the prestige of the profession and the exercise of professional duties to the same extent as a code specific to the profession, drawn up by teachers' organisations in accordance with the terms of paragraph 73 of the Recommendation.

465. On the subject of the right of teachers' organisations to participate in the determination of their conditions of employment, the Committee stated at its 1970 Session (Report, paragraph 337) that the position regarding negotiating procedures could not be regarded as satisfactory; that in many of the instances where teachers had the status of public servants, their conditions of employment appeared to be determined unilaterally without any form of negotiation (although some measure of consultation might be provided for); and that measures appeared to be necessary in a considerable number of countries to give effect to paragraphs 82 and 83 of the Recommendation. At its 1976 Session (Report, paragraphs 209-210) it emphasised that determination of salaries and working conditions of teachers unilaterally by the public authorities, without the teachers being able to exercise any real influence over the decisions taken, was contrary to the Recommendation; noted with satisfaction

a trend towards greater participation by teachers' organisations in determining the conditions of employment of teachers in the public sector; and expressed the view that, where the legal provisions applicable to the public service did not authorise the making of collective agreements binding on the State vis-à-vis its employees, the situation in those countries might be considered compatible with paragraphs 82 and 83 of the Recommendation in so far as true bargaining existed and that the public employers made all possible efforts to have the results of the negotiations endorsed by the competent authority.

466. The fact that the information given on this subject was considerably less specific than that submitted to the Committee at its 1976 Session makes it difficult to draw any conclusions on developments since 1976. However, the Committee notes that, as in 1976, there are a number of countries in which teachers' organisations have no part to play in the determination of their salaries and working conditions, and that, in others, while some measure of consultation exists, it is not equivalent to "the process of negotiation between teachers' organisations and the employers of teachers" called for in the Recommendation. It is clear that in some of the countries concerned, the consultation process takes place with a view to reaching a final agreement; but some governments refer to a factor not mentioned in previous reports, namely the view that the financial commitments entailed by education are such as to preclude abrogation, by the legislature or the competent authorities, of their powers of final decision in this field. In a number of countries, teachers' salaries and working conditions are stated to be negotiated and in some cases it is clear that the process is in accordance with paragraphs 82 and 83 of the Recommendation; in other cases, however, in the absence of information on the outcome of the process and the nature and source of the final decision, it is difficult to judge whether the negotiations meet the standards established in this part of the Recommendation as interpreted by earlier conclusions of the Committee. But the most disquieting feature of all, in the view of the Committee, is that in countries for which information is available over a period and in which the situation in this regard falls short of the standards set by paragraphs 82 and 83 of the Recommendation, there is little or no evidence of any improvement in the situation or of attempts to improve it. The Committee therefore urges the governments of the countries concerned to take the necessary measures to give teachers' organisations the right of negotiation which is recognised by paragraphs 82 and 83 of the Recommendation - a right which it does not consider incompatible with the financial prerogatives of government. In this connection, the Committee draws attention to Article 7 of the ILO Convention concerning Protection of the Right to Organise and Procedures for Determining Conditions of Employment in the Public Service Convention, 1978 (No. 151) - adopted since the adaptation of the Recommendation and hence not referred to therein - which calls for measures to encourage and promote the full development and utilisation of machinery for negotiation of terms and conditions of employment between the public authorities concerned and public employees' organisations, or of such other methods as will allow representatives of public employees to participate in the determination of these matters.

467. As regards the provisions in paragraph 84 of the Recommendation concerning machinery for the settlement of disputes, the Committee observed at its 1976 Session (Report, paragraph 211) that in only a few countries did joint machinery corresponding to the provisions of the Recommendation exist and expressed the view that the failure to implement that part of the Recommendation was an indication that the machinery provided for in the first sentence of paragraph 84 was not adapted to the system governing teachers in the public service in many countries. It also expressed the view that, in the event of a revision of the Recommendation being considered, a new formulation of that provision might be envisaged allowing a choice of approaches to the problem, instead of insisting on one method only. However, at its 1979 Session, on the basis of a comparative analysis of the provisions of the Recommendation with those of ILO Convention No. 151, 1978, the Committee concluded that it was neither necessary nor desirable to revise these paragraphs of the Recommendation.

468. The Committee notes that, in the majority of countries which provided information on this point, machinery for the settlement of disputes exists, but that it takes a wide variety of forms; and that, moreover, it usually takes the form of an external body (arbitration board, administrative tribunal, ordinary courts) rather than that of joint machinery as provided for in the Recommendation. The

Committee also notes that Article 8 of Convention No. 151 provides that the settlement of disputes arising in connection with the determination of terms and conditions of employment shall be sought, as may be appropriate to national conditions, through negotiation between the parties or through independent and impartial machinery, such as mediation, conciliation and arbitration, established in such a manner as to ensure the confidence of the parties involved. It expresses the hope that, in all countries in which machinery for the settlement of disputes in line with either the provisions of the Recommendation or with ILO Convention No. 151 does not yet exist, the necessary steps will be taken to establish such machinery.

469. On the subject of the right of teachers to strike, the Committee recalls that at its 1970 Session (Report, paragraph 339) it interpreted the final sentence of paragraph 84 of the Recommendation as implying that teachers' organisations should have that right; it confirmed that position in 1976 (Report, paragraph 212), stating that, while restrictions on strikes might be acceptable during the course of the procedure for the settlement of disputes, a total ban on strikes was incompatible with that provision. It also recalls that, in accordance with paragraph 84 of the Recommendation, the right of teachers' organisations to "take such other steps as are normally open to other organisations in the defence of their legitimate interests" arises if the means and procedures established for the purposes of settling disputes between the teachers and their employers arising out of terms and conditions of employment are exhausted or if there should be a breakdown in negotiations between the parties. It observes that, in several countries, teachers appear to be debarred from striking in virtue of a prohibition on striking which is applicable to public servants generally. In this connection the Committee recalls that paragraph 84 of the Recommendation, like the Recommendation as a whole, applies to all the teachers in a country, whether in the public or private sectors of teaching, and therefore reiterates its former position that all teachers, irrespective of status, should enjoy the right to strike in the conditions specified in paragraph 84 of the Recommendation.

470. The subject of teachers' salaries was examined by the Committee at its special session in 1979 on the basis of a study prepared by the ILO at its request.<sup>1</sup> It observed that salary was the principal, if not the only, means of attracting entrants of the necessary calibre and retaining them. It agreed that, for purposes of international comparison, the level of average earnings in manufacturing industry in a country was an acceptable yardstick against which to measure the salaries of teachers in that country. It agreed that information to the effect that the salaries of teachers (or a substantial proportion of them) in a given country were substantially below that level, or that teachers were placed in one of the lowest pay classes in the public service hierarchy, in a particular country was prima facie evidence that the government of the country concerned was not applying this part of the Recommendation. It welcomed the development of machinery of consultation on salary questions between governments and teachers' organisations in a number of countries and noted with regret that no consultation existed in a considerable number of others. It considered that failure to provide for extra pay for hours worked, in excess of the normal maximum, and failure to pay salaries regularly throughout the year, constituted failures to apply paragraph 118 of the Recommendation. Lastly, it expressed the view that cost-of-living adjustments in the form of adjustments to pensionable salaries were preferable to systems involving payment of separate cost-of-living allowances.

471. The Committee is unable to reach any general conclusions on policies with regard to remuneration, since only a small number of countries provided substantive information on the subject. It notes that the criteria used for setting salaries are, in the great majority of cases, levels of academic attainment and length of service in the profession, but that a variety of other factors - some of which it may be difficult to evaluate objectively - are in use in individual countries. The Committee recalls the need for the use of objective criteria for the establishment of salary differentials laid down in paragraph 119 of the Recommendation and considers that, when evaluating these factors - and especially personal qualities and performance - for purposes of salary determination, the competent authorities should endeavour to maintain the greatest possible objectivity so as to avoid injustices and anomalies, in accordance with paragraph 116.

472. As regards salary levels, the Committee notes that, in 15 of the 32 countries and territorial units which provided information on the subject, the starting salaries of primary school teachers are 10 per cent or more (in nine of them over 20 per cent) below the average level of earnings in manufacturing industry; and that in six of those countries secondary school teachers are in a

---

<sup>1</sup> ILO: Teachers' Pay, op. cit.

similar position. The Committee recalls its views on situations of this kind expressed at its 1979 Session, emphasising that, in accordance with paragraph 115 of the Recommendation, teachers' salaries should reflect the importance to society of the teaching function. In this connection the Committee also observes that, in 12 of the 19 countries which provided information on the subject, teachers' salaries are lower than those payable to persons with comparable qualifications in private enterprise. In addition, it observes that, while in the majority of the countries which provided information on the subject, teachers enjoy salary levels comparable to or more favourable than those of persons with similar qualifications in the public service, there are several in which they receive relatively unfavourable treatment. The Committee, recalling its position expressed in 1979, emphasises that insufficient levels of pay are of a nature to compromise the recruitment of teachers of the required quality, especially at a time when the duration of teacher preparation is increasing. It also observes that in a number of countries teachers' salaries are supplemented by various allowances in cash or in kind (e.g. in relation to housing) and considers that the subject should be explored in greater detail in a future reporting cycle.

473. The Committee notes that, in most of the countries replying, formal arrangements of some kind exist for the adjustment of teachers' salaries to upward movements in the cost of living. However, it notes with concern that in a considerable number of countries cost-of-living adjustments have not kept pace with the rise in the cost of living. The Committee is unable to determine whether teachers are more or less favourably treated than other groups of workers in the same country in this regard. Nevertheless, it fears that if this situation is allowed to continue, teachers' salaries may no longer provide them with the means to ensure a reasonable standard of living for themselves and their families, as called for in paragraph 115 of the Recommendation.

474. At its 1979 Session, on the basis of the examination of a study on the subject prepared by the ILO,<sup>1</sup> the Committee arrived at the conclusion that there was perhaps no country in the world which could claim to have fully applied the provisions of Section XI of the Recommendation relating to social security. Teachers on the whole appeared to be in a similar position to other workers; they sometimes enjoyed more favourable treatment but rarely less favourable treatment. Earlier, at its 1976 Session (Report, paragraph 231) the Committee had pointed out that, according to the Recommendation, teachers should be protected against all the contingencies mentioned in Convention No. 102, even if the country's workers as a whole did not enjoy such protection, and suggested that, where no general scheme existed for one or more of the contingencies, special schemes should be established for teachers.

475. The Committee notes that since 1979 there have been practically no ratifications of either Convention No. 102 or the three Conventions setting higher standards in respect of certain parts of it. It also notes the relatively small total numbers of ratifications of these four Conventions. However, it notes that, in practically all the countries which supplied information on the subject, teachers do enjoy a measure of social security protection, either under schemes for workers generally or under special schemes for public servants or specifically for teachers.

476. The Committee notes that the general patterns of social security coverage of teachers have not changed substantially. The contingencies covered in the greatest numbers of countries continue to be those of old age and sickness; those least frequently covered are those of unemployment and family responsibilities. The questions put were too general in character to permit detailed assessment of developments in the position during the past five years; however, the Committee notes that five of the governments which provided information on the subject for both the Third and Fourth Sessions of the Committee have introduced or improved their unemployment insurance schemes and are now in a position to state that their social security schemes cover all the contingencies referred to in Convention No. 102.

477. The Committee recalls its earlier observations (1976 Session, Report, paragraph 166) concerning the great variation in the degree of protection against a particular contingency existing between one country and another; on the specific subject of the absence of coverage against unemployment in some countries, it recalled the statement that no unemployment exists in some of the countries concerned and the security of employment enjoyed by teachers by virtue of their status as public officials or employees in others.

---

<sup>1</sup> ILO: Social Security for Teachers (Geneva, ILO, 1979).

478. On the basis of the information provided, the Committee is unable to reach any conclusion on the extent of application of the provisions relating to special arrangements for teachers in respect of specific contingencies contained in paragraphs 128-138 of the Recommendation.

479. The Committee reiterates its earlier statement that, in accordance with the terms of the Recommendation, teachers must be protected against all the contingencies mentioned in Convention No. 102, even if the country's workers as a whole do not enjoy such protection, and urges governments to make additional efforts to attain that goal by all appropriate means. The most desirable means of achieving this goal would be an appropriate expansion of a general scheme applicable to employed persons, as stated in paragraph 139(1) of the Recommendation; however, the Committee calls attention to paragraph 139(2), which provides that, where no general scheme is in existence for one or more of the contingencies to be covered, special schemes should be established.

### Conclusions on particular questions

#### Application of the Recommendation to teachers in private establishments

480. The Committee had observed, at its 1976 Session (Report, paragraph 176), that the picture regarding the application of the Recommendation to teachers in private establishments given in the replies to the questionnaire, was incomplete and had the impression that many governments, when preparing their replies, had principally, if not solely, made reference to the public sector. Accordingly, it decides, at its 1979 special session, to include in the questionnaire for the present session a section dealing specifically with the application of the Recommendation to teachers in private establishments.

481. Generally speaking, the responses of governments to the questions in this section were not sufficiently complete to enable the Committee to reach any conclusions of a general character on the application of the Recommendation in private establishments. One of the reasons for the paucity of information may lie in the fact that - as is apparent from a number of the reports - many of the subjects referred to in this part of the questionnaire are dealt with at the level of the individual school, with the consequence that the relevant information is not directly available to governments. In this connection the Committee draws attention once again to the desirability of consulting teachers' organisations - which in this case might have been able to supply valuable information not available to the government - when preparing their replies. It would have been equally useful in this case to consult organisations of managers of private schools, where these exist. However, notwithstanding the paucity of the information supplied, the Committee has been able to identify certain trends and to make comments on certain practices which it hopes will be of assistance to governments in their future efforts to further the application of the Recommendation. However it is understood that governments take responsibility for the social conditions of private teachers in so far as they are workers in the private sector.

482. Private education, as defined in the legislation of various countries, is distinguished by its non-governmental character, its non-dependence on public funds and its administrative and organisational independence. However, this profile is modified in practice by agreements between the private sector and the authorities, particularly with a view to financial subsidisation. The Committee notes that, broadly speaking, governments to varying degrees exercise control over private establishments.

483. In a good many countries in all continents, teachers in private schools play a relatively important role in the education system. Their contribution to pre-school and secondary education seems to be particularly significant. Several countries emphasised the importance that they attach to the part played by private teachers in the development of their education system.

484. It seems that the majority of private educational establishments observe the same regulations and procedures as those in force in public schools. The establishments in question are for the most part state-subsidised. In a number of countries, private establishments remain financially independent of the state and are consequently not bound by the standards applicable in public education. On the whole, non-subsidised private establishments employ a high proportion of unqualified teachers. The bodies responsible for private establishments may belong to various ideological groups: Catholic, Protestant, Islamic, secular, etc.

485. In many countries, the training of private school teachers takes place in public teacher-training institutions. Qualified teachers are thus free to exercise their profession in either a private or a public establishment. A number of countries possess private teacher-training establishments whose diplomas are officially recognised. However, in certain countries, private schools employ teachers who lack the appropriate qualifications.

486. With regard to in-service training for teachers in private establishments, a few replies mentioned courses organised specifically for this type of teacher. Most of the replies declared that private-school teachers are free to attend in-service training courses for public-school teachers. Certain replies indicated however that participation by private-school teachers is conditional on a financial contribution which is not required of teachers in the public sector.

487. Teachers in private establishments seem to have created relatively few associations. In certain countries where such associations function, they are consulted by the authorities - though not necessarily on educational planning. The authorities are more likely to consult administrators in the private sector. In a number of countries, teachers in the private sector are affiliated, individually or as a group, to public-sector teachers' organisations and consequently participate in consultations between the authorities and teachers.

488. The Committee noted with satisfaction that the information supplied by member States on the status of teachers in private establishments was fuller than in the past. Although this information is not comprehensive enough to form the basis for conclusions on the situation of this category of teachers in the majority of countries, the Committee is satisfied that in most cases the status of teachers in the private sector - particularly with regard to training and recognition by the authorities - tends to be on a par with that of teachers in the public sector. Underlining the fact that the Recommendation applies to all teachers in both public and private establishments, the Committee calls on those countries with a private education sector to ensure that all the provisions of the Recommendation are applied to teachers in the private sector.

489. It also calls on the authorities to see that teachers in the private sector enjoy pre-service and in-service training opportunities comparable with those of teachers in the public sector.

490. Furthermore, conscious of the role that the private sector can play in the dissemination of certain cultural values and the improvement of the quality of education, the Committee considers that private establishments should organise themselves in such a way as to enter into an effective dialogue with the authorities and should improve their teaching within the framework of their respective philosophies so as to make the best use of the freedoms accorded to them under paragraph 10(c) of the Recommendation.

491. In the majority of the countries which supplied information on this subject, policy governing recruitment appears to be determined to a substantial degree by the managements of individual schools (although their powers are in this regard frequently limited either by general labour legislation or by government regulations laying down minimum standards for recruitment, either directly or as a condition for receipt of government support). Even in countries where conditions of employment in private schools are fixed by negotiation between teachers'

organisations and teachers' employers, little, if any account seems to be taken of the views of teachers in the formulation of recruitment policies. The Committee recalls that the provisions of the Recommendation apply to teachers in private as well as public establishments and recommends that governments seek ways and means of promoting negotiations between the parties with a view to the progressive implementation of paragraph 38 of the Recommendation in private establishments.

492. The Committee is unable to reach any conclusion on the application in private establishments of the paragraphs of the Recommendation concerning advancement and promotion. However, it recognises that opportunities for the application of some of these paragraphs are more limited within independent private establishments than within a public education service, with the many opportunities for transfer to another school which the latter offers.

493. Similarly, the information available on the subject of security of tenure is too scanty to permit the Committee to formulate any conclusions on the subject. However, the Committee observes that in several countries teachers in private establishments enjoy less security of tenure than those in the public sector and that the standing of a school within the private sector of education may affect the security of employment of its teachers. The Committee recognises that the problem of ensuring security of employment in private schools has special features on account of the particular factors governing levels of pupil enrolment and of the absence, in many cases, of financial support from the public authorities. The Committee invites governments and the parties concerned to discuss together ways and means of securing fuller implementation of paragraph 45 of the Recommendation in the private sector of education. One possible solution which might be envisaged in this regard in some countries is the promotion of greater mobility between the public and private sectors, subject to equality, or at least comparability, of qualifications and conditions of entry into the profession.

494. The Committee is equally unable to arrive at any conclusions on the subject of disciplinary procedures. Since these appear to be a matter for school managements (and, as a consequence, to be less formalised than in the public sector of education), the Committee draws attention to the desirability of consultation of teachers' organisations when disciplinary machinery is established; of ensuring that all the safeguards provided for under paragraph 50 of the Recommendation exist (and in particular a right of appeal to an independent body); and of providing for peer participation in the process of judgement.

495. On the subjects of teachers with family responsibilities and part-time service, the Committee notes that in a number of countries women teachers appear to be placed on the same footing as men; legislation concerning equality of opportunity between men and women appears to play an important role here. However, the number of countries providing information was not sufficient to allow the Committee to arrive at meaningful conclusions on the application of paragraphs 54-58 of the Recommendation in private schools. For the same reason, it is unable to express any general view on the position of part-time teachers in private establishments; however, it notes that in several countries part-time teachers in private schools enjoy proportionately the same terms and conditions of employment as those working on a full-time basis.

496. The information provided by governments on the application in private schools of Part VIII of the Recommendation, concerning the rights and responsibilities of teachers, was extremely scanty. However, the Committee notes that in several countries this part of the Recommendation is applied in full to private school teachers, or that the latter are on the same footing as public school teachers with regard to its application. The Committee also notes that in a few countries some or all of the conditions of employment of private school teachers are stated to be fixed by collective agreement or by means of negotiations between teachers' organisations and their employers.

497. The information provided on the application in private schools of Part IX of the Recommendation, concerning conditions for effective teaching and learning, was also too meagre to permit the Committee to draw any conclusions on its application. However, it notes that in some countries average class sizes are higher in private than in public schools, while in others the opposite is the case.

498. The Committee notes that teachers' salaries appear, in most of the countries which supplied information on the subject, to be set separately in each school subject to any guidelines or standards laid down in any legislation or collective agreements applicable. It is clear that salary levels vary considerably from one private school to another, sometimes being higher than those for the public service and sometimes - and more frequently - lower, in certain cases to a substantial degree. (Ability to pay is sometimes mentioned as a contributory factor here.) In this connection the Committee emphasises once again the importance of ensuring full application of the salary criteria laid down in paragraph 115 of the Recommendation, and notes with satisfaction in this connection that several governments have taken steps to ensure that the salaries of teachers in private schools are equal or comparable to those paid to teachers in public schools.

499. One country reports that in some private schools teachers receive part or all of their salaries in kind. The Recommendation provides for the granting in certain cases of benefits in kind to promote effective teaching, but contains no provision allowing payment of teachers' salaries in this form; moreover, any such arrangement is difficult to reconcile with the substance of the various provisions in the Recommendation on the subject of teachers' salaries. In the absence of any such provision, the Committee refers to an ILO Convention not referred to in the Recommendation - the Protection of Wages Convention, 1949 (No. 95) - which lays down the principle that wages (defined as "remuneration or earnings ... capable of being expressed in terms of money ...") shall be paid only in legal tender, but that the partial payment of wages in the form of allowances in kind may be authorised, but only in industries or occupations in which that form of payment is customary or desirable because of the nature of the industry or occupation concerned, and then only provided that measures are taken to ensure that such allowances are appropriate for the personal use and benefit of the workers concerned and their families, and that the value attributed to such allowances is fair and reasonable. Payment of the whole of a teacher's salary in kind would appear to be not in conformity with that Convention, which has been ratified by over 80 countries.

500. On the subject of social security, the Committee notes with satisfaction that in a substantial proportion of the reporting countries teachers in private schools enjoy social security coverage. In these countries, where both public and private school teachers are covered by a general scheme, both groups enjoy the same protection; in others, where private school teachers belong to the general scheme, while public school teachers belong to a separate scheme, either for teachers or for public servants generally, the level of coverage tends to be lower for the former than for the latter. It also notes that in a few countries teachers in private schools, unlike those in public schools, are not subject to any form of compulsory social security or insurance, and may even be dependent on the good will of their employers for such social protection as they enjoy. The Committee emphasises once again that the Recommendation makes no distinction whatsoever between teachers in public and private schools with regard to its applicability, and calls on governments to take the necessary steps to bring the situation of private school teachers, as well as that of public school teachers, into line with paragraph 126 of the Recommendation. The Committee considers that, since in a number of the countries concerned teachers in private schools are affiliated to general social insurance or social security schemes, special schemes, whether statutory or non-statutory, will have an essential role to play in this context.

501. The information provided by reporting governments on self-employed teachers was not sufficient to enable the Committee to reach any meaningful conclusions on the subject. Generally speaking, they appear to organise classes for individuals or groups, negotiating fees with parents, sometimes joining together to open schools. In most of the countries which provided information



on the subject, their numbers are small. Bearing in mind the principle laid down in paragraph 6 of the Recommendation, namely that teaching is a form of public service requiring of teachers expert knowledge and specialised skills, as well as a sense of personal and corporate responsibility for the education and welfare of the pupils in their charge, the Committee considers it desirable that governments should examine the possibility of introducing a system of registration, involving proof of qualifications, for persons working full time as teachers on a self-employed basis, where this has not already been done.

502. Generally speaking, the Committee emphasises that teachers in private establishments should not be subjected to conditions of work and employment less favourable than those applicable to teachers in public establishments; they should also comply with similar conditions with regard to qualifications.

#### Application of the Recommendation in the light of changes in educational systems

##### Educational planning and new trends in education

503. The Committee noted that the great majority of countries that replied to the questionnaire reported that provisions existed for meeting their educational needs. In accordance with the Recommendation, a few countries pointed out that educational planning forms an integral part of their over-all social and economic planning. In the majority of cases, there exists a specialised body, usually within the Ministry of Education, responsible for estimating, on the basis of studies and statistics, the quantitative and qualitative needs with regard to the various categories of teachers.

504. Paragraphs 9 and 10(k) of the Recommendation stipulate that teachers' organisations should be involved in the making of educational policy. The Committee notes with satisfaction that the great majority of the countries that replied to the questionnaire confirmed that they were applying this provision. It emerges however from certain replies that the authorities are not always willing to talk with the authorised representatives of organisations and instead consult individual teachers chosen on a personal basis. The Committee takes the view that this practice contradicts the spirit and the letter of the Recommendation.

505. The Committee notes that in a number of countries teachers' organisations participate in the planning process not only at the level of the ministry of national education but also at the provincial or regional level and even at the municipal or school level. The Committee believes that this decentralised approach, to which it made favourable reference in its 1976 report, makes for a more effective contribution by teachers' organisations. The Committee furthermore believes that this contribution can be particularly effective when, as is the case in a number of countries, the representatives of teachers' organisations form part of official bodies set up by the authorities at the highest level to formulate policies regarding the supply and training of teachers.

506. Over half of the replies cite inadequate financial resources as the main factor limiting the implementation of education plans and the recruitment of qualified teachers. The inadequate funds devoted to education are in large measure, but not wholly, at the root of the shortage of teachers, whether because it restricts training facilities or because it keeps down the level of remuneration of serving teachers, causing them to leave the profession for more lucrative careers. In this connection, the Committee wishes to draw attention to paragraph 115(b) of the Recommendation, which stipulates that "teachers' salaries should compare favourably with salaries paid in other occupations requiring similar or equivalent qualifications".

507. Teacher surpluses constitute another problem in the planning of education in certain countries. This is particularly true of the industrialised countries where the fall in the birth rate has led to a reduction in the school population. The Committee will comment on this phenomenon in Chapter 30 of this report, where the question is dealt with more specifically.

508. The Committee noted that a large majority of the replies reported the existence of links between general and technical education. These links seem to be developing on a two-way basis, a sound general education being required of students and teachers in institutions of technical education, while elements of technical education are to varying degrees included in general education curricula. In a number of countries, both industrial and developing, there is a movement towards the integration of these two - traditionally separate - branches of education. The aim, in addition to correcting an excessively "academic" approach in the traditional secondary school, humanising the technical education curricula and according equal importance and value to the two types of education, is also and more importantly to provide students with a better preparation for working life in the modern world, where technology constitutes an integral part of every environment.

#### Adaptation of teacher-preparation programmes

509. Section 15 of the questionnaire suggested, by way of example, (a) a series of topics on which teacher-training programmes could be based to take account of social and cultural changes and (b) a list of possible innovations in teaching methods. These topics included: the links between formal education and extra-curricular activities; education related to the responsibilities of life in society; functional literacy; introduction of an interdisciplinary approach; and introduction of productive work into school. Among the new methods suggested were: encouraging pupils to play a part in the organisation and running of their education; self-education and group-education techniques; introduction of audio-visual aids; making use of the mass media; and microteaching.

510. The Committee found that the majority of the replies from governments recognised a convergence between the innovations introduced into their training programmes and the suggestions contained in the questionnaire.

511. A number of countries expressed reservations concerning some of these suggestions: e.g. encouraging pupils to play a part in the organisation and running of their education; introduction of productive work into schools; and the introduction of group-education techniques. Equally, new topics not included in the questionnaire were mentioned: teaching in vernacular languages; introduction of multicultural curricula; compulsory work experience for teacher trainees; compulsory social service for future teachers; and programmes of trade union education. The new topics were mentioned as taking account of contemporary social changes in the countries concerned (Ecuador, United States, France, Spain).

512. The Committee wishes to recall, in this context, the conclusion formulated in its 1976 report regarding the widespread involvement of teachers in activities concerned with the renewal of curricula and teaching methods - and involvement welcomed by a number of governments. The Committee, while expressing the hope that the school authorities will encourage teachers and their organisations to continue to take initiatives in this field, underlines that these changes of curriculum and innovations in methods should reflect real needs arising from social, cultural and technological evolution of societies. It also points out that teacher-preparation programmes should be subject to regular review and that teacher educators and members of the profession should engage in dialogue frequently to effect changes in curricula reflecting changing needs. Furthermore, the Committee is convinced that the changes prescribed will only have their full effect if school authorities, subject specialists, teacher educators, etc. joint their efforts to provide a learning environment for its teachers in their educational institutions.

Participation of teachers in out-of-school and adult education

513. All the replies reported participation by teachers in out-of-school educational activities for young people and/or adults. In a few countries these activities are compulsory. In the great majority of cases, they are optional and often remunerated.

514. Among the subjects dealt with by teachers in out-of-school education programmes, the most frequently quoted were "literacy work" and "community development". A good many countries also mentioned general and/or technical education and art education.

515. In certain countries, out-of-school education caters mainly for young people of school age by providing them with educational and recreational facilities outside school. But, in general, the bulk of the clientele for out-of-school education conducted by teachers consists of adults who have not attended school.

516. The preparation of teachers for out-of-school education activities takes place either within the normal framework of pre-service teacher preparation or in separate specialised training institutes or bodies under the control of the school authorities or specialised non-governmental organisations. The Committee notes however that this practice is not general. In a number of countries, there is no provision for such preparation.

517. The Committee, having regard to paragraph 20(d) of the Recommendation and in the light of its deliberations on this question at its special session (1979), considers that training in out-of-school educational activities for young people and in adult education should be provided in teacher-training establishments or in establishments of an equivalent educational level.

518. The Committee notes that the replies to the 1981 questionnaire show that in many countries out-of-school education is given a key role in the realisation of national development plans. In other countries, the demand for out-of-school education increases with the general increase in leisure time. It is on these grounds, no doubt, that a large majority of replies take the view that participation by teachers in out-of-school education will continue to grow. The Committee also takes note of the wide variety of conditions to be found among teachers participating in out-of-school activities for young people and adult education as regards their administrative status, the teaching they provide, their training and their remuneration.

519. It noted, moreover, with interest that several replies stress the value of the educational methods applied in out-of-school education, methods which not only produce good results but also enrich the experience of the teacher, thereby making for livelier teaching. In this connection, however, a discordant note is struck by pessimistic forecasts anticipating a reduction in educational budgets and pointing to the low level of participation by teachers in this sector of education. The replies to the questionnaire do not provide an answer to the problem that would seem to be posed by the expansion of the demand for out-of-school education or to the problems implicit in the effective participation of teachers in this sector.

520. Generally speaking, the Committee notes a tendency towards an extension of adult education not only into further education and in-service training but also into other fields, such as introduction to culture and civic, family and social education, and also into the development of awareness in each individual of the changes which take place in him with advancing age and in family, social and occupational environments with a view to encouraging him to make the necessary effort to adjust to those changes.

521. The question was raised of whether, and to what extent, teachers should be required to participate in education of this kind and, if so, that of seeking means of adapting their training for that purpose. In this connection the Committee stresses the importance of continuing to give priority to the role of teachers in schools and their participation in extra-curricular activities for young persons, but without losing sight of the fact that in many countries teachers are the best qualified and sometimes the only persons qualified to take charge of adult education of this kind.

522. For the above reasons, the Committee considers that the implications for teachers of out-of-school education require further elucidation. In so far as they involve teacher-preparation programmes, there is need to pay attention to the introduction of new teaching methods and new programmes of continuing teacher training linking pre-service preparation with in-service training. Moreover, the Committee believes that the staffing of non-formal and out-of-school education raises issues which are pertinent to the implementation of the Recommendation and would welcome additional information that would enable an appraisal to be made of these implications.

Further education for teachers  
as part of lifelong education

523. The Committee found that there was great diversity between the institutions and departments providing in-service education programmes for teachers. These programmes, depending on their principal objectives, may cater for any of four categories of teachers: (i) those who are underqualified; (ii) those who wish to prepare for higher degrees; (iii) those affected by changes in content and methods resulting from educational reforms; (iv) and, finally, those who wish to keep up to date with advances in their disciplines and in teaching methods. Such objectives are in keeping with the provisions of Part VI of the Recommendation. The Committee has already had occasion to stress their importance in its previous reports (1970, paragraph 187).

524. The replies received show an appreciable increase in all countries in the provision made for the academic and professional in-service education of teachers. Teacher-preparation establishments are playing an increasing role in the development and administration of in-service education programmes. In almost all the countries which replied, there exists a body or centre responsible for the organisation of further education courses for teachers. There is increasing participation by universities and research institutes in this field in most countries. This takes three forms: (i) the organisation of extended in-service education courses leading to an academic degree; (ii) participation in further-education activities for teachers in general (e.g. documents on current educational topics and the findings of research on teaching are made available to teachers attending conferences and study seasons); (iii) individual contributions by university teachers and researchers to in-service education programmes. This co-operation by competent institutions is in keeping with paragraph 32 of the Recommendation, and the Committee hopes that it will be developed and will become general practice in all member States.

525. In more than one country, teachers' organisations are themselves directly responsible for the content and administration of in-service education programmes. While some countries consider the influence of teachers in the planning of such programmes to be minimal, the majority of replies report various procedures enabling teachers and their organisations to influence further-education programmes for teachers. The Committee notes with satisfaction that the process of consultation between teachers' organisations and the authorities, provided for in the Recommendation, is working very effectively in a number of countries, the representatives of teachers' organisations forming part of national or regional co-ordinating bodies and consultative committees set up by the authorities to plan and supervise development of further education for teachers.

526. As a general rule, compulsory in-service education programmes are organised by the school authorities for all teachers or for specific categories of teachers. They generally take place during school hours and are free of charge. Apart from these compulsory programmes, optional courses are often organised in the same countries. Quite a few countries stated that all their in-service programmes were optional.

527. Teachers taking part in optional courses are generally supposed to contribute to their travel and living expenses. This applies particularly to teachers following extended courses with the aim of obtaining a higher degree. However, in a number of countries, a financial contribution is made to in-service education programmes by training establishments, the local education authorities or the municipality.

528. Teachers who have obtained a higher degree after following an extended course usually receive promotion and a salary increase. Participation in short courses does not usually lead to the awarding of a special diploma. However, in certain countries, participants in these courses obtain certificates which sometimes count towards promotion.

529. As in previous surveys (1969/70 and 1975/76), the statistical data derived from the present questionnaire on the number and proportion of teachers who have participated in in-service training programmes are very limited and incomplete. In many countries there do not seem to be any official procedures for the regular compilation of such statistics. In view of the growth of further education for teachers and the impact of this growth on the quality of teaching in both the school and out-of-school context, the Committee draws attention, as it did in its 1970 report, to the need to co-ordinate piecemeal efforts in the field in a long-term plan to provide all teachers with access to in-service education courses. The replies show that some countries have in fact begun to implement such a plan (Hungary and Greece). The Committee believes furthermore that it would be desirable for school authorities to draw up a pre-service and in-service teacher-training policy and, with this in mind, to set up a service to compile regular statistics on the number and quality of participants, the type and duration of courses and the bodies responsible for them.

Participation in teaching by  
people other than qualified teachers

530. The Committee found that 20 per cent of the replies received contained no information under this heading. The majority of replies seem to have been based on the suggestions put forward by way of illustration in the questionnaire concerning the categories and functions of the personnel in question. Thus, practically all the "specialists belonging to other recognised professions" suggested in the questionnaire were cited in the replies. However, other specialists were mentioned, including architects, economists, writers, master craftsmen, hotel managers and policemen. As for "persons performing non-teaching duties in schools", the only additions to the examples given in the questionnaire were documentalists and the producers of teaching materials. In the category "auxiliary staff working under the direct supervision of teachers", monitors and housemasters were frequently mentioned, as well as the personnel responsible for the maintenance of technical and laboratory equipment. On the other hand, there were relatively few references to staff performing the function of "assistant teacher" by helping qualified staff in the training of pupils.

531. In quite a few countries, systematic introductory courses concerned with the problems of education are provided for auxiliary staff. In other countries, such staff are given on-the-job basic educational training. In other countries again, auxiliaries are given the opportunity to attend in-service education courses for teachers.

532. A number of countries state that the participation of such staff in educational activities is covered by a regulation but do not specify the nature of this regulation. Certain countries are contemplating the adoption of measures that will define the status of auxiliary staff and the training they are to receive.

533. In view of the increased importance given to auxiliary staff, the Committee considers that member States should envisage regulation of the training and conditions of work of such staff. Such regulation should serve to allay fears of exploitation of underpaid and unqualified teachers as well as of the possible perpetuation of unsatisfactory conditions of work and depressed salaries among qualified teachers.

Conditions for effective teaching  
and learning

534. On the subject of class sizes, at its 1970 Session the Committee had observed (Report, paragraph 340) that the figures prescribed as maxima for the size of classes were relatively high in all parts of the world (which meant that the standard laid down in the Recommendations was not being met) and that average pupil-teacher ratios were generally very high in primary schools in developing countries. It therefore requested UNESCO to examine whether and to what extent developing countries could be assisted, by various means, to increase the productivity of their educational systems.

535. The Committee observes that the figures prescribed as maxima for the size of classes are still high in the great majority of countries replying. However, it notes with satisfaction that in a substantial number of those countries - including a certain number of developing countries - actual average class sizes or pupil-teacher ratios are significantly (and sometimes substantially) lower than the permitted maxima. On the other hand, it notes that, in the majority of the developing countries which provided information, the actual average sizes of classes are extremely high, and that in a few cases the average is close to, or even in excess of, the permitted maximum (the implication being that the latter is frequently exceeded). A number of countries (mostly in the "developed" group) report or anticipate decreases in class sizes: others (mostly in the "developing" group) report or anticipate increases. The information available tends to confirm developments observed by the Committee at its 1976 Session, namely that, while in a number of industrialised countries the teacher shortage has disappeared, in developing countries it is persisting and even becoming more serious. The Committee reiterates its opinion that, in view of the over-all resource situation in the latter countries, a fundamental re-examination of the way of approaching the problem of organising education should take place (with possible recourse to such solutions as the use of ambulant teachers, assistants or even students and voluntary community aid, subject to adequate safeguards for pupils and teachers alike) and suggests that UNESCO may wish to intensify its efforts to determine to what extent, and in what ways, the restructuring of existing educational systems, reform of curricula and the use of new educational technologies may help developing countries to increase the productivity of their educational systems. At the national level, efforts in this direction should be conducted within the framework of an integrated effort progressively to increase the number of teachers and to achieve the long-term objective of achieving reasonable class sizes and/or pupil-teacher ratios, while taking account at the same time of the shortage of qualified teachers and the high demand for education which may exist in the countries concerned.

536. The Committee considers it desirable that the setting of targets for class sizes should be effected on the basis of objective criteria and should involve consultations with the teachers' organisations. On the basis of advances in research since 1966, it draws attention to the need to explore further the problem of criteria for the evaluation of the effectiveness of teaching.

537. The Committee notes that, in the great majority of the countries which provided information on class sizes or pupil-teacher ratios in urban and rural areas, the averages are lower for rural than for urban areas. It is possible that in certain developing countries where this situation exists and classes are generally large the provision of special facilities for teachers, in accordance with paragraphs 111-113 of the Recommendation, may, if effective as means of attracting sufficiently qualified teachers to rural areas in sufficient numbers, lead to a greater shortage of teachers - and hence further increases in class sizes - in urban areas. The Committee emphasises once again that any fully satisfactory solution to any problem of excessive class sizes involves necessity of measures to induce persons with the necessary abilities, training and motivation to enter the teaching profession - and remain in it - in sufficient numbers.

538. The Committee notes that the great majority of the governments which supplied information on the subject state that the introduction of new teaching methods and techniques has had no effect, or no significant effect, on class sizes and pupil-teacher ratios. However, the Committee itself is convinced that technological developments will probably bring about radical changes in teaching methods and in the conditions of teachers and doubts whether the introduction of new teaching techniques will in all cases enable class sizes to be reduced. As regards the hope, expressed by one government, that the use of the new techniques would enable teachers to take larger classes, or even two classes simultaneously, the Committee reiterates its view that the desire for greater productivity in education should not be satisfied to the detriment of the individual attention to be given to pupils in accordance with paragraph 86 of the Recommendation.

539. At its 1970 Session (Report, paragraph 343) the Committee expressed the view that, on the whole, teaching hours seemed to be kept within reasonable limits, but that the indications provided by governments concerning the time spent on duties other than teaching, and hence the teacher's total workload, were insufficient for conclusions to be drawn on the subject.

540. Although the Committee was hampered in forming an opinion on this question by the impossibility of determining, in a number of cases, whether the term "teaching hour" referred to a 60-minute hour or to some shorter period, it considers that teaching hours still seem to be kept within reasonable limits. It also observes that, in most of the 20 countries which provided comparable information on hours of work for both the 1970 and 1982 Sessions, maximum teaching hours have either remained constant or fallen slightly; only in one case do they appear to have been increased. In addition, 12 countries appear to set teaching hours within the context of a standard working week comparable with that of other groups of workers and allowing time for preparation of lessons, marking exercises and other non-teaching duties. However, the information provided was not detailed enough to enable the Committee to reach any definite conclusion on the subject.

541. The Committee notes with satisfaction that in a substantial number of countries replying some or all of the factors mentioned in paragraph 90 of the Recommendation are taken into account in the fixing of hours of work. The Committee is aware of the responsibility incumbent on it to promote the setting of reasonable limits on the mandatory working time of teachers and hopes that the situation in this regard will improve further, bearing in mind, *inter alia*, the general trend towards the reduction of the working time of all employees. In this connection, it suggests that education authorities give consideration to the desirability of setting the maximum normal teaching hours of new entrants to the profession, during an initial induction period, at levels below general norms on account of the additional time these teachers need to prepare and evaluate their lessons. It also recommends careful monitoring of the effect educational innovations may have on teachers' total working hours and workloads.

542. The information received from governments concerning responsibilities other than class teaching - essential for an estimate of the total workload of a teacher - reflected a wide range of different approaches to the subject on the part of governments, not only with regard to the range of tasks coming under the heading of class teaching, but also as regards the dividing line between compulsory and voluntary tasks and even the concept of voluntarism. Similar problems arose with regard to the information provided on extra-curricular activities. The Committee is thus unable to draw any conclusions with regard to total teacher workload. However, it notes with satisfaction that in some countries teaching hours may be reduced or rearranged to ease the additional burdens arising from extra-curricular activities, and that in others normal working hours contain provision for a certain amount of extra-curricular activity, while in certain others compensatory time off may be granted in respect of such activities.

543. It appears that a substantial number of countries have made arrangements to give teachers time off from school for attendance at in-service training courses.

544. Many governments state that teachers' organisations participate - in degrees varying from the making of suggestions or representations to negotiation - in the fixing of standards relating to teachers' hours of work; but a significant proportion of the governments replying do not consult teachers' organisations on the subject.

545. The information provided on the subject of annual holidays with pay once again reveals a relatively favourable situation. However, the Committee points out that annual holidays with pay should be used for rest and recuperation, and that teachers should be free to use them as they think fit. As a consequence of the nature of the profession, a proportion of school holidays (which may be substantial) is devoted to mandatory activities arising from the exercise of the profession or from the educational process (in-service training, preparation for the start of the school year, marking of examination papers, etc. ...). It is important to ensure that these activities do not reduce the indispensable minimum period of rest and recuperation to a level below that enjoyed by other workers in the country concerned. Under the terms of the ILO Holidays with Pay Convention (Revised), 1970, this period is set at three weeks for one year of service.

546. The Committee notes that practically all the reporting countries describe arrangements under which teachers can take study leave; in a number of countries such leave may be taken at intervals, as indicated in paragraph 95 of the Recommendation. In most cases study leave is granted with full or part pay - although the decision on this subject frequently depends on the nature and purpose of the leave. There are, however, several countries in which study leave, or certain types of study leave, is unpaid; this is contrary to paragraph 95 of the Recommendation. In addition, some countries require a teacher on study leave to contribute to the cost of his replacement; the Committee considers that this practice is contrary to the spirit of the Recommendation.

547. The Committee also observes that, contrary to the second subparagraph of paragraph 95, periods of study leave are not counted for purposes of calculating seniority or pension rights in certain countries. It observes, too, that only a few of the responding countries appear to make provision for more frequent study leave periods for teachers in areas which are remote from population centres. Finally, the Committee notes that, in most of the relatively few countries which provide information on the subject, the proportion of teachers taking study leave is small.

548. A substantial number of the reporting countries operate teacher exchange schemes, but the numbers of participants are usually very small. Generally speaking, periods of absence under exchange schemes appear to be counted as periods of service. In the case of service abroad within technical assistance projects, a teacher's acquired rights appear to be safeguarded; and in some cases entitlements continue to accrue during periods of absence for this purpose. In nearly half of the reporting countries, there are teachers attached to technical assistance programmes abroad. The Committee draws attention to the need to respect the trade union rights of teachers participating in teacher exchange schemes or in technical assistance projects.

549. A number of countries allow teachers who are union officials a certain amount of time off with pay for the performance of the work of their organisations, either of a general character within a school or for a specific purpose such as participation in negotiations. Full-time release is sometimes granted to principal officers, either with or without pay. A few countries allow individual teachers a certain amount of time off without loss of pay for attendance at organisation meetings. However, the Committee observes that in certain countries - contrary to the provisions of paragraph 99 of the Recommendation - no arrangements exist for leave to enable teachers to participate in the activities of their organisations.

550. As regards sick leave, the Committee observed at its 1970 Session (Report, paragraph 344) that the situation of teachers at that time appeared relatively favourable. This appears to be still the case. The Committee notes that in a few countries, the sick leave entitlements of teachers with established status exceeds substantially that of teachers with non-established status.

551. On the subject of the construction of school buildings, the Committee noted at its 1970 Session (Report, paragraph 342) that in a large number of countries the authorities sought the advice of teachers on the subject, as the Recommendation provides. This is still the case; on the other hand, the Committee observes that in a substantial number of countries there is no provision for the consultation of teachers in any way on the subject. The Committee recalls, in this connection, the dual obligation of consultation provided for in paragraph 110 of the Recommendation.

552. The Committee observes that practically all the reporting countries grant special facilities or financial incentives, or both, to teachers called upon to serve in rural or remote areas (where these exist). It had observed a similar situation at its 1970 Session (Report, paragraph 341). It considers it important, in the interest of equality of educational opportunity as well as in ensuring equality of conditions for teachers, that those who are employed in rural or isolated areas should not suffer disadvantages greater than those of their colleagues elsewhere. It is also important that some form of compensation be provided in respect of such disadvantages as arise from geographical isolation and are unavoidable, so that good teachers may be attracted to work and remain in such areas, and that the provisions of paragraphs 111, 112 and 113 of the Recommendation should be complied with. The Committee also points out that teachers in urban areas are not always advantaged, especially as regards housing (and, in deprived areas in large cities, as regards teaching conditions as well), and considers this question should be taken into consideration in the event of a revision of the Recommendation.

#### Women teachers and teachers with family responsibilities

553. With regard to the application of the general principle of equality of opportunity and treatment for women with men teachers enunciated in paragraph 7 of the Recommendation, the Committee observes with satisfaction that all the reporting countries which replied on the subject state that such equality exists in law. However, it also observes that, notwithstanding this equality in law, women are still in a minority in posts of responsibility, even where half, or nearly half, of all teachers are women. The Committee urges the governments of countries in which this situation exists to investigate its causes and to take any necessary steps to ensure that the principle of equality of opportunity is fully applied in practice.



In this connection the Committee calls attention to the provisions of the ILO Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention and Recommendation, 1958, and the Workers with Family Responsibilities Convention and Recommendation, 1981.

554. On the specific subjects which the questionnaire sought to explore, the Committee observes, first of all, that in the countries which provided information on the subject of the participation of women in in-service training, the proportion of women participants was encouragingly high; but the number of countries which provided information on the subject was too small to enable the Committee to reach any definite conclusions regarding general trends. The Committee also notes with satisfaction that all the reporting countries state that as regards recruitment, advancement, promotion, security of employment and remuneration, the rules applicable are the same for women as for men. However, the Committee notes that there are some areas of possible discrimination (with regard, for example, to housing benefits) which should be investigated more closely.

555. The Committee notes that there are part-time teachers in a number of the countries which supplied information on the subject and that, in the countries for which statistics are available, the great majority of part-time teachers are women.

556. In the majority of reporting countries, marriage and pregnancy have no adverse effect on employment and conditions of work. However, the Committee notes with some concern the possibility, mentioned by one country, that a woman teacher on a fixed-term contract who becomes pregnant may have difficulty in obtaining a renewal of her contract. Such a practice is not in accordance with the spirit of the Recommendation. At the same time, the Committee notes with satisfaction that several countries endeavour to place women teachers with family responsibilities in teaching posts in the locality of their homes or to enable married couples both of whom are teachers to teach in the same general neighbourhood, in accordance with paragraph 57 of the Recommendation.

557. On the subject of maternity leave, the Committee notes with satisfaction that all the countries which gave specific information on the subject stated that provision existed for maternity leave for women teachers. However, it observes that, in several cases, the duration of maternity leave as reported is less than the minimum set in the Maternity Protection Convention (Revised), 1952 (No. 103), i.e. at least 12 weeks, including not less than six weeks after the date of confinement. Where such is the case, paragraph 102 of the Recommendation is not complied with.

558. The Committee also notes that a number of the reporting countries allow the mother (and, in one or two cases, either parent) to take additional unpaid leave after childbirth without loss of employment, and that in addition several countries allow women teachers a certain number of days of paid leave every year to look after a sick child. Little information was provided on other facilities for teachers with family responsibilities; but some countries stated that a woman teacher who resigned from the profession to care for children was encouraged to return to it once family circumstances permitted.

#### Shortages and surpluses of teachers

559. The problem of shortages of teachers is linked with the problem of unqualified teachers employed in schools. In a considerable number of countries, mostly developing countries, a high proportion (between 22 per cent and 70 per cent) of teachers do not have the necessary qualifications. A quarter of the countries which suffer from shortages have indicated that a general shortage exists at all levels of education. For the rest, the shortages are restricted to one educational level, subject or geographical or social group.

560. In approximately 40 per cent of the replies, surpluses of teachers were reported. In half of these cases, these surpluses occur to a greater or lesser extent throughout the system. In the other half, they vary according to educational level, subjects taught or geographical or social group.

561. Some countries experience simultaneously shortages of teachers in one or several specific subjects or in certain regions and surpluses in other subjects or regions. A failure to match supply and demand with regard to specialists in science subjects was reported by several countries. Likewise, it is by no means uncommon to find shortages of teachers in the countryside and a surplus in the towns and cities.

562. The following reasons for shortages are amongst those cited in the replies from the governments: rapid expansion of the education system and inadequate resources devoted to education; lack and inadequacy of training establishments; deterioration in the status of teachers; lack of mobility of teachers from one region to another. The main causes of surpluses mentioned in the replies are: decline in the birth rate; inaccurate planning; lack of co-ordination between training establishments and education authorities.

563. Only the industrialised countries supplied forecasts of how they thought the situation would develop with regard to shortages. Several countries hope, in the light of experience, that new training programmes, accompanied by material incentives, will attract candidates to those subjects where shortages exist. Many industrialised countries, whose main problem is a surplus of teachers, expect the surpluses to continue beyond the 1990s.

#### Measures taken in cases of shortages

564. In a considerable number of countries suffering from shortages of teachers there has been no increase in class size or in the teaching hours of teachers.

565. A few countries have organised "accelerated training courses" for the urgent training of teachers. Most countries prefer a system of training in which the syllabus follows the full training programme. Accelerated training is generally provided through evening classes and correspondence courses and extends over several years.

566. A small number of countries employ foreign teachers, while numerous countries encourage people who have left teaching to take it up again.

567. The employment of unqualified personnel is not restricted to those countries suffering serious shortages. In several industrialised countries, teachers without the necessary qualifications occupy positions where fully qualified teachers are not available. It often occurs that teachers qualified in one subject are teaching another subject.

568. Few countries acknowledge that improvement of the economic and social status of teachers is an important factor in overcoming shortages. In one country at least such improvement has not had the result of reducing shortages; in another, an improvement in teachers' salaries has attracted too many candidates and has resulted in a surplus of teachers.

569. The following measures have been taken with a view to overcoming shortages of teachers: graduates from non-teacher-training faculties are allowed to teach in secondary schools; secondary-school pupils are allowed to teach in primary schools; financial incentives are provided for students who choose subjects where there are shortages; a system of accelerated promotion is offered to teachers who are tempted by other careers. In order to attract teachers to the regions suffering from shortages, special advantages and facilities are offered, e.g. financial incentives; travel allowances; free housing; and the possibility of taking study leave.

570. The Committee notes the scale of the problem concerning shortages of teachers, which may affect either the whole of an education system or specific areas, such as certain educational levels, individual subjects or particular geographical areas.\*

571. The Committee would like to point out that this problem has existed for a long time. Its existence had already been revealed, between 1962 and 1966, by surveys carried out by the International Bureau of Education. The seriousness of this situation was recognised in the Recommendation adopted in 1966, which devoted a

---

\* It stresses at the same time the dual character of the shortage at once dismal and favourable. For although it poses a problem which needs to be solved, it also reflects a favourable phenomenon: that of a movement of the young towards education resulting in an increased schooling at the primary as well as the secondary levels. This is true for developing countries where education at the primary level is far from being universal as for industrialised countries where the main efforts tend toward increasing the availability of secondary school education.

whole section to it. In addition, in its preamble, it explicitly states that one of the objectives in view is to overcome the shortage of teachers. However, as the present report reveals, the problem still exists in many countries, although, as the report also makes clear, it has virtually disappeared in the industrialised countries, where it has often been replaced by the problem of a surplus of teachers.

572. The problem of shortages of teachers arises mainly, though not exclusively, in those countries where schooling is not universal. It is inherent in the conditions which exist in the developing countries and arises from several factors related to the expansion of education, which is a matter of necessity for these countries in order to face up to both the growth in the population and the demand for universal education which has not been met by existing partial educational facilities. Such expansion requires even growth throughout the educational system: in school buildings, equipment, teaching material and staff. Among these different factors, the teachers form a particularly important category, to which the Committee feels urgent attention should be given.

573. The present survey, in presenting a detailed picture of this situation, underlines not only the harmful effects which such a situation has on the expansion and the quality of education but also the persistent nature of the problem. The Committee notes the various measures taken with a view to overcoming shortages. Those measures which are least burdensome financially undoubtedly include increasing class sizes and teachers' workload. Although the replies seem to indicate that such measures are not matters of policy, in practice they exist in at least 11 of the countries which have replied. Consequently, the Committee considers that the school authorities should, in such exceptional circumstances, attempt to provide over-large classes with all possible material and professional aid in the form of appropriate facilities and teaching materials, in order to maintain educational levels and standards, until such time as conditions can be improved.

574. Training institutions at the national level, research institutes and universities should pool their efforts and develop methods of work and of communication which would enable teachers with heavy workloads to carry out their duties more effectively.

#### Measures taken in cases of surpluses

575. In the vast majority of countries with a surplus of teachers, standard class sizes and teacher workload have been reduced.

576. Most of the countries which replied possess a planning body which ensures that teacher-training intakes are geared to real staff needs. In other countries with surpluses, the limitation of training intakes depends not on government directives but on the candidates themselves, since the authorities provide them with full information on the prospects for employment in teaching.

577. In some countries, teachers employed in one area who become redundant are directed to employment in other areas where shortages exist. In other countries, the authorities do not intervene in this way. In several countries, the teachers' organisations negotiate with the authorities as to where teachers who have become redundant will be placed. In one country, such teachers who are qualified replace their colleagues who are not properly qualified, the latter being given study leave. In other countries, they are used to improve the supervision of pupils and, in general terms, to raise the standard of teaching.

578. In some countries, teachers who have not found employment in their profession retain their contracts and their vested rights. They are obliged to accept temporary duties but rarely to change their place of work. In several countries, the authorities and the teachers' associations help redundant teachers to find employment outside teaching. The reduction of class sizes and of teaching hours and the abolition of overtime make it possible to employ a larger number of teachers. An extremely useful measure, used by several countries, is to involve redundant teachers in the introduction of new ideas and of qualitative changes in school organisation and in syllabus revision.

Consultation of teachers' organisations

579. More than a third of the replies received stated that the teachers' organisations were not consulted on the problems concerning teacher supply and demand. Of the positive replies, most reported that consultations were held as part of the regular contacts between the organisations and the Ministry of Education. In several countries, the organisations are represented on the official bodies responsible for balancing the teacher supply and demand.

✖

✖                      ✖

580. From the replies to the questionnaire the Committee observes that a relatively small number of countries have managed to balance teacher supply with demand. Most countries have reported either a shortage or a surplus, or even both at the same time.

It notes that various measures have been taken to overcome this shortage, particularly the employment of graduates from non-teacher-education faculties and of secondary-school pupils.

It is of the opinion that the seriousness of the problem of the shortage of teachers in developing countries should not be underestimated. One of the long-term effects of this problem would undoubtedly be to reduce the capacity of these countries to fight against illiteracy.

It considers that energetic measures should be taken at all levels to ensure that the spread of universal education is not curbed.

581. Greater coherence should be sought between pre-service and in-service training both in their theoretical and practical methods. Those governments facing severe and intractable teacher shortages which call for special short-term measures should establish training methods which, while respecting the norms laid down in the recommendation regarding the content of the training, would make use of methods and procedures borrowed from in-service training programmes already in use, for example, correspondence courses, the use of the mass media, summer schools and seminars and supervision and assessment by instructors at the place of work.

The international teachers' organisations should lend their support to this task.

582. The Committee is pleased to note that some countries with a surplus of teachers use the extra staff to improve the standard of teaching: (a) by reducing class sizes and the workload of teachers; and (b) by using the surplus teachers to introduce new ideas and qualitative changes in school organisation and syllabus improvement.

Means of improving the effectiveness of the  
Recommendation and of the work of the Committee

583. The Committee points out that it can carry out its mandate effectively only to the extent to which States provide reports covering the period under examination and to which those reports provide information as exact as possible on law and practice with regard to the different provisions of the Recommendation under examination at each session. The Committee wishes to express its keen appreciation of the efforts made by a number of governments to supply the information requested in the questionnaire. However, only 65 States out of the 153 to which the questionnaire was sent replied to it, as against 72 out of 144 in 1975 and 77 out of 126 in 1969. Moreover, the replies received did not always come from the same States; only 35 have replied to all three questionnaires. In addition, the replies received from some governments were incomplete or unclear in certain respects. Lastly, relatively few replies were accompanied by comments from teachers' organisations in the countries concerned, which in the view of the Committee are an essential element in the evaluation of the situation in individual countries.

584. The Committee is concerned, not only over the low level of responses, but also over the declining trend in their number. It is also concerned about the effectiveness of its supervisory work and the impact of that work in member States. It has endeavoured to seek the reasons for the present situation. The Committee is aware of individual cases in which the Recommendation has been used as a basis for reforms in national education systems. However, it considers that there is evidence of a widespread lack of knowledge of and interest in the Recommendation (as well as the Committee's work to promote its application) among both governments of member States and organisations of teachers.

#### Measures concerning working methods

585. To some extent the lack of knowledge and interest referred to above may be due to the language of the Recommendation itself, the text of which may appear (especially in some developing countries) to be of little relevance to the problems facing the governments and organisations concerned. In this connection the Committee desires that ILO and UNESCO conduct a survey covering a representative sample of member States - including in particular States which have attained independence since the adoption of the Recommendation in 1966 and States whose governments reply either not at all, or only irregularly or partially, to questionnaires. The purpose of that survey would be to obtain the views of the governments and teachers' organisations concerned on the usefulness of the Recommendation. The two organisations should also make more direct approaches to governments with a view to obtaining replies to future questionnaires. In addition, however, there are in the view of the Committee a number of measures which it, together with ILO and UNESCO, could take to develop knowledge of the Recommendation and of its own work and to enhance their impact at the national level.

586. The Committee considers that ILO and UNESCO should make greater efforts to propagate knowledge and understanding of the Recommendation and of the Committee's work. The steps they might take to this end include:

- (a) the preparation and dissemination of documentary material, written in clear and simple language, explaining the Recommendation, its antecedents and its applicability to concrete problems of teachers, and also the work and conclusions of the Committee. The preparation of a brochure along these lines for the use of teachers' organisations, both national and international, would be of special value. In addition, arrangements might be made for the publication of articles on the Recommendation in teachers' journals, possibly in local languages;
- (b) the organisation of seminars and other meetings at the national or regional level to propagate knowledge of the Recommendation and of the Committee's work, particularly among teachers' organisations. The ILO's offices in the field and UNESCO's national commissions should play an active part in this work where appropriate in close co-operation with one another.

587. In addition, the Committee itself could do much to increase the impact of its work. It has envisaged the possibility of adopting a new style of reporting which would be more analytical and critical and would provide more background information. In the past, it has tended to formulate the questionnaires, reports and conclusions it has prepared, in excessively vague terms. The documents it prepares in future should be shorter, clearer and more straightforward. In particular, it should formulate its findings in firm and unambiguous terms to facilitate their use by teachers' organisations. The Committee also draws the attention of the incoming Committee to the desirability of continuing contact and co-operation between the members of the Committee and the secretariats of the two organisations.

588. Lastly, the Committee considers that the value of its work would be greatly enhanced by direct consultation with international teachers' organisations and proposes that they be associated with its work.

589. The Committee is aware that the implementation of some of these measures might give rise to additional expenditure for ILO and UNESCO. However, it is convinced that, if the two organisations share its desire to give greater effectiveness to the Recommendation, they will agree to make the necessary efforts to that end.

590. The preparation of the questionnaire gave rise to a discussion in which the Committee sought to identify the means by which it could increase the effectiveness of its work relating to the consultation of member States on the application of the Recommendation. It considered that preliminary work would have to be done,

consisting of an analysis of the replies to the previous questionnaires with a view to ascertaining the frequency of the replies to each question and thereby carrying out an exercise validating that questionnaire. A first conclusion regarding the relative importance attached to the questions by member States might then be drawn. To ensure closer co-operation between the members of the Committee and the secretariats of the two organisations in the framing of questionnaires, the secretariats will invite the members of the Committee to make suggestions to them concerning the structure and content of the questionnaire to be prepared. They will then prepare a draft, based on the suggestions received and their own ideas on the subject, and will send them to all the members of the Committee for the purposes of a preliminary examination to be made by a small group of committee members immediately prior to the full session of the Committee. The questionnaire will be adopted during the full session of the Committee, without prejudice to any other measures of a nature to secure closer co-operation between the Committee and the secretariats.

591. There was, besides, the question of identifying the key provisions of the Recommendation, the examination of which, repeated in the course of several surveys, might serve as an indicator for evaluation of the progress made in the application of the Recommendation. The Committee recognised that the comprehensive nature of the Recommendation could be a guarantee of the satisfactory functioning of the educational system. It considered, however, that the central theme of the Recommendation concerned teachers' rights and duties. That theme was the focal point round which were ranged other aspects, such as the aims of education, educational policies, planning, teachers' education, working conditions, etc., dealt with in the text of the Recommendation.

592. The Committee proposed that the questions used in future reporting cycles should be simpler, more specific and more selective and should be designed in such a way as to elicit the information necessary for a critical analysis of national situations. Account should be taken, in framing the questions, of differences between the situations in different groups of countries, and particularly between developed and developing countries. The questionnaires themselves should be shorter than in the past and concentrate on a small number of specific fields, relating either to important issues which need to be monitored on a continuing basis or to issues which are of particular importance in the current context, to be chosen by the Committee in the light of circumstances.

593. Finally, the Committee thought that a preliminary test of the questionnaire might be necessary to make sure that the wording used was of such a nature as to obtain the desired information from member States, without any possibility of misunderstanding.

594. The Committee also examined with interest, for the purposes of its own work, a proposal to carry out a country-by-country evaluation of the application of the Recommendation, in order to draw up, on the basis of information previously obtained from replies to earlier questionnaires, country profiles reflecting the status of teaching personnel in each country. That might be done for a number of selected countries.

595. Also for the purposes of its own work, the Committee considers that UNESCO might, in that matter, seek the assistance of the International Bureau of Education, which published in its biennial directory, on the basis of particulars supplied to it, a profile of each country participating in the International Conference on Education. The suggestion was to add to those profiles a supplementary item on the status of teaching personnel. A request to that effect would have to be made to the governing body of the IBE.

596. The reports of the Committee should be less descriptive and more analytical and, where necessary, critical and should reflect with complete frankness the views of the Committee. As in the past, detailed critical analyses of situations in individual countries should be avoided; but where successive reports reveal that a country has made

progress in the implementation of the Recommendation, reports should draw attention to the fact. However, the ability of the Committee to achieve these objectives will depend to a considerable degree on the effectiveness of its work, on the design of the questionnaire and on the efforts made to secure more replies from governments. It should be borne in mind in the drafting of reports that one of their principal users will or should be teachers' organisations.

597. In addition to the measures proposed in paragraph 584 it would be advisable to prepare, on the basis of the Recommendation and the reports of the Committee, material to sensitise opinion, and pedagogical material illustrated by charts and graphs, for use in training programmes and by teachers' organisations and Ministries of Education. The Joint Committee expressed the hope that international teachers' organisations could take part in the preparation of this material and in other activities with a view to making teachers and educational institutions more fully aware of the Recommendation and its application.

#### Handling of allegations

598. The ILO and UNESCO Secretariats had provided the Committee with detailed information on the handling of allegations received from teachers' organisations concerning violations of freedom of association and human rights, and also on the machinery and procedures for the supervision of the application of the Conventions and Recommendations in each organisation. That information was intended to enable the Committee to form a clearer idea of the action taken on allegations concerning the application of the Recommendation reaching the organisations outside the reporting cycles and to see to what extent it could play a special role in filling possible gaps.

599. As far as the ILO was concerned, there might be gaps where the allegations concerning the Recommendation referred to questions not covered by ratified Conventions or not concerned with basic principles regarding freedom of association, or when the Recommendation concerning the status of teachers went beyond the standards adopted by the ILO.

600. As far as UNESCO was concerned, most of the allegations relating to the application of the Recommendation also involved violations of human rights. Consequently, those cases concerned the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations, which was the competent UNESCO body in that field.

601. A Note submitted to the Committee by UNESCO referred to the methods of handling complaints reaching UNESCO. It described the origin of the Executive Board's Committee on Conventions and Recommendations and analysed the terms of reference assigned to the Committee by the Board. The Committee's mandate was twofold:

- (1) to examine member States' periodic reports on the implementation of Conventions and Recommendations when required to do so by the Executive Board;
- (2) to examine communications relating to cases and questions concerning the exercise of human rights in UNESCO's fields of competence.

The Note went on to give a brief analysis of the procedure followed by the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations in its examination of communications received by it, which it specified were of a confidential nature where problems of human rights were involved.

602. The Committee agreed on the need to raise the problem of the handling of allegations concerning the Recommendation not coming under the existing supervisory machinery in the broader context of the improvement of the effectiveness of its role. With respect to the handling of those allegations, the Committee took up a proposal that had been made in 1979, to the effect that it should confer a kind of delegation of power on three of its members (i.e. its Chairman, Vice-Chairman and Reporter), who would deal with allegations received by the ILO or UNESCO which could not be promptly examined owing to the length of time before its next session. The three members concerned would consult each other by correspondence. Only in exceptional and quite hypothetical cases, when they could not agree on a basic question of principle, would the Committee as a whole be required to decide the matter, either at a special session, or at its next ordinary session.

603. The ILO Secretariat recalled that the Committee was already competent to handle allegations received in connection with the examination of reports. It could fulfil that role with maximum effectiveness by systematically transmitting the allegations to governments for comment, in order to bring the matters to their attention between its ordinary sessions. That competence followed logically from its terms of reference, which were to guide and promote the application of the Recommendation through the examination of the reports of governments, and the decision taken by the executive organs of the two organisations, at the time that the present supervisory machinery was set up, to request governments to transmit to the occupational organisations concerned copies of the reports submitted on the action taken by them on the Recommendation.

604. The formula proposed in paragraph 602 would require an express decision by the executive organs of the two organisations. That could create difficulties: in view of the fact that States are under no obligation to apply any given provision of the Recommendation, one might well ask what the concrete outcome would be of detailed ad hoc examination of the allegations. Current ILO procedures for the examination of allegations submitted by trade union organisations are designed to provide confirmation of violations of obligations assumed by States and proposals for measures to remedy such violations. They were not applicable to a Recommendation.

605. It was explained that the proposal summarised in paragraph 602 is in no way intended to substitute the Committee for the supervisory bodies existing in each organisation, but rather to ensure that no allegations went unexamined, particularly since, if the Recommendation became better known, their number would be likely to increase.

606. Nor is the Committee asking that its terms of reference should be modified as though the Recommendation were a ratified convention. It had already examined allegations received from teachers' organisations in the past when examining government reports, as the logical corollary of asking teachers' organisations to communicate all pertinent comments for the purposes of clarification. As the examination of allegations was confined to a statement of conformity, the only innovation in relation to current practice would be that the Committee would be able to handle, outside the normal reporting cycle, allegations received by the ILO and UNESCO when they did not come under other supervisory machinery. At present, allegations received after an ordinary session of the Committee have to wait for examination until the next session.

607. After having discussed the various possibilities suggested, the Committee expressed the wish that the attention of the executive organs of the two organisations should be drawn to the proposal formulated in paragraph 602, with the explanations given in paragraphs 605-606. The Governing Body of the ILO had had that question before it at its November 1982 session, but had postponed consideration of it until its February-March 1983 session. The document which would be submitted at that session would clarify the position of the Committee in the light of the discussions at its fourth session. The Executive Board of UNESCO, for its part, had not yet had occasion to state its position.

608. Another suggestion, put forward in case the proposal made in paragraph 602 was rejected, consisted of a request that the two organisations should prepare a document containing alternative proposals to meet the concern of the Committee regarding the handling of allegations not coming under the existing machinery. Those proposals might be submitted to the Committee at a special session in one or two years' time.



609. With regard to allegations coming under the existing supervisory machinery in the two organisations, the Committee should always be informed of any action taken so as to be able to take it into account in its comments, as it had requested should be done in 1979. The UNESCO Note mentioned above had stressed the confidential nature of the decisions of the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations. That confidential nature excluded any possibility of informing the Committee of allegations of violations of human rights containing a reference to the Recommendation. There were, however, two cases in which the information could be communicated to the Committee, as it desired: namely, if a communication made no reference to the exercise of human rights within UNESCO fields of competence, but only to the Recommendation, or if it was expressly addressed to the Committee or its Chairman.

610. The Committee hoped that the UNESCO Secretariat would ask the Executive Board to waive, for the exclusive use of its members, the confidentiality of the decisions of the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations, in the particular cases where the allegations involved human rights concerning the Recommendation.

### Revision

611. The Committee discussed the possibility of revision of the Recommendation in the light of the important developments which had taken place since 1966. In addition to the points which appeared to require review to which the Committee had drawn attention at its 1979 session, a number of additional fields in which the relevant paragraphs of the Recommendation appeared to require review were mentioned; these included the consequences of changes in the educational field (e.g. the impact of new technologies) on the condition of teachers; the effect of the growing participation in adult education on their condition and training; and problems relating to policies designed to prepare teachers to work in their own communities or areas. Changes in the traditional concept of teacher education and moves to shift emphasis from initial to in-service training were mentioned. Mention was also made of the declining role of the family in the education of children in some countries and the impact of this trend on the condition of teachers. Attention was also drawn to the fact that the significance of a number of terms used in the Recommendation had changed considerably since 1966, notably in the growing fields of adult education and non-formal education.

612. Particular mention was made of the most recent regional conferences of Ministers of Education, especially those of Latin America and the Caribbean (Mexico, 1980) and Africa (Harare, 1982) and of the priority importance given by the countries of these regions to universal primary education and the elimination of illiteracy.

613. The efforts which these countries proposed to make or those which they have already made for this purpose could result in a substantial increase in the number of teachers and to increased participation of these personnel in out-of-school activities and recourse to all human resources existing in national communities capable of taking part in the process of formal education. Concerning the latter, mention has been made of the consequences of the introduction of productive work in general education at both the primary and the secondary levels.

614. These considerations show that the shortage of teachers already referred to by the Committee in its report in 1979 is not likely to be reduced soon; emergency measures for the recruitment and the accelerated training of teachers and more systematic teacher education integrating pre-service and in-service training will probably be necessary as well as a search for new strategies of teacher education.

615. One of the ways in which revision of the Recommendation appeared necessary was by reaffirming the central importance of the rights and responsibilities of teachers. It was considered desirable to refocus the content of the Recommendation, relating it more closely to the requirements which had to be met if teachers were to be enabled to enjoy their rights and discharge their responsibilities in the best conditions possible, bearing in mind the peculiar conditions obtaining in each country and, in particular, the level of economic and social development reached. Revision would make it clear that any improvement in the material, professional and moral status of teachers depended not only on policies relating to conditions of work and employment but also on policies relating to education and the training of educational personnel as well as the requirements of the exercise of the teaching profession.

616. The Committee considered that if a revision or updating of the Recommendation were to be undertaken, all necessary precautions should be taken to ensure that none of the standards it set was lowered in any way; moves to weaken their force would be vigorously opposed by the teachers' organisations. Rather, account should be taken of progress made since 1966, in the various countries, and, where desirable, standards might be raised.

617. Lastly, it was suggested that the setting of target dates might be useful for the achievement of specific goals set in the Recommendation.

618. It was also suggested that the impact of the Recommendation could be strengthened by the adoption of a short Convention covering the fundamental principles which should govern the status of teachers. That instrument might be either a joint ILO/UNESCO instrument or an ILO instrument in the preparation of which UNESCO would be associated. Attention was drawn to the different main types of international labour Conventions - those relating to legal rights to be enforced as from the date of ratification; those imposing obligations which could be assumed in stages or on a partial basis: and those which defined programmes of action to be implemented with a view to achieving a desirable goal. It was recognised that caution would be necessary in the selection of the points to be covered by such a convention, and to ensure that it did not result in a weakening of any part of the Recommendation; but there was general support for a study of the possibility of preparing a Convention provided that such a step would enhance the impact of the Recommendation and promote and speed up the process of implementation of its fundamental principles.

619. The Committee therefore recommends that ILO and UNESCO examine the possibility of adopting a Convention to supplement the Recommendation and embodying its fundamental principles in regard to the status of teachers. If an affirmative decision were taken, the Committee would be happy to assist in the preparatory work.

620. If the idea of having a Convention covering all or part of the contents of the Recommendation were to be accepted, that Convention should stress the ideas expressed in paragraph 615.

621. Whatever decisions are taken on the foregoing suggestions, arrangements will have to be made for a special session of the Committee of Experts in 1984 or 1985 to prepare the text of the questionnaire to be sent to governments as a basis for the periodical reports they are called on to submit on the application of the Recommendation. If a revision of the Recommendation, or the preparation of a draft Convention, is contemplated, the matter should also be considered at that session.

622. The terms of office of the members of the Committee expire on 31 December 1982. In the event that the governing bodies of ILO and UNESCO act on the suggestion concerning assignment to the Committee of a role in the examination of allegations concerning the application or the interpretation of the Recommendation, in accordance with the procedure proposed in paragraph 602, the terms of office of the Chairman, the Vice-Chairman and the Reporter should be extended until the newly-constituted committee first meets.

---